

“Here’s Looking at You, WCTU:” The Decline of Temperance Advocacy in the United States

**Rachel Anne Butrum
San Diego, California**

Bachelor of Arts in Anthropology (Concentration in Archaeology) & Bachelor of Arts in the Study of Religion, University of California, San Diego, 2010

**A Thesis presented to the Graduate Faculty
of the University of Virginia in Candidacy for the Degree of Master of Arts**

Department of Religious Studies

**University of Virginia
May 2014**

Introduction

The Temperance Movement in the United States of America

In the nineteenth century, temperance, originally understood as the personal refusal to drink spirits, became associated with the social and political movement that worked for legal Prohibition. Although consumption of alcoholic beverages was a central aspect of life since the establishment of colonial settlements in North America, alcohol was not identified as a social problem until the early nineteenth century.¹ Alcoholic beverages transitioned in the 1800s from a dietary staple and cheap, readily available alternative to water, into a something that some worried American citizens perceived as the cause of public and private violence. Early temperance societies focused on the harm of hard liquor and many continued to serve beer or wine at their meetings. By the mid-nineteenth century, however, the temperance movement as it is understood today took shape. The movement borrowed emotionalism and demand for personal responsibility from religious revivalism and became a mass movement in the United States.² Large groups of American citizens believed strongly that drinking alcoholic beverages destroyed family units and even threatened democracy itself. A proliferation of temperance organizations, aimed at curbing the consumption and sale of all alcoholic beverages in the United States, arose across the country. It is in this context of social change, political negotiation, and individual commitment to temperance that the Woman's Christian Temperance Union and the International Organization of Good Templars took shape.

Introduction to the WCTU and World WCTU

¹ Thomas R. Pegram, *Battling Demon Rum: The Struggle for a Dry America, 1800-1933*

² David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism: John Bull, Johnny Reb, and the Good Templars* (Lexington, KY: University Press of Kentucky, 1996), 6-7.

The Woman's Christian Temperance Union has existed for over 140 years. In that time the organization has highly influenced temperance reform on local and national levels in the United States and beyond. Although the WCTU was not the first large-scale temperance organization in the United States, it was the first to bring together many women who had previously worked independently at the same time that it focused the energies of a number of temperance groups. The WCTU's uniqueness lays in its female focus. It was and continues to be a woman-led and woman-oriented organization in which men can only become honorary members and remain without a vote in the Union.

Historians often characterize temperance reform as the first mass-mobilized, single-issue campaign in the United States, but this thesis shows that the WCTU has never been a single-issue organization. Instead, throughout its history, the WCTU has concerned itself with a variety of interrelated social issues that generate social ills. Temperance reform and Prohibition may have mobilized and created individual single-issue voters, but in the period leading up to the Prohibition campaign the WCTU did not see itself addressing a sole vice.

Since the repeal of the Eighteenth Amendment, however, Union membership numbers dropped precipitously within the United States and it faded from public consciousness. Despite the WCTU's decline, the World WCTU remains active and continues to grow in membership in several countries. A majority of the current members, along with a great deal of scholarship concerning the organization, blame changing social mores in the United States and the repeal of Prohibition for the continuing decline in numbers over the past five decades. The decrease, like the social ills battled by the Union, is not due to a single cause, but a group of interlocking problems which the WCTU has yet to address.

Introduction to the IOGT and IOGT International

The Independent Organization of Good Templars, contemporary with the WCTU but a few years older, was formed in 1852. Much like the Union, the Good Templars grew out of the temperance movement of the early-nineteenth century. Also similar to the WCTU, the IOGT formed an International branch shortly after its early success in the United States and its international branch has now also become more successful in terms of membership and influence than its modern American counterpart.

From its inception, the IOGT differed in two chief ways from the WCTU. First, it welcomed male and female members, in theory creating an organization that welcomes both sexes equally in the fight for temperance. Second, although initially belief in God was a necessary prerequisite for membership, the IOGT was less overtly Christian and no longer identifies itself as a Christian organization. The IOGT has also focused more singly on temperance both before and after Prohibition than the WCTU, with substance abuse linked with alcohol abuse as the main focus for the organization early in its history.

The questions remain, however: Why are the international branches of both organizations experiencing so much more success than their national counterparts? And, why is the IOGT more successful than the WCTU in expanding and retaining membership? By comparing and contrasting the successes and failures of the IOGT and IOGT International with the WCTU in the United States and the World WCTU it is possible to observe that it is not simply changing social mores in the United States and backlash to Prohibition that is causing membership for the WCTU to dwindle nationwide. Instead, a combination of the WCTU's racial homogeneity, a narrow view of what it means to be Christian in the United States, inability to use modern technology effectively, and the disappearance of the non-working middle class woman have created a decline in membership.

Section I:

The Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries: WCTU and IOGT Are Born

Foundation and Organization of the WCTU

Founding Myths of the WCTU

The Woman's Christian Temperance Union has its roots in what Helen Tyler, a former editor of the WCTU's *Union Signal* who sketched a brief insider history of the various activities of the WCTU, refers to as the Women's Temperance Crusade.³ The Women's Temperance Crusade began in December, 1873 in Fredonia, New York, when one hundred women marched from a Baptist church to the saloon of the Taylor House Hotel and demanded that the proprietors cease their sale of alcoholic products.⁴ This scene made the front-page of newspapers across the United States and over the next year was duplicated countrywide with slight variations. The Crusade met with various levels of success throughout the country, and newspaper reports, read aloud at temperance meetings, contributed to the spread of the movement.⁵ Based on information from a variety of newspapers and other contemporary sources, the historian Jack S. Blocker Jr. found 911 recorded Crusades involving over 57,000 Crusaders.⁶

According to Tyler, the Women's Temperance Crusade became the topic of conversation between three women on their way to attend the first annual Sunday School Assembly in 1874.⁷ These three women, Jane Fowler Willing, Emily Huntington Miller, and Martha McClellan, discussed the creation of a national women's organization to promote temperance.⁸ Tyler records

³ Helen Tyler, *Where Prayer and Purpose Meet: The WCTU Story 1874-1949* (Illinois: The Signal Press, 1949), v; 12.

⁴ Jack S. Blocker Jr., *"Give to the Winds Thy Fears": The Women's Temperance Crusade, 1873-1874* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1985), 3.

⁵ *Ibid.*, 15.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 24.

⁷ Helen Tyler, *Where Prayer and Purpose Meet*, 11.

⁸ *Ibid.*, 12.

that although “fiction” may have been introduced in the retelling of the chance encounter, the WCTU credits these three women with the inspiration behind the organizing effort at Chautauqua a year later in August, 1874.⁹ Approximately fifty women gathered, led by Mrs. Willing and Mrs. Miller who issued a “circular letter asking woman’s temperance leagues to elect delegates’ to an organizing convention to be held in Cleveland, Ohio, the following November.”¹⁰

It is important to highlight a few pertinent points in the founding story of the WCTU. First, the WCTU began and continued to be thought of as a distinctly Christian organization. Second, the initial conception, organization, and planning was carried out and led solely by women. In her account of the foundation of the Union, Tyler does not include any information about funding, permissions, or other assistance received from the husbands of the original organizers. Whether or not there was assistance provided by men in the initial organization of the WCTU, the fact that Tyler, an historian and member of the Union, mentions only women, speaks volumes about its woman-centered nature. At its conception and in 1949, when Tyler wrote, the WCTU was grounded in the idea that it was a woman-led, woman-organized, and woman-focused Christian temperance organization.

Early Organization of the WCTU

By November 1874, the WCTU held its first convention in Cleveland, Ohio.¹¹ Held in the Second Presbyterian Church, the convention drew 135 delegates and visitors, mostly white, Protestant, middle to middle-upper class, middle-aged women, and was opened with devotional

⁹ *Ibid.*, 12; 16.

¹⁰ *Ibid.*, 16-17.

¹¹ *Ibid.*, 19.

exercises and punctuated with prayer meetings and hymns.¹² *Hymns For Use in W.C.T.U.*

Meetings from 1888 preserves several quintessential hymns from that time period. The Christian rhetoric used in *Home Protection Hymn* is typical of that used throughout WCTU meetings:

Home Protection Hymn

Air: Arise and Shine

O trust ye in the Lord forever!
Strong is His arm and wide His love;
He keepeth truth, Be falleth never,
Tho' earth and sea and heaven remove.

Cho. Sing to the Lord! He goes before us;
His strength is ours, His truth shall stand
Till east and west shall join the chorus,
For God and Home, and Native Land.

Be strong, oh men who bear the battle
For us the banner and the shield,
For strong to conquer as to suffer
Is He who leads you in the field.

Lift up your eyes, oh women, weeping
Beside your dead! The dawning day
Has rent the seal of death forever,
And angles roll the stone away.

Room for the Right! Make room before me
For truth and righteousness to stand,
And plant the holy banner o'er us—
For God, and Home, and Native Land.¹³

In recounting the events which took place at the first convention, Tyler carefully emphasizes the presiding officer's words to the assembled women: "this is simply...a religious movement."¹⁴ In 1949, Tyler stated that the WCTU's continued countrywide and local "reform work,"

¹² *Ibid.*, 19-20.

¹³ Woman's Christian Temperance Union, Moncton Branch, *Hymns For Use in W.C.T.U. Meetings*, (Moncton, N.B., 1888), 5.

¹⁴ Willig quoted in *Ibid.*, 19.

philanthropic services, and political actions were actuated by religious motives.¹⁵

This centrality of Christianity to the nascent movement is reflected in the Declaration of Principles and Plan of Work which were both adopted by the Union at the first annual convention. Often attributed to Frances Willard, a woman who was to become exceedingly central to the Union and will be discussed in the following section, the Declaration of Principles adopted by the WCTU set out for the young movement the basic tenets that the organization planned to follow. Consisting of The Pledge, The Creed, and The Methods, the Declaration's first two paragraphs indicate the centrality of Christianity to the Union:

We believe in the coming of His Kingdom whose service is perfect freedom, because His laws, written in our members as well as in nature and in grace, are perfect, converting the soul.

We believe in the gospel of the Golden Rule, and that each man's habits should be an example safe and beneficent for every other man to follow.¹⁶

The Pledge, an oath taken by all members and supporters of the union, states:

I hereby solemnly promise, God helping me, to abstain from all distilled, fermented and malt liquors, including wine, beer, and cider, and to employ all proper means to discourage the use of and traffic of the same.¹⁷

Note here that the WCTU takes a line of strict abstinence from all forms of alcohol. Central to The Creed and The Methods is the belief in God, the Golden Rule, the living wage, an eight-hour workday, education of the young, and reformation of the "drinking classes."¹⁸ The Creed states:

We believe that God created both man and woman in His own image, and therefore we believe in one standard of purity for both men and women, and in the equal right of all to hold opinions, and to express the same with equal freedom.¹⁹

While articulating the WCTU's religious foundation, the assertion of gender equality later

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 19.

¹⁶ *Ibid.*, 27.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 28.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, 16-17.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 27.

became a point of conflict within the Union when the issues of women's suffrage and the proper role of women in the public sphere changed in the years following the inception of the Union.

Along with the Declaration of Principles, the WCTU conceived of and adopted a Plan of Work at its first annual meeting in 1874. The Plan of Work was intended to be a system by which the organization could become a magnifying glass that focused the scattered effort of the movement in order to sway public opinion and bring about temperance reform on local and national levels.²⁰ The Plan of Work included ideas for public educational outreach, youth education, circulation of temperance informational materials, abstinence from sacramental wine, establishment of alternatives to saloons, creation of homes for newly sober men and women, the building of water fountains in public places, efforts at fundraising, and the reminder to put trust in God.²¹

Above all, beginning with the first annual meeting of the WCTU, the centrality of Christianity and women's leadership in the organization stands out. Tyler emphasizes this Christian focus when she sums up the original foundation of the movement, stating that "from its beginning days even up to now, the WCTU has been an evangelistic movement motivated by prayer."²² Likewise, Tyler underscores the centrality of women's leadership and initiative by repeatedly listing the women elected as president, secretary, head of committees, etc. As with its foundation story, the history of the early organizational efforts of the WCTU shows a religiously oriented organization conceived of by women, financed by women, and led by women.

²⁰ *Ibid.*, 29.

²¹ *Ibid.*, 29-32.

²² *Ibid.*, 39.

Frances E. Willard and the “Do-Everything Policy”

Frances E. Willard

In 1879, five years after the Union’s creation, Frances E. Willard, formerly a secretary for the organization, became president by election of the WCTU.²³ Willard’s selection marked the beginning of a slow change in the Union’s political and social involvement. In 1880, by the sixth national convention, the recorded list of Standing Committees already depicts the ways in which the work of the WCTU had expanded into nearly all aspects of rural and urban life where liquor traffic caused personal or community problems.²⁴ Under Willard’s leadership this work expanded even further.

Despite Willard’s many achievements and the heroic portrayals of her, Willard’s ideas did not always meet with unanimous support from the WCTU. Many within the Union, such as Willard’s predecessor president Mrs. Wittenmyer, did not support the women’s ballot or heavy political involvement by the WCTU.²⁵ Not until the tenth annual convention in 1883 did support for equal suffrage become sanctioned by the Union.²⁶ Although the woman-centered nature of the WCTU was in itself progressive, many of the members of the organization continued to promote traditional conservative social roles and mores for women.

The “Do-Everything Policy”

Central to Willard’s lasting effect on the WCTU was her belief that social problems were interrelated. Willard advanced the idea that no single social or moral problem could find its solution alone, but a constellation of matters had to be dealt with as a whole.²⁷ To this end, Willard emphasized women’s suffrage, political action, public education, and scientific

²³ *Ibid.*, 52.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, 55.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, 59.

²⁶ *Ibid.*, 71.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, 62.

investigation of the effects of other toxic substances such as tobacco and opium.²⁸ Willard's approach had a lasting influence on the WCTU. Even in the years after her death, the Union continued to focus its energy on a network of what its leaders perceived as social ills.

Under Willard's reign, the organization also became much more directly involved in politics. In 1884, the WCTU voted officially to support and lend its influence to the Prohibition Party.²⁹ Garnering such official support did not happen at once, but took years of persuasive effort by Willard to convince the WCTU members that moral suasion alone would not lead them to achieve their goals. Willard's insistence on engaging politically even led a small group of Iowan members to leave the Union and form their own temperance organization in 1889.³⁰ Such internal dissention, however, did not stop the national organization from pursuing more direct political action. Under Willard's leadership the WCTU sent petitions to governmental leaders, lent support to temperance candidates, and backed temperance legislation. This emphasis on political action, as well as education of the public, remains an important aspect of WCTU outreach to this day.

Willard also instituted a high level of autonomy for individual chapters, or "unions," on the state and local levels. Local unions became free to develop their personal interests and tactics, the only requirement being that members sign the total abstinence pledge and pay dues.³¹

The practice of local autonomy continues to be true of the modern WCTU. State website informational pages tend to differ greatly from the national website.³² For example, the national website lists issues of concern as alcohol, tobacco, illegal drugs, gambling, and pornography. In

²⁸ *Ibid.*, 73.

²⁹ *Ibid.*, 76.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, 101-102.

³¹ *Ibid.*, 59.

³² "National WCTU Issues of Concern," *Woman's Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 13, 2013, <http://www.wctu.org/issues.html>.

contrast, the Maryland WCTU directs its attention to the issues of the sanctity of human life, freedom of religion, marriage and family, sexual purity, gambling, and pornography.³³ Thus, the organizational changes Willard instituted continue to shape the modern organization.

By the time of Willard's death in February 1897, the WCTU was arguably "the largest and most powerful women's group in the world."³⁴ Three years later in Washington, DC, at the week-long annual convention of 1900, the organization hosted 446 voting delegates as well as an approximately equal number of guests.³⁵ During Willard's tenure as president of the WCTU, the organization grew into an international presence, boasted a monthly publication, and became largely involved in political outreach. Meanwhile, the organization remained fundamentally religious and comprised mainly of middle class, white, middle-aged women who reached out, ironically, in a patronizing, paternalistic way to educate the middle and lower "drinking" classes.³⁶

Prohibition and the Peak of WCTU Adherence

Prohibition

After Willard's death in 1898, the WCTU continued to promote temperance education, political involvement, and women's suffrage as the means for achieving temperance reform. Working on local and state levels to pass temperance legislation, the WCTU had its first victory when Georgia voted in 1907 to go dry.³⁷ On January 19th, 1919, the organization celebrated

³³ "WCTU of Maryland Issues of Concern," *Maryland Woman's Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 13, 2013, <http://www.wctumd.org/issues.html>.

³⁴ Helen Tyler, *Where Prayer and Purpose Meet*, 129.

³⁵ *Ibid.*, 150.

³⁶ For members of the WCTU, individuals belonged to a certain class based not only on their income level, but also based on their profession or lack thereof. Most WCTU members did not work and were part of the leisure, middle class. These women aimed most of their outreach and education at lower-income, blue-collar workers, or what the WCTU considered the "great unwashed," "drinking" classes.

³⁷ *Ibid.*, 157.

ratification of the Eighteenth Amendment to the Constitution.³⁸ The Eighteenth Amendment, which took effect on January 16th, 1920, outlawed the production, transport, and sale of alcohol. For the women of WCTU, passage of the Eighteenth Amendment represented a major victory and necessitated a change of tactics in promoting abstention from alcohol consumption. Although Prohibition had finally become a reality, the WCTU continued to work for women's suffrage, which was ratified to the Constitution the following August. In the wake of these accomplishments, the WCTU began to shift some of its emphasis away from political involvement and toward education, law observance, enforcement, and welfare work connected with persistence of alcohol consumption, though illegal.³⁹

1924 marked the fiftieth year of the WCTU and was celebrated with a Golden Jubilee annual convention.⁴⁰ Tyler describes the first decade of Prohibition as one of prosperity for the women of the WCTU and the nation. Tyler cites a highly positive digest describing the 1920's as a period in which money previously spent on alcohol "turned to invention and scientific development, the modernization of homes and cities, the building of highways and development of communications, new and improved schools and churches."⁴¹ Unlike many modern historians of the era who now perceive Prohibition as a time when organized crime and corruption grew, Tyler and her modern WCTU counterparts cast Prohibition and its social effects in an unequivocally positive light.⁴²

10,000 Local Unions

In 1949, over a decade after the repeal of the 18th Amendment, Tyler compiled her history of the WCTU. In reporting on the WCTU of "today," Tyler proudly stated that the

³⁸ *Ibid.*, 171.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, 172, 176.

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, 181.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, 184.

⁴² *Ibid.*, 184-185.

WCTU held the highest membership since pre-Prohibition days, boasting about 10,000 local unions throughout the United States.⁴³ Along with these local unions, Tyler reported that several hundred thousand men contributed financially to the organization despite their having no voting privileges as honorary members. By the mid-twentieth century, most members continued to be Protestant, middle-aged, mostly white, middle-class women. Recounting these statistics, Tyler was careful to note that the organization did boast separate Sojourner Truth Unions of “negro women, most active in the South.”⁴⁴ The WCTU of 1949 continued to promote temperance education on the local, state, national, and international level, held a positive view of Prohibition, and was highly religiously oriented. The organization maintained the practice of stopping at noon to offer prayers to God in the name of temperance and preached the “gospel cure for intemperance.”⁴⁵ Tyler also indicated, in her section outlining the program of “tomorrow” that the Union still embraced Willard’s “do-everything policy” by encouraging temperance, abstinence from narcotic drugs, opposing gambling, supporting federal supervision of motion pictures, and advocating for stricter marriage and divorce laws.

World WCTU: Becoming an International Organization

The current organization claims 1883 as the official date for the organization of the World WCTU, about a decade after the US organization formed. The work of Frances Willard and Mary Clement Leavitt expanded the WCTU into an international organization. In 1884, Leavitt sailed from “San Francisco, bound for Honolulu and beyond” on behalf of Willard and

⁴³ *Ibid.*, 261.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, 261-262.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, 31. WCTU members held public meetings at which they encouraged individuals to take Jesus Christ as their Lord and savior in order to be free from the temptations of alcohol.

the American WCTU.⁴⁶ When she returned in 1891, more than half a million temperance women had organized in five continents, and the WCTU held its first World Convention in Boston. The IOGT, however, helped pave the way because, “everywhere the WCTU missionaries went, they built upon the work already done by the Templars.”⁴⁷ In many instances, WCTU members had first been IOGT members. The WCTU’s international goals stemmed, in a great part, from Willard’s Methodist background. Willard and the WCTU “took very seriously and literally the injunction of John Wesley that the world was their parish.”⁴⁸ Working ground that had been paved by Christian missionaries a century before, the WCTU carried the temperance message along with the Christian faith worldwide.

The World WCTU grew quickly, as did its American counterpart. Historian Ian Tyrell found, “at its peak in 1927 the organization had 766,000 dues-paying members and claimed a following of more than a million women.”⁴⁹ The *Union Signal*, the WCTU’s official monthly magazine, spread information about the international organization across the United States. The special World’s WCTU issue of May, 1891, had so much demand that 200,000 copies were ordered; “twice the average circulation.”⁵⁰ In the 1880s and 1890s, Willard and the WCTU circulated the “Polyglot Petitions,” “the first world-wide request made to world leaders to take a stand against the alcohol traffic and opium trade.”⁵¹ According to the World WCTU, more than 7,500,000 men and women from 50 countries and in 49 languages signed the petition.⁵² The very

⁴⁶ Ian R. Tyrell, *Woman’s World/Woman’s Empire: The Woman’s Christian Temperance Union in International Perspective, 1800-1930* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1991), 1.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, 18.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, 20.

⁴⁹ *Ibid.*, 2.

⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, 37.

⁵¹ “History,” *World Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed March 12, 2014, <http://www.wwctu.com/pages/history2.html>.

⁵² *Ibid.*

fact that the WCTU allowed men to sign the petition met with some objection among the woman-led, woman-only organization. Despite this, the WCTU enjoyed widespread influence and membership in over forty reported countries by 1893.⁵³

Other than the contingents brought from countries whose population was chiefly non-white, the demographics of the World organization remained much the same as the American one: white, middle-class, Protestants. As such, the power relations between the World WCTU and the American WCTU organizations were unbalanced, disadvantaging those in the Southern Hemisphere. All conventions were held in the Northern Hemisphere, “despite offers from the Australians and South Africans.”⁵⁴ Anglo-American groups dominated the organization numerically and in influence. A hierarchical power structure, colonization-like techniques of garnering new membership, and the glossing over of the race controversy in America plagued the WCTU and the World WCTU throughout their histories.

Founding and Organization of the IOGT

Founding Myths of the IOGT

Much like the WCTU, the Independent Organization of Good Templars grew out of the temperance movement in the United States in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. According to R. N. Adams, an IOGT member and its historian in 1876, the group began as a branch of the Total Abstinence Army in New York.⁵⁵ Much like Helen Tyler’s history of the

⁵³ “Early History,” Woman’s Christian Temperance Union, accessed March 30, 2014, <http://wctu.org/earlyhistory.html>.

⁵³ At this time the WCTU was heavily involved in helping to establish the National Council of Women (1888) and was heavily involved in raising the age of consent laws in several states. The WCTU was also one of the first organizations to keep a professional lobbyist in Washington, DC.

⁵⁴ Ian R. Tyrell, *Woman’s World/Woman’s Empire*, 49.

⁵⁵ R. N. Adams, *The Origin and History of Good Templary, With an Exposition of its Principles and Objects* (Dunedin, NZ: H. Wise & Co., 1876), 1.

WCTU, Adams' *The Origin and History of Good Templary, With an Exposition of its Principles and Objects* lacks a self-critical perspective, presenting the organization and its founding in heroic, celebratory fashion. Nevertheless, it is possible to glean several important points from his history which do not appear on the history given by the IOGT International's current website. Moreover, Gordon H. Payne's later history of the order adds more to our understanding of this seminal period.

The Order of Good Templars arose out of the Knights of Jericho, a secret fraternal temperance society, which had organized in 1850 at Oriskany Falls in New York State.⁵⁶ Shortly afterward under the leadership of Wesley Bailey, a body of thirteen members in Utica renamed their lodges as the "Order of Good Templars" and "thus, in 1851 in Utica, the name of 'Good Templar' came into existence."⁵⁷ They chose the name "Good Templar" not for its "pretentious sound" but because the founders "recognized in the great fight which was going on between abstainers and the liquor-loving portion of the community a marked resemblance to the Crusades of the Medieval ages."⁵⁸ The OGT, therefore, claimed the courage and fidelity of the Knights Templars, seeking to "conquer by the power of affections and attractions of benevolence" instead of seeking to "subdue by the power of the sword, and the fear of death."⁵⁹

In the summer of 1852 this group convened in Utica, New York and among those attending was Leverett E. Coon. Coon and his fellow delegate Mr. Truair from the OGT Excelsior Lodge were offended by the larger organization and upon returning home reported their grievances, including the exclusion of women and lack of autonomy for local lodges, to

⁵⁶ *Ibid.*

⁵⁷ *Ibid.*

⁵⁸ R. N. Adams, *The Origin and History of Good Templary*, 18.

⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, 20.

fellow members. Their lodge endorsed Coon and Truair and decided to secede from the OGT.⁶⁰ On July 13th, 1852, at the Empire House near the Erie Canal, Coon and his supporters formed “The New Order,” and became the Independent Order of Good Templars in July, 1852.⁶¹ The IOGT adopted the motto “Faith, Hope, and Charity,” and Coon became the first Grand Worthy Chief Templar. Thus the Independent Order of Good Templars was born.⁶²

Three points relevant to comparing the IOGT and the WCTU stand out from these early years of the IOGT. The first is that much like the WCTU, after its foundation in the summer of 1852, the IOGT grew quickly. By the second Grand Lodge Convention in November of 1852, the group had eleven lodges which sent twenty-nine brothers and five sisters as delegates to the meeting, though sources do not reveal the total membership at the time.⁶³ Quick growth and high membership also allowed the organization to wield influence in local politics and expand internationally.

This first point bleeds into the second. Although no women attended the first IOGT Convention, by that time six women had been initiated into Lodge Number 3.⁶⁴ The chair of the first Convention “urged that in a great measure the perpetuation of the Order depended on the male members bringing in their female friends.”⁶⁵ Adams explained that in the lodges women enjoyed “equal privileges with all others in membership,” meaning that women could hold leadership positions within the organization in theory if not in practice.⁶⁶ The IOGT, much like the early WCTU, aimed to give women an organization within which to fight the evils of

⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, 9.

⁶¹ Gordon H. Payne, *International Order of Good Templars: Birthplace, Early History, Important Dates, Platform, Songs, a Great Leader, Its Principles and Work* (Medina, NY: G. H. Payne, 1942), 2.

⁶² R. N. Adams, *The Origin and History of Good Templary*, 18.

⁶³ Gordon H. Payne, *International Order of Good Templars*, 16.

⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, 10.

⁶⁵ *Ibid.*, 10.

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, 15.

alcohol. Payne dug further and discovered that the reason for Coon's initial split from the Knights of Jericho and later the IOGT directly stemmed from the lack of equality granted to women.⁶⁷

Third, Adams, in passing, mentions that although the most important requirement for membership in the IOGT was the belief in temperance, "a belief in the 'existence and power of Almighty God' has from the first been a prerequisite to membership."⁶⁸ Adams attributes this belief with the long lasting effectiveness of the organization in comparison with some of the other temperance organizations of the time which were founded and quickly fizzled. Adams' brief mention of the belief in "The Almighty" gives sharp contrast to Tyler's constant mention of Christianity and God in her history of the WCTU. Prerequisite of belief in God is not mentioned in the history of the organization by the current website, and as will be shown later, is not a valued or necessary requirement for membership or for the temperance struggle by the modern IOGT.

Early Organization of the IOGT

Although the IOGT became a successful temperance organization in a short period of time, Adams and other historians of the group were careful to mention that its growth did not occur without struggle. Adams equates the organization's early years to those of a ship experiencing a tempest, but is careful to state that by the time he writes in 1876 the IOGT had "passed from insignificance to prominence."⁶⁹ According to Adams, less than six months after its organization the IOGT "numbered twenty-one lodges in active operation."⁷⁰ By June 1853, the

⁶⁷ Gordon H. Payne, *International Order of Good Templars*, 5-6.

⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, 15.

⁶⁹ R. N. Adams, *The Origin and History of Good Templary*, 19-20.

⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, 21

bi-annual Convention reported 93 lodges with a total of 3,740 members.⁷¹ This same year, the group also established its official organ, a newspaper called *The Templar and Watchword*.⁷² Four months later, the group claimed 274 lodges with a membership near 15,000 members, by 1854 the IOGT had lodges in eleven states and in Canada.⁷³ The IOGT mushroomed after the Civil War, rising to over 400,000 members by 1868.⁷⁴ According to David Fahey, the IOGT's unique mixture of "lodge ritual, wholesome companionship, and denunciation of drink," attracted a youthful and broad membership in the United States.⁷⁵ It had a hand in organizing the Prohibition Party and supposedly spawned other later temperance organizations, including the WCTU, because its founders had significant experience in Templar work.⁷⁶

This steep rise in membership raises the question of who constituted the IOGT. The early IOGT, unlike the WCTU, was made up mainly of groups lacking social prestige, among them young people, former alcoholics, people of the working class, people of the lower-middle class or the rural equivalents, and women.⁷⁷ The IOGT has had a far more varied membership than the WCTU, over time including ex-slaves, former slaveholders, white racists, pacifists, soldiers, businessmen, laborers, and unionists. In the early years most Templars were evangelical Protestants, but after overseas expansion, membership expanded to include agnostics, Hindus, and, in the twentieth century, Communists.⁷⁸ Due to this great range in class, creed, race, and gender, the only generalized statement that can be made about the early IOGT members is their shared promise to abstain from alcohol.

⁷¹ Gordon H. Payne, *International Order of Good Templars*, 8.

⁷² *Ibid.*

⁷³ *Ibid.*, 9.

⁷⁴ Mark Lawrence Schrad, *The Political Power of Bad Ideas: Networks, Institutions, and the Global Prohibition Wave* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), 42.

⁷⁵ David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 5.

⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, 42.

⁷⁷ *Ibid.*, 22.

⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, 19.

Payne and Adams also offer several insights into the main tenets and focuses of the early group that attracted so many members. Two “Odes” used in the lodge meetings articulate central tenets that marked the organization.

Lodge Opening
(Tunes: “Watchman,” “Pleyel's.”)
Friends of Temp’rance welcome here,
Cheerful are our hearts to-day;
Tell us—we would gladly hear—
How our cause speeds on its way.

Here we pledge ourselves anew,
Not to touch the drunkard’s drink;
Proving faithful, proving true,
We shall from no duty shrink.

Lodge Closing
(Tunes: “Greenville,” “Sicilian.”)
Heav’nly Father, give Thy blessing,
While we now this meeting end;
On our minds each truth impressing,
That may to Thy glory tend.

Save from all intoxication;
From its fountain may we flee;
When assailed by strong temptation,
Put our trust alone in Thee.⁷⁹

From beginning to end, temperance captured members’ hearts and minds and was the central—even sole—focus of the IOGT. According to Adams, “Total Abstinence required just such an organization to carry out its object.”⁸⁰ The Odes also offer a glimpse into the role of religion in the organization. Christianity is seen to be present in the early history of the organization, but it is not emphasized in the same way that it was by the WCTU, through prayer, scripture, and worship, as well as in its name. In passing, Adams mentioned that some members of the organization as early as 1853, objected to the amount of Bible and religion in some of the materials produced by the early IOGT.⁸¹ Although these materials were voted upon and adopted, Adams inclusion of dissent, already points toward a less wholly Christian organization.

Payne also reprinted a copy of the organizations platform in 1942 showing that abstinence took pride of place while religion or even spirituality is absent.

Platform:

1. Pledged personal abstinence from the use of intoxicating liquors as a beverage.

⁷⁹ Gordon H. Payne, *International Order of Good Templars*, 10.

⁸⁰ R. N. Adams, *The Origin and History of Good Templary*, 21.

⁸¹ *Ibid.*, 25.

2. Earnest efforts to protect, save and reclaim others from the drink evil, by pledged abstinence and helpful fraternal association.
3. Persistent education to create and sustain a sound public opinion upon the subject by active dissemination of the truth through every agency of publicity at command.
4. Advancement and support of legislation to suppress the liquor traffic, within local, state, and national limits, which shall tend toward the accomplishment of the ultimate purpose of absolute prohibition of the manufacture, importation, sale or any form of traffic in intoxicating liquors for beverage purposes, such prohibition to be secured by the will of the people expressed in their national constitutions and due forms of law, with adequate penalties for violation.
5. The selection of faithful administrators to secure efficient law enforcement.
6. Cultivation of the ideal of the world wide brotherhood of man, regardless of race, color, or creed, with expanding efforts to uplift and educate the members to social needs and obligations, while ever persisting in the determination to save individuals, communities, states and nations from intoxicating liquor, the great destroyer of life and happiness, until our success is complete and universal.⁸²

Several aspects of the platform stand out. First, the organization's platform, in mentioning the use of liquor, repeatedly states that alcohol is not to be used "as a beverage." Second, membership is not limited by "race, color, or creed." Third, the IOGT's keen focus on saving, reclaiming, and rehabilitating other members of society from the adverse effects of alcohol is brought forward. Finally, the IOGT stresses political involvement and public education. All of these aspects are important to keep in mind when later discussing the IOGT and the WCTU as temperance organizations which grew out of the same movement and continue to be in existence long after many other temperance organizations ceased to exist.

Social Issues: The IOGT, Women's Suffrage, Race, and Moral Suasion

Public Education and Moral Suasion

The IOGT, unlike many of its temperance organization predecessors, "had a platform that

⁸² Gordon H. Payne, *International Order of Good Templars*, 16.

focused upon moral suasion and rehabilitation.”⁸³ Early in the organization’s history, distinct from many other fraternal societies and temperance organizations, the IOGT welcomed recovering alcoholics as part of this rehabilitation platform. Most temperance organizations denied membership to alcoholics to keep vulgar behavior out of their lodges and avoid handling lapses from sobriety.⁸⁴ Initially, the IOGT sought members who were trying to give up drink. By 1885, it was estimated that out of the more than five million people who had at one time belonged to the IOGT, 400,000 had been alcoholics and “at least half of [them] ‘kept their pledge.’”⁸⁵ This aspect of the society lost traction as the organization aged and almost completely disappeared when Alcoholics Anonymous was founded in 1935.

The early IOGT was also greatly interested in educating the public at large about liquor in order to create social change. The organization published educational material, distributed information about the evils of alcohol as a beverage, and created juvenile leagues associated with the fraternal order. Work among children was officially recognized in 1871, and mainly given to female members of the organization, because male members “dismissed organizing children and youth as unimportant, and nearly all male Templars used tobacco, something prohibited to the adults who led the juvenile societies.”⁸⁶ Moral suasion through education and rehabilitation have remained a mainstay of the organization; however, the IOGT from the time of its founding has also been dedicated to the advancement and support of legislation which prohibits the sale, transportation, and production of liquor.

Inclusion of Women in the IOGT

One of the most striking features of the IOGT, as both a temperance organization and a

⁸³ Mark Lawrence Schrad, *The Political Power of Bad Ideas*, 41.

⁸⁴ David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 20.

⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, 20.

⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, 28.

fraternal society, was the decision not only to admit women as members of the organization but also as members with full privileges. In recounting the founding of the society, Payne asserts that it was this exact aspect that led Coon and his home lodge to split from the OGT and form the IOGT. Payne recounts that at the annual meeting of the OGT in 1852 “Coon was an ardent advocate of ‘Woman’s Rights,’ and favored their admission on an equality with men. When he and his followers were out-voted, they withdrew.”⁸⁷ The original members aimed for the organization to be a truly universal brotherhood, barring no one from entrance based on race, gender, or class, but only insisted on a shared support of the temperance cause.⁸⁸ Within a month of the organization’s founding in July, 1852, the first women Templars had been initiated into the Forest City lodge in Ithaca, New York.⁸⁹ Despite the great pains that the group’s member-historians and the modern international organization’s website go to in remembering the IOGT as a vanguard for women’s suffrage and equality, the earliest female members of the IOGT did not attain equality within the group “even in theory.”⁹⁰

By the time of the Grand Lodge meeting in November, 1852, however, members voted to invest women with equal rights within the organization.⁹¹ By the close of 1852, women occupied several minor offices in its central organization, and in May, 1858, Amanda Clark presided over

⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, 7.

⁸⁸ R. N. Adams, *The Origin and History of Good Templary*, 2.

⁸⁹ David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 23.

⁹⁰ “IOGT History,” *IOGT.org*, accessed March 11, 2014, <http://www.iogt.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/History.pdf>.

⁹⁰ Gordon H. Payne, *International Order of Good Templars*, 7.

David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 5, 23-24.

The National IOGT website currently boasts that “It was the age of fraternal societies and IOGT stood out from the rest because not only did it admit women, but women were also given leadership positions. It was ahead of its time in the vanguard of women’s suffrage.” While Payne applauds the IOGT for “the unique feature, theretofore unknown in any such organization, of admitting women on a perfect equality with men.” Fahey, while lauding this attempt, refutes this notion by stating that women paid dues and were perfunctorily involved in the early organization.

⁹¹ David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 24.

the first grand lodge meeting to be held outside of the United States—in Canada.⁹² The new regulations of November, 1852, allowed female members to speak, vote, hold office, and participate in secret rituals. The only difference between male and female members was that in recognizing that women had little money of their own, the IOGT set their dues at a lower rate.⁹³ By 1853, the Order had 1,316 female members who made up a third of IOGT membership in the United States and Canada throughout the nineteenth century.⁹⁴

Although the absence of sexism in the early IOGT may be exaggerated by former members and historians, the group went to great lengths to encourage female membership and leadership. In 1857, for example, the “Grand Lodge of Wisconsin resolved to change its constitution to add female pronouns to male ones.”⁹⁵ During the Civil War, a lodge in Iowa elected only women officers and although no woman ever headed the international organization, several women served as Grand Worthy Chief Templar at lodges within the United States.⁹⁶ Female members were also often put in charge of juvenile outreach and associated youth societies, and they served as editors and orators.

Despite these positive changes and the ability of IOGT female members to exercise leadership, female Templars rarely enjoyed true equality with their male counterparts.⁹⁷ Female IOGT members could attend weekly lodge meetings, be included in secret initiation ceremonies and rituals, and vote in lodge elections and, in theory, the IOGT refuted the idea of female frailty and moral authority that supported male dominance, power, and leadership. Nevertheless, the power given to women within the IOGT was limited. Hostility was sometimes shown to female

⁹² Gordon H. Payne, *International Order of Good Templars*, 14.

⁹² David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 11.

⁹³ David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 24.

⁹⁴ *Ibid.*, 24.

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, 25.

⁹⁶ *Ibid.*, 27.

⁹⁷ *Ibid.*, 26.

IOGT activists. Amanda M. Way's home was set on fire by an anti-temperance society in revenge for her temperance work in Indiana and newspapers and audience members heckled her at public appearances.⁹⁸ When the WCTU provided an alternative in 1874, many female Templars showed their dissatisfaction with opportunities for women within the IOGT by joining the woman-only organization instead.⁹⁹

Race and the Inclusion of People of Color in the early IOGT

Although by the fall of 1852, no IOGT lodge had the right to reject women, in the early years of the organization no such protection was offered to African Americans.¹⁰⁰ Not until 1853, was the first African American, James R. Jones, present at a Grand Lodge session.¹⁰¹ In fact,

Many white Templars refused to have blacks in their own lodges as members or as visitors, only grudgingly accepted the fact of black members in other lodges, and never personally encountered a black Templar. Nearly all black Templars belonged to segregated lodges in the American South; most of the rest lived in northern seaports and often belonged to de facto segregated lodges.¹⁰²

However, the group's evolving universalist ideology began to challenge members of the IOGT to open their lodges to non-whites and try to "provide some kind of membership for African Americans" even in the American South.¹⁰³ Lodges made concessions and modified their exclusion of African Americans, but such concessions were not enough to ward off the largest schism in the group's history.

During the American Civil War, IOGT membership fell drastically. "Tens of thousands of Templars and prospective Templars left home to fight," David Fahey found, and membership

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*, 27-28.

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, 29.

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid.*, 29-30.

¹⁰¹ R. N. Adams, *The Origin and History of Good Templary*, 25.

¹⁰² David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 30.

¹⁰³ *Ibid.*, 6, 30-31.

dropped by more than a third between 1860 and 1863.¹⁰⁴ Male members of the IOGT owed the continuation of the organization to their female counterparts. IOGT Sisters took on the leadership roles that their Brothers left behind, including secretarial, educational, and editorial. Not until the last years of the Civil War and the first years of peace did the organization again see its numbers gain. The IOGT's membership grew explosively and peaked at more than half a million members by the end of 1868.¹⁰⁵ At this time the problem of race within the organization came to a head.

In 1875, the IOGT allowed for segregated lodges and Grand Lodges to appease the “sensitivities” of the Southern States.¹⁰⁶ By this time, an international offshoot of the IOGT had become well established and an influx of both white American Southerners and British recruits boosted the IOGT. This increasing diversity made the issue of African American membership sharply divisive and sparked a dispute that contemporaries referred to as a duel between a Kentuckian and an Englishman.¹⁰⁷ On one side stood John J. Hickman, head of the Kentucky Grand Lodge, with his backers, the Hickmanites, and on the other Joseph Malins, who dominated the English Grand Lodge, with his supporters, the Malinites. Hickman and the Kentucky Grand Lodge, the oldest and largest of the southern Grand Lodges spoke, or at least claimed to speak, for the American South where at least a third of the American IOGT members lived. While Malins represented the much younger, but larger Grand Lodge of England, which extolled the universalist ideology of the IOGT and organized lodges in British colonies, northern Europe, and along British trade routes worldwide.¹⁰⁸ The Grand Lodge of England disagreed with the

¹⁰⁴ *Ibid.*, 12.

¹⁰⁵ *Ibid.*

¹⁰⁶ “IOGT History,” *IOGT.org*, accessed March 11, 2014, <http://www.iogt.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/History.pdf>.

¹⁰⁷ David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 32.

¹⁰⁸ *Ibid.*

existence of separate lodges for African Americans within the United States and proposed that this practice be made illegal under IOGT Grand Lodge law. In 1876, at the annual meeting in Kentucky, this proposition was defeated. Malins and his supporters angrily left the meeting, declaring, “We honour the flag of our country but we love the flag of Good Templary more because it covers all nations and peoples!”¹⁰⁹ The British delegation, along with other international delegates, left the organization to establish their own international body and thus the schism within the IOGT began.

Although the modern IOGT International website glosses over this schism, simply stating that it was healed in 1887 through the efforts of John B. Finch, the years that the schism lasted were important to the later success and failures of the organization in the United States.¹¹⁰ At that time, Hickman and his many supporters dismissed the idea of segregated lodges in favor of the creation of a completely separate organization for African Americans, to be called the Colored Templars of North America.¹¹¹ Hickman boasted that helping “the blacks of Kentucky ‘throw off the shackles of intemperance’” would cause “very many of the *immoral* institutions” to “die out for want of support.”¹¹² He did not wish, however, to put “colored lodges” on the same footing as white lodges, because he was not willing to admit their equality. In contrast, few British members of the IOGT had ever met a black person and this, along with Templar universalism and distaste for the slave practice, predisposed the IOGT in Britain to fight for the ability of blacks to join the IOGT everywhere. In his work on temperance and racism, David M. Fahey was careful to point out that this did not indicate that the British were free of racism. In fact, the British reaction “to the Indian Mutiny and black rebellion in Jamaica showed a hardening racism

¹⁰⁹ “IOGT History,” *IOGT.org*, accessed March 11, 2014, <http://www.iogt.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/History.pdf>.

¹¹⁰ *Ibid.*

¹¹¹ David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 37.

¹¹² *Ibid.*

that the popular understanding of Darwinian evolution intensified.”¹¹³ However, the British condemned slavery, did not impose racial segregation, and few, at the time, shared the southern white “obsession with racial contamination.”¹¹⁴

Throughout the schism, Malins and the Grand Lodge of England maintained that “the brotherhood of the [human] race is one of the fundamental principles” of the IOGT, while southern lodges continued to threaten secession if too hard a line on the race issue was taken.¹¹⁵ Hickman and other southern members argued that Malins’ support of African American members was simply a “red herring” and that his true goal was English power over the American lodges.¹¹⁶ Hickman’s argument was not entirely without basis and the struggle to find a balance of power between the American IOGT and its international branch influenced the schism throughout its duration. Despite high tensions over the divisive issue, efforts at reconciliation of the IOGT commenced almost as soon as the schism began. Hickman offered up the Philadelphia proposal, allowing for segregated, subordinate African American lodges having no right of representation at the white Grand lodges. Executives of the Great Britain lodges rejected the proposal.¹¹⁷ Delegates rejected several more proposals put forward on the matter of race. Meanwhile factions within each party grew. African American IOGT members belonged to both the Hickmanite and Malinite camps, but lack of money, fear of forced socialization, and the difficulty of education alienated many potential members. Finch finally boiled down the schism to two questions: “was union desirable? was union possible?”¹¹⁸ In 1887, these questions were answered at Saratoga by voting that race could only be a basis for temporary division between

¹¹³ *Ibid.*, 38.

¹¹⁴ *Ibid.*

¹¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 82-84.

¹¹⁶ *Ibid.*, 83.

¹¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 88.

¹¹⁸ *Ibid.*, 128.

“Senior Grand Lodges” and “Junior Grand Lodges...in a jurisdiction where it is necessary temporarily to overcome differences of race or language.”¹¹⁹ Finch’s rulings satisfied the British demands made ten years earlier, protected the rights of African Americans, and established a new policy for their membership that satisfied the shrinking white southern delegation. Finch “regarded international unity as a vital dimension of Templar universalism” and saw great promise in the sheer number of African American recruits he believed could be reached in the next decade.¹²⁰ The IOGT was a united organization.

The schism, however, was not without lasting, negative consequences. The American South suffered severe losses to membership and this, along with perceived weakness of their lodges, reduced their influence in the Grand Lodges.¹²¹ Moreover, the IOGT had lost membership in all regions and suffered financially. The question of race and IOGT “law” in the south remained unclear even after the group was reunited and the question of nonwhites within the IOGT simply shifted to South Africa rather than fading away. The question of African Americans was not the only cause of the great schism, but it was the catalyst and it would be a mistake to label the Malinites as purely motivated by a passion for “human dignity and equality.”¹²² The schism over racial integration was not the only factor that had a lasting effect on the IOGT as a whole, nor was it the final schism that the international organization would experience.

Becoming an International Organization

The current United States IOGT website states “the most significant year in its history

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 129.

¹²⁰ *Ibid.*, 131.

¹²¹ *Ibid.*, 103.

¹²² *Ibid.*, 153.

was 1868.”¹²³ In that year the group spread into Britain and became a truly international organization. According to the organization’s historical records, the group expanded to England and Europe through the industriousness of Joseph Malins, a member of the Philadelphia Good Templars, who figured centrally in the racial schism of the 1870s and 1880s.¹²⁴ Malins established a lodge in Birmingham on September 8th, 1868, and within half a decade, “IOGT societies were flourishing throughout the British Isles.”¹²⁵ By 1873, the annual Templar Grand Lodge convention met in London and total English membership numbered 200,000 members.¹²⁶

Expansion of the organization did not stop in Britain:

Within two to three years the Order spread to Ireland, Wales, Australia, Malta, New Zealand, France, Portugal, Cape Colony South Africa, Bermuda, Belgium and East India. By 1876 the Order had been planted in Ceylon (Sri Lanka), Madras, British Honduras, British Guyana, the island of St. Christopher, Jamaica, Malacca, China, Japan, Sierra Leone, St. Helena, Argentina, Trinidad, Grenada and the Bahamas. After 1876 it was established in Norway, Sweden, Denmark, Iceland, Switzerland, Germany and Jerusalem and from 1900 onwards Holland, Burma, Colonial Malay, Nigeria and Panama.¹²⁷

In the thirty year period between 1872 and 1902, the Independent Order of Good Templars became a truly international organization. This internationality was acknowledged by the Grand Lodge on March 1st, 1906 when the “Independent” in IOGT was changed to “International.”¹²⁸ The International Organization of Good Templars boasted more than 721,000 current members worldwide during this period, “earning the title of the ‘leading temperance organization in the world.’”¹²⁹ Originally, annual conferences took place exclusively in the United States, but later met biannually in both the US and England and then eventually triennially in North America, the

¹²³ “History of IOGT,” *IOGT.us*, accessed March 12, 2014, <http://www.iogt.us/iogt.php?p=35>.

¹²⁴ Mark Lawrence Schrad, *The Political Power of Bad Ideas*, 42.

¹²⁵ *Ibid.*

¹²⁶ David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 14.

¹²⁷ “IOGT History,” *IOGT.org*, accessed March 11, 2014, <http://www.iogt.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/History.pdf>.

¹²⁸ Gordon H. Payne, *International Order of Good Templars*, 15.

¹²⁹ Mark Lawrence Schrad, *The Political Power of Bad Ideas*, 42.

British Isles, and Europe. The IOGT increased the awareness of their international reach by terming their meetings “World Temperance Convention,” inviting delegates from other countries, and producing press coverage of foreign temperance developments through papers such as the IOGT’s *International Good Templar*.¹³⁰ The international organization’s motto became “Temperance, Peace, and Brotherhood.”

The growing international organization, however, was not without its problems. The early international organization dealt with several major issues. Due to an increasing focus on the organization’s universalism, race and gender became divisive points. Although female members of the organization enjoyed a greater equality within the organization than almost any other temperance or fraternal organization of the time, “equality of Templar women, nominal in North America, remained even more of a fiction in other parts of the world.”¹³¹ Members of a lodge in England threatened to open a separate lodge when a woman was elected as a leader, and in many areas female members of the IOGT were dues paying members at best. The racial schism of the 1870s and 1880s also greatly affected the organization. By the turn of the century the IOGT had become a large-scale international organization with far reaching political and social influence, but it was not without its own internal controversies or outside detractors.

Prohibition: The IOGT in the US

By the time the Eighteenth Amendment went into effect in 1920, the IOGT in America was already experiencing high membership turnover, fluctuation, and loss, unlike the WCTU which experienced a membership spike during and directly after Prohibition. Currently, the IOGT accounts for this decline by stating that some “members felt that victory had been

¹³⁰ Mark Lawrence Schrad, *The Political Power of Bad Ideas*, 43-45.

¹³¹ David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 29.

achieved” with the ratification of the Eighteenth Amendment.¹³² The lack of resolve shown by the Kentucky Grand Lodge during the schism to ensure white supremacy and exclusivity within the organization, left white racists wary of the organization as a whole. Conversely, the length of the schism, combined with the increasing focus on universalism within the organization, led pro-integrationists to doubt the future effectiveness of the IOGT as a bastion of equality, especially in the South. The defection of these members, coupled with the difficulty of organizing and attracting African Americans into the temperance movement, because of social, educational, and historical issues, led to a decline in membership and influence of the organization within the nation.

Nevertheless, the organization enjoyed “their North American golden age.”¹³³ Temperance reform became associated with the prohibition movement in the public consciousness and the IOGT enjoyed being part of the radicalized movement. The IOGT enjoyed peak membership during the years following the Civil War, but the IOGT during Prohibition was a triumphant movement, albeit one dealing with major fluctuations in membership and a notoriously high turnover rate.¹³⁴

Early WCTU and IOGT: Similarities, Differences, Triumphs, and Trials

The early growth, organization, and history of the WCTU and IOGT have a number of parallels. Both grew out of the temperance movement in the United States of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. Both were, initially, Christian-based temperance organizations which strove to meet their goals through a combination of fraternity, moral suasion, public education, and political influence. Both organizations fought for women’s suffrage and the

¹³² “IOGT History,” *IOGT.org*, accessed March 11, 2014, <http://www.iogt.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/History.pdf>.

¹³³ David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 12.

¹³⁴ *Ibid.*, 12-13, 15.

equality of women and men, at least within organizational bounds. The groups shared similar triumphs. Each organization established an international branch soon after the national organization was founded and both shared success in this arena. The groups both helped to fight for the passage and ratification of the Eighteenth Amendment, along with a variety of local and state laws that inhibited the production, sale, and distribution of liquor pre-dating the repeal of the Eighteenth Amendment. Lastly, and perhaps most strikingly, both the WCTU and the IOGT were successful in terms of membership numbers, political influence, and, in contrast with many other contemporary temperance organizations such as the Sons of Temperance or the Washingtonians, continuation of their organization both nationally and internationally.

The groups also faced similar problems. Public perception of both groups was mixed and at times negative, often centering on the inclusion and leadership status of women within the respective groups. Also, the support of the Prohibition Party by both groups eventually alienated staunch Republican members of each organization.¹³⁵ Finally, both groups experienced internal difficulties and fluctuations in membership caused by controversies over social issues of their time, such as racial integration and women's suffrage. This, however, is where the similarities between the two groups end, and it is in their differences, rather than in their similarities, that the future successes and failures of each group can truly be observed.

Although religion was central in the founding of both organizations, looking at the WCTU and the IOGT in contrast shows just how central religion was to the WCTU. Prayers, Scripture readings, support given by various denominations, and an appeal to Christian morals and Christian home life were integral parts of the WCTU throughout its early years and beyond. The women who travelled to other continents to establish the World WCTU carried with them not only the temperance message but also the Christian religion. In contrast, although the IOGT

¹³⁵ *Ibid.*, 13.

was a Christian-based organization that received heavy support and membership from Christian churches worldwide, especially in the African American community, Christianity was not placed front and center in the IOGT as it was in the WCTU. “Christ was present in Templar ritual and rhetoric,” such as its initial motto drawn from 1st Corinthians 13:13, but the IOGT both internationally and nationally constantly debated the balance of religiosity within their publications, rituals, rites, and message.¹³⁶ The WCTU never entertained such a debate. This awareness of Christianity along with a growing focus on universalism within the IOGT, especially internationally, meant that the IOGT did not suffer from the fallout of Protestant sectarian debates, but attracted members from a broad range of faith practices, and eventually led the IOGT away from making religion part of the temperance cause.

Another aspect of the early IOGT and WCTU which on the surface appears similar for both, but differs greatly on closer examination, is the role of women. The IOGT went to great lengths to ensure the equality of women with men within the organization. In practice, the result fell far short. Women held several high positions within the early IOGT, but they were the exception rather than the rule, especially when the organization expanded beyond North America. In contrast, the WCTU, entirely led, financed, and organized by women, offered American women and women of other nationalities opportunities for leadership and social involvement that they had never enjoyed before. In addition, Christian identity and middle-class status that accompanied WCTU membership lent a sort of religiously and socially sanctioned respectability to many of its members. In fact, many women who had formerly been IOGT sisters became members of the WCTU once it was established. The WCTU provided different leadership and membership opportunities than the IOGT.¹³⁷ A female-only organization also

¹³⁶ *Ibid*, 107.

¹³⁷ Ian R. Tyrell, *Woman's World/Woman's Empire*, 19.

allowed members to enter the homes of interested individuals worldwide in a socially acceptable manner. Tea, luncheons, and other female gatherings helped spread the temperance cause on a grass-roots level in ways the IOGT lacked. The IOGT and the WCTU both touted the equality of men and women for the temperance cause, but it was only the WCTU that truly embodied this sentiment.

Both groups dealt with growing racial tensions within the US during and after the Civil War in starkly contrasting ways. From its beginning, the WCTU protested slavery in all forms.¹³⁸ However, very little scholarship deals with how the WCTU, especially in the American south, approached the idea of racial integration. WCTU produced literature is careful to boast of its Sojourner Truth Unions especially formed for African American women.¹³⁹ This sort of rhetoric by the group, along with the colonial-like treatment of non-white or non-Anglo World WCTU groups indicates a lack of awareness or even purposeful effort to maintain the supremacy of white, middle-class, Protestant women within the WCTU and World WCTU. The effort, or, to be kinder, the lack of awareness concerning the privilege given to white women within the organization, later became a handicap for the group. Nevertheless, by avoiding the issue, the WCTU grew throughout its first century. In contrast, the IOGT suffered heavy membership losses in the United States and moderate membership losses worldwide, because of its schism in dealing with the matter. The long lasting effects of these race decisions, diverged for each group, but are better addressed after a discussion of the repeal of Prohibition and the current state of the organizations.

Two greater differences between the groups was the gender composition of their membership and their socio-economic composition. The IOGT included men and women,

¹³⁸ Ian R. Tyrell, *Woman's World/Woman's Empire*, 25.

¹³⁹ Helen Tyler, *Where Prayer and Purpose Meet*, 261-262.

whereas the WCTU limited membership to females, but equally determinative for their larger health was the role of class and religious identity. Throughout its early history and even internationally, the WCTU's members were predominantly white, upper-middle to middle class, non-working, married, mid-twenties to middle-aged, Republican, evangelical and mainline Protestants. The IOGT, though it drew a large deal of its membership from the working class youth, welcomed skilled laborers, doctors, lawyers, politicians, Protestants, Catholics, Hindus, agnostics, Republicans, Democrats, married and unmarried men and women, and was more ethnically diverse. In short, researchers have garnered much information about WCTU women during this period, such as their age, race, class, and religion, but IOGT membership was far more varied and more clearly centered on the temperance cause. In fact, it is partially the IOGT's open, nondiscriminatory membership policies that contributed to its lasting success in terms of membership, personal and political effectiveness, and ability to cooperate with "newer, pan-denominational temperance contemporaries."¹⁴⁰

Section II: The Repeal of Prohibition and the Making of Modern Day Temperance Organizations

Prohibition Repealed: Incredulous Newspapers and the WCTU's Waning Numbers "Forgotten but Not Gone"¹⁴¹

In 1959 Ruth Tibbits Tooze, who in interviews never missed the chance to refer to her aptly rhyming surname, was elected President of the WCTU and held the position of president until 1974. During these years, the WCTU slowly began to fade from public consciousness.¹⁴² By 1971, under her leadership, the organization had thirty-five employees stationed mainly at the

¹⁴⁰ Mark Lawrence Schrad, *The Political Power of Bad Ideas*, 43.

¹⁴¹ Marcida Dodson, "The WCTU: Forgotten But Not Gone: With Song and Prayer, Century-Old Crusade Against Drink Lives Largely Forgotten but Far From Gone," *Los Angeles Times*, April 23, 1978.

¹⁴² "National WCTU President," *Woman's Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 14, 2013, <http://www.wctu.org/tooze.html>.

Evanston headquarters and continued to focus its efforts on combating the use of alcohol as well as lending aid to organizations that protested cigarette advertising.¹⁴³ Prohibition remained at the center of Tooze's radar. "Prohibition has got to come back," she said. "Prohibition gave this nation the best years of our life. Home purchases went up, bank accounts increased, life insurance contracts increased, people had a chance to graduate from high school." Difference of opinion over the centrality of return to Prohibition, however, marked the organization. The WCTU's Washington lobbyist in this same period, Mildred Harman, thought that "pure prohibition" was not a viable option, but "small battles against intoxicants [were] worth winning too."¹⁴⁴ The organization also retained its original religious orientation, although Tooze bemoaned the fact that some churches now lent less support to the temperance cause.¹⁴⁵

As the drug culture blossomed in the 1960s and 1970s, the organization officially voted at its 96th annual meeting "to take a stand against the legalization of marijuana."¹⁴⁶ Like the women in Frances Willard's generation, the WCTU members continued to campaign against all substances and actions which they believed lay at the heart of social problems. Education, especially of the youth, continued as the mainstay of the Union. Television provided a mixed blessing not only as a new means of spreading the WCTU program, but also as a new front for the WCTU to fight. The WCTU lent effort to support and pass bills prohibiting the advertisement of alcoholic beverages on radio and television during this period. The group also continued to protest the increased secularization of public schools, especially condemning the non-abstinence,

¹⁴³ Franklynn Peterson, "Here's Looking at You, WCTU: The Ghost of Carrie Nation Is Alive in Evanston and Still Crusading to Get America Back on the Wagon Again." *Chicago Tribune*, March 21, 1971.

¹⁴⁴ *Ibid.*

¹⁴⁵ *Ibid.*

¹⁴⁶ Arlene Van Breems, "WCTU Takes Stand Against Legalization of Marijuana." *Los Angeles Times*, September 9, 1970.

sex education offered at all levels.¹⁴⁷

Dwindling Numbers

Newspaper reports on WCTU activities in the 1970s give a good account of the continued membership decline that set in the WCTU after the repeal of Prohibition. According to one report, the WCTU “boasted 700,000 paying members” in 1924, but by 1964 the membership had declined to 350,000. In 1971 figures stood at 250,000 with about “75 active chapters around the country,” down from 1,148 in 1879.¹⁴⁸ Despite falling numbers, the WCTU maintained the publication of their monthly journal, the *Union Signal*, which is still published by the WCTU. Each issue opened with a message from the current president, offered articles on scientific findings concerning alcohol and various illegal substances, advertised temperance educational materials, and closed with a monthly worship focus. A quick perusal through any issue from 1972 onwards finds no concern over dwindling influence or membership. Instead, articles were upbeat and optimistic about the future of the WCTU and the temperance movement in general. For example, “Bring Back Prohibition” stated that freedom from alcoholic usage in the United States was not “an impossible task” or “an unrealistic dream,” rather a state that would occur when all children were properly educated about the “addictive nature of beverage alcohol.”¹⁴⁹ The positive character of the *Union Signal*, along with the president’s insistence that Prohibition was not a failure, versus the portrayal of the group and Prohibition by outside sources, depicts a growing dissonance between the ways in which the WCTU viewed themselves and the ways in which non-members viewed the organization. Newspaper articles concerning the Union often featured headlines that underscored the fact that the WCTU was, in fact, still around, despite

¹⁴⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁴⁸ Franklynn Peterson, “Here’s Looking at You, WCTU.”

¹⁴⁸ Helen Tyler, *Where Prayer and Purpose Meet*, 52-53.

¹⁴⁹ Alvin W. Smith, “Bring Back Prohibition!” *Union Signal*, 98 no. 6 (1972): 12-13.

public obliviousness. The WCTU during this period maintained its religious bearings and continued to be constituted by predominantly white, middle-class women. The median age of members, however, slowly rose.

A Movement Grows Old

Over the next three decades WCTU membership and median age were increasingly inversely proportional. Several articles detailing the activities of local chapters of the Union indicate this shift. Jenifer Warren, in a feature for the *Los Angeles Times*, reported that the tactics of two San Diego County chapters continue to focus on education of the youth.¹⁵⁰ In strong contrast to the youth outreach emphasis, Warren reported that the information given about the group came from its youngest member, Estella Notschaele, 63. Membership had dropped precipitously since 1960, from 840 to 100 in 1983. The group remained strongly religious and had “lost none of the conviction that prohibition is the solution to many of society’s ills.”¹⁵¹

Although many of the newspaper articles from this period sympathize with the WCTU causes, headlines expressed a certain amount of incredulity at the Union’s continued existence. In 1981, Eugene L. Meyer painted a grim picture stating, “no matter how timely their issues, their organization is dying.”¹⁵² He explained that often when a chapter’s president passed away, there was simply no one to replace them and, as a result, local chapters closed their doors. Ann Japenga, a reporter for the *Los Angeles Times*, likewise told the story of how a former WCTU shelter for “unfortunate girls” had been transformed into an elderly woman's home for WCTU

¹⁵⁰ Jenifer Warren, “WCTU Now Speaks to Youth: Old Soldiers of Temperance Don’t Fade Away,” *Los Angeles Times*, October 6, 1983.

¹⁵¹ *Ibid.*

¹⁵² Eugene L. Meyer, “WCTU, In Decline, Fights On: Despite Declining Numbers, WCTU Carries On,” *Washington Post*, October 18, 1981.

members.¹⁵³ Japenga explains that this shift occurred gradually and that as the members of the WCTU got older “so too did the population of the house.”¹⁵⁴ Japenga’s report contains two interesting facts. The first is that the house required its members to be Christian, which points to the continuing centrality of religion to the WCTU movement. The second is drawn from an anecdotal report from one of the residents. The resident, Gladys Mayberry, an African American woman who had been a maid in the house in 1954, stated that she was only recently invited to join the “home union.” This outreach to the African American community and other minority populations appears to have been an attempt by the overwhelmingly white WCTU to reverse its trajectory of membership decline. It is also possible that minority outreach began during this period as a reaction to shifts in racial attitudes throughout the United States. Whatever the cause, the WCTU continued to decline during the 1980’s and 1990’s. The median age of members continued to rise and while the members remained largely white and middle-class, the racial complexion of the group began to be less predominantly white.

WCTU: Aligning with the Right

After Prohibition was repealed, the WCTU experienced other changes in addition to older members, declining overall membership, and negative public perception. Initially, the WCTU in the United States was a parachurch organization which generally gleaned members from a variety of Protestant denominations. The organization typically shied away from divisive issues to avoiding taking sides in any of the controversy between denominations, abstaining almost entirely from the fundamentalist-modernist debates that “rocked the Protestant establishment” in

¹⁵³ Ann Japenga, “WCTU Still Active, Still Caring: Operates Rest Home in Eagle Rock for Elderly,” *Los Angeles Times*, July 31, 1980.

¹⁵⁴ *Ibid.*

the early twentieth century.¹⁵⁵ The Union even pushed discussion of stricter divorce laws to the background until the mid-twentieth century, rarely mentioning divorce in the *Union Signal*. As a strictly parachurch organization that carefully renounced specific ties to particular denominations, early meeting organizers took great care to meet at different churches each week so as not to align themselves with any one denomination.¹⁵⁶

In the mid-twentieth century, however, evangelicalism within the WCTU was growing stronger.¹⁵⁷ Ruth Tibbits Tooze also served on the National Association of Evangelicals' Women's Fellowship Executive Committee in the 1960s.¹⁵⁸ The WCTU became vocal advocating displeasure over what it perceived as the removal of religion from public schools as a result of Supreme Court decisions, supporting stricter marriage and divorce laws, and a taking a strong stand against communism.¹⁵⁹ Furthermore, the *Union Signal* began to reprint articles from socially and politically conservative, evangelical publications. All of these measures indicate a growing alignment with the conservative religious and political movement of the late twentieth-century.

This turn from mainstream politics and Protestantism accompanied a decline in the social standing of the WCTU's average members. Joseph Gusfield notes in his study of the WCTU after Prohibition's repeal that the socioeconomic as well as the social status of members

¹⁵⁵ Pamela E. Pennock, "The Number One Social Problem of Our Time: American Protestants and Temperance Politics in the 1950s," *Journal of Church and State* 54, no. 3 (2012): 375-405.

¹⁵⁶ Helen Tyler, *Where Prayer and Purpose Meet*.

¹⁵⁷ Pamela E. Pennock, "The Number One Social Problem of Our Time."

¹⁵⁸ "Mission & Work," *National Association of Evangelicals*, accessed March 11, 2014, <http://www.nae.net/about-us/mission-statement>.

¹⁵⁸ The NAE's mission statement continues to be "connecting and representing evangelical Christians."

¹⁵⁹ Pamela E. Pennock, "The Number One Social Problem of Our Time."

¹⁵⁹ Helen Tyler, *Where Prayer and Purpose Meet*, 261-262.

declined.¹⁶⁰ Members of the WCTU no longer tended to be the wives of doctors and lawyers, and many no longer publicly admitted their membership in the Union. Gusfield argued that the WCTU's change in social status affected their political and social effectiveness and viability. However, as Pamela Pennock points out in her discussion of the group during this period, this shift by the WCTU toward more conservative political and religious values was shared by what was soon to become a highly influential part of American society, the Christian Right.¹⁶¹ It should also be noted that the group, with its strict complete temperance views and do-everything policy had always stood outside of the political mainstream. Growing conservatism in the organization marks an important shift for the WCTU, but it cannot fully explain the diminished membership numbers of the group since that time.

Of note is the slow narrowing of the group's conception of what they deemed "acceptable" or "true" Christian practice. As early as 1937, an article from the *Union Signal* told the story of Ruth, who plans to go to a party at the house of some new neighbors. These new neighbors are defended by Ruth's mother as having "joined the church last Sunday," but Ruth's aunt is not convinced saying, "as if that meant respectability these days! Many's the church member who drinks and smokes and thinks nothing of it."¹⁶² This educational story from the *Union Signal* indicates a shift in the perception of mainstream Protestant denominations by the WCTU. Only churches which advocated temperance and only Christians who practiced temperance numbered as "true" Christians.

Prohibition Repealed: The IOGT in the United States

IOGT membership in the United States suffered from its association with the

¹⁶⁰ Joseph R. Gusfield, "Social Structure and Moral Reform: A Study of the Woman's Christian Temperance Union," *American Journal of Sociology* 61, No. 3 (1955): 231.

¹⁶¹ Pamela E. Pennock, "The Number One Social Problem of Our Time."

¹⁶² "Today's Daughter," *Union Signal*, (December 25, 1937): 5-6.

prohibitionist movement. Already diminished due to complacency after the perceived victory of national Prohibition, the group experienced a loss of political credibility stateside in the 1930's that it would never recover.¹⁶³ Meanwhile, the beginnings of World War II interrupted temperance work throughout Europe, completely disbanding lodges in several areas.¹⁶⁴ Moreover, Alcoholics Anonymous began in 1937. Many alcoholics who had formerly found a "home" within the IOGT not available in other temperance organizations of the time, left the organization for AA in the late 1930's and early 1940's.¹⁶⁵ The IOGT would never again have the reputation of being the welcoming society for American alcoholics that it once was.

Unlike the WCTU, which retained a declining but steady national newspaper presence throughout the twentieth century, coverage of the IOGT and its actions by national news organizations dropped precipitously at the end of the 1930s. Despite waning numbers and influence, as reflected in the drop in coverage concerning the IOGT's work by national and local media, the IOGT in the United States continued to hold its international contingent for annual meetings. In 1948, the group hosted a large contingent for the annual meeting in Washington, DC and in 1951 the centennial meeting was held in Chicago.¹⁶⁶

By 1990 the IOGT was generally only mentioned by American newspapers in obituaries, advertisements for local lectures on IOGT history, or in reference to an annual Midsummer Festival in Chicago sponsored by the local lodge.¹⁶⁷ Though anecdotal, this seems to point to the

¹⁶³ Mark Lawrence Schrad, *The Political Power of Bad Ideas*, 59.

¹⁶⁴ "IOGT History," *IOGT.org*, accessed March 11, 2014, <http://www.iogt.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/History.pdf>.

¹⁶⁵ *Ibid.*

¹⁶⁶ "Good Templars' Order To Convene June 24," *Washington Post*, June 20, 1948.

¹⁶⁶ "Good Templars of World Will Convene Here," *Chicago Daily Tribune*, June 10, 1951.

¹⁶⁷ The annual festival sponsored by the local IOGT lodge still occurs yearly in Chicago and is reported yearly in Chicago-area newspapers. This does not seem to be a result of a prevalent support of the temperance cause in the area, but rather a result of the abundance of Chicagoans of Scandinavian descent in the area. Since WWII, Scandinavian countries have enjoyed the highest

idea that, much like the membership of the WCTU, the average membership of the IOGT was becoming older. In addition, this also indicates that the group's political clout and perception of the group by the larger public, also like the WCTU, declined. The most recent reference in a national newspaper concerning the group's support of a national bill was in 1952.¹⁶⁸ At that time, the group lent what little weight it had to support a bill concerning keeping liquor advertisements off television and radio. The IOGT's support was mentioned toward the bottom of a long list of politically and religiously conservative groups who were also backing the bill. Falling membership numbers, waning influence, and disappearing coverage are all indicative of the difficulties which the IOGT in the United States faced from the passage of the Eighteenth Amendment onward.

Despite the fact that the IOGT in the US was experiencing a drop in membership that they could not rectify, following the close of WWII an emphasis on peace work by the IOGT throughout Europe helped to rebuild the international profile of the group.¹⁶⁹ The expansion and diversity of the IOGT International have been the keys to the organization's longevity, without which the United States lodges may not have survived.

membership numbers of IOGT International and many of the leaders of the organization have hailed from Scandinavian countries in the last century. The IOGT International has deep ties in many Scandinavian communities and these ties seem to have crossed borders with immigrants to Chicago. As such, the Midsummer Festival, at least from the perspective of the American media, appears to be a cultural celebration rather than an event with temperance in mind. Nevertheless, Chicago does seem to remain a bastion of IOGT membership in America, which could possibly stem from the WCTU headquarters presence nearby.

¹⁶⁸ "Bill to Keep Liquor Off Air Is Argued," *Washington Post*, Feb 1, 1952.

¹⁶⁹ "IOGT History," *IOGT.org*, accessed March 11, 2014, <http://www.iogt.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/History.pdf>.

Section III:

Modern Day: The WCTU & IOGT in the Twenty-first Century

The Modern WCTU: Education, Activism, Membership, and Continuity

Education and Activism

The welcome page of the national WCTU website proclaims that “today the WCTU is the oldest voluntary, non-sectarian woman's organization in continuous existence in the world” and continues its “long history of activism and advocacy for women.”¹⁷⁰ Despite a decrease in numbers the WCTU has not been inactive during the early part of the twenty-first century. The organization continues to publish its monthly magazine, the *Union Signal*, a quarterly newsletter, *National Happenings*, and two quarterly catalogs which detail the newest temperance publications, *Signal Press Promoter* and *Signal Press Catalog*. Each of these publications is produced by the organization’s publication division, Signal Press.¹⁷¹

The organization has also remained involved in the political arena. The WCTU currently lends support to various bills, organizations, and politicians who advocate stricter legislation for the sale and use of alcohol and other substances such as marijuana and tobacco. The website of the national WCTU currently list NFIA, National Families in Action, as one of the “friends” of WCTU.¹⁷² NFIA is a nonprofit organization that seeks to educate the public and implement more effective drug policies on the state level.¹⁷³ Recent newspaper articles report that “the organization continues to preach its message that people should never use alcohol, tobacco, or

¹⁷⁰ “Welcome to the WCTU,” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 18, 2013, <http://www.wctu.org/index.html>.

¹⁷¹ The University of Virginia kept a subscription to the *Union Signal* until December, 1972. It is much more difficult to gain access to more recent issues, because few public libraries maintain current subscriptions to the journal.

¹⁷² “Friends of WCTU,” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed 18 April, 2013, <http://www.wctu.org/friends.html>.

¹⁷³ “About NFIA,” *National Families in Action*, accessed 18 April, 2013, <http://www.nationalfamilies.org/about.html>.

drugs” and concentrates on areas with a history of conservative alcohol laws such as Kansas.¹⁷⁴ The WCTU of Michigan also recently received tax-exempt status as a charitable organization due to a bill that was introduced to the House in 2009, suggesting that the local organization has backed off lobbying.¹⁷⁵

Membership

Membership data for the modern WCTU is difficult to find. The national website does not offer membership statistics. Likewise, state websites are typically vague concerning actual numerical involvement in the organization. Membership data, then, must be gleaned from current newspaper articles, many of which are highly critical of the WCTU and Prohibition. One such article puts the membership total for the Union at 5,000 current members nationwide as of June, 2012.¹⁷⁶ Although this article disparages the WCTU’s continued praise for the Prohibition era, the membership estimate seems reasonable. Based on other newspaper articles which provide current state and local numbers for the WCTU, such as Kansas’ 125 members, a conservative estimate of 5,000 total members does not seem unreasonably low.¹⁷⁷ Many state and local members interviewed in recent articles are portrayed as optimistic for the organization’s future. Glenna Dellenbach, for example, is reported to believe that a renewed interest in the group’s message has arisen.¹⁷⁸ However, many of the articles also report that the membership in some

¹⁷⁴ “100 Years Later, Temperance Union Fights On,” *Hutchinson Press* (Hutchinson, KS), September 10, 2012.

¹⁷⁵ *The General Property Tax Act 206 of 1983*, HR Res. 4319, 2013. Sess. of 2009 (Michigan March 28, 2013)

¹⁷⁶ Warner Todd Huston, “Assoc. Press Now Pushing Anti-Scott Walker Story About Beer?” *Publius Forum* (Chicago, IL), June 13, 2012.

¹⁷⁷ “100 Years Later, Temperance Union Fights On.”

¹⁷⁸ *Ibid.*

areas has dropped so low that local chapters cannot be maintained.¹⁷⁹ Overall, reports of membership appear to reflect the decline in numbers which the WCTU has continued to experience in the decades since the repeal of national Prohibition.

Continuity

The pledge which women must take in order to become members of the WCTU has not changed since it was first established in 1874.¹⁸⁰ In the 140 years since the organization's inception, many of the issues and tactics of the WCTU have remained the same. On a national, state, and local level the group continues to give significant weight to public education, especially that of children and young adults. Signal Press publishes informational pamphlets for all age groups, and the Union offers educational outreach, including coloring and poster creation competitions for students from kindergarten through 12th grade.¹⁸¹ Furthermore, like Helen Tyler in 1949 and Ruth Tooze in the 1970's, the WCTU maintains a positive view of national Prohibition. The national vice president, Bunny Galladora, interviewed in March of 2013 is reported to have claimed that Prohibition was a success.¹⁸² According to Galladora, Prohibition caused many social problems to disappear, and jails and hospitals shut down due to lack of criminals and patients.¹⁸³

The WCTU also still abides by several of the innovations introduced by Frances Willard during her tenure as national president. The Union currently practices the "do-everything

¹⁷⁹ Kelley Bouchard, "Back on the Wagon: A Saco Couple Steps Up to Rebuild the Woman's Christian Temperance Union in Maine," *Portland Press Herald* (Portland, MN), October 10, 2011.

¹⁸⁰ "Woman's Christian Temperance Union Pledge," *Woman's Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 18, 2013, <http://www.wctu.org/wctu.html>.

¹⁸¹ "Children & Youth," *Woman's Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 18, 2013, <http://www.wctu.org/youth.html>.

¹⁸² "Prohibition Lives on in New Jersey Town," *Agence France Presse*, March 9, 2013.

¹⁸³ *Ibid.*

policy,” believing in the related nature of social problems. Especially at a national level, the WCTU still highlights temperance reform, but is also involved in raising awareness of several other issues. Like the women of the early twentieth century the modern WCTU is involved in the education and research of the negative effects involved with the use of tobacco and narcotics. The Union, however, has also expanded its concern to cover pornography and gambling.¹⁸⁴ Local and state chapters, in contrast, emphasize what they perceive as the negative social effects of abortion, premarital sex, homosexuality, and government encroachment on religious liberties.¹⁸⁵ This localized emphasis reflects the slow shift of Union membership toward a more conservative political and religious ideology that began in the 1960’s. The modern WCTU, now more than ever, holds an extremely conservative view of what Christian practice and behavior should resemble in America. However, the order of priority for different social ills given by unions on the local and state levels versus the order of priority given by the national organization reflects the autonomy which unions on the local and state level had in Willard’s era.

National and state websites, newspaper articles, and other sources all point to the continued centrality of religion to the Union. Unlike some organizations which have begun to downplay their Christian roots, such as the YMCA being rebranded “The Y,” the WCTU on their national homepage proudly displays their full title of Woman’s Christian Temperance Union.¹⁸⁶ The WCTU remains overtly Christian and non-denominational. In practice the group is nonsectarian, but, most members have historically been associated with Protestant denominations and current members largely come from evangelical and fundamentalist churches.

Although the modern WCTU resembles the organization of 1874, the Union has

¹⁸⁴ “National WCTU Issues of Concern,” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 13, 2013, <http://www.wctu.org/issues.html>.

¹⁸⁵ “WCTU of Maryland Issues of Concern.” *Maryland Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 13, 2013. <http://www.wctumd.org/issues.html>.

¹⁸⁶ “The Y,” *YMCA.net*, accessed April 18, 2013, <http://www.ymca.net/>.

experienced change. Due to outreach begun in the 1990's, the organization is slightly more racially diverse, but most members continue to be white, middle-class women. The group is also less religiously and politically diverse, aligning more fully with conservative evangelical Protestantism and conservative, right wing politics. The median age of members, as was indicated in newspaper articles from the 1990's, has risen. Most members, especially the leadership of the organization, are retirement age and older. Despite these changes, the WCTU has remained a woman-led, woman-organized, and woman-focused organization, and continues today to offer men honorary, no vote, affiliation.

The Modern World WCTU

The contemporary World WCTU is active in all inhabited continents in the world, with affiliated groups in nine countries: Australia, England, Canada, Finland, Germany, Japan, Korea, Norway, and the United States of America. Much like the contemporary WCTU, the World WCTU continues to be a women-only, Christian organization focused on promoting temperance. Also like its American affiliate, the WWCTU has begun to incorporate educational and political outreach concerning controlled substances. The group's mission statement, displayed prominently on their website, proclaims that "the WWCTU promotes a drug-free lifestyle and Christian values for the home and community."¹⁸⁷ However, unlike many of the local and state WCTU websites, the WWCTU website does not detail what these Christian values entail. Instead, they are left open to individual interpretation. The WWCTU membership pledge is also much more individualistic than the WCTU's:

WCTU: "That I may give my best service to home and country, I promise, God helping me, not to buy, drink, sell, or give alcoholic liquors while I live. From other drugs and

¹⁸⁷ "About Us," *World Woman's Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 2, 2014, <http://www.wwctu.com/>.

tobacco I'll abstain, and never take God's name in vain.”¹⁸⁸

World WCTU: “I promise, with God’s help, to abstain from alcohol, tobacco, and all other harmful drugs.”¹⁸⁹

In contrast with the WCTU, the WWCTU emphasizes a personal commitment to abstinence rather than commitment to instilling that belief in others. Likewise, the WWCTU also highlights the non-partisan, non-denominational, and individual commitment to total abstinence directly on their homepage while the WCTU’s homepage focuses on the historical roots of the organization.¹⁹⁰ Through examination of World WCTU literature and websites, the WWCTU appears to have a more open and individualistic view of Christianity than the conservative political and religious Christianity promoted by the WCTU in the United States.

The sophistication of the World WCTU website, as well as many of the national sites in other countries, in comparison to the basic HTML of the WCTU’s also reflects the World Union’s continued success where the WCTU in the United States falters. According to Desiree Lanigan, the World Organization Secretary, the WWCTU boasts 20,000 adult memberships globally, a number that easily surpasses the WCTU’s estimated 5,000 members. In Korea, Japan, and other Asian countries, numbers for the group appear to rise annually, with excellent multilingual websites and resources.¹⁹¹ Although the age-range of the members of the WWCTU is difficult to establish based on informal pictures across the WWCTU’s and other affiliate websites, the median age of members seems significantly younger than in the WCTU in the

¹⁸⁸ “Loyal Temperance Legion Pledge,” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 2, 2014, <http://wctu.com/ltl.html>.

¹⁸⁹ “About Us,” *World Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 2, 2014, <http://www.wwctu.com/>.

¹⁹⁰ “About Us,” *World Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 2, 2014, <http://www.wwctu.com/>.

¹⁹⁰ “Welcome to the WCTU,” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 2, 2014, <http://wctu.com/index.html>.

¹⁹¹ “Welcome to Korea Women’s Christian Temperance Union,” *Korea Women’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 2, 2014, <http://www.kwctu.org/>.

United States, featuring women in their twenties and thirties with their young children.

The World WCTU leadership and membership is also notably more diverse than in the United States.¹⁹² The World WCTU currently has seventeen acting leaders, seven of whom are non-white.¹⁹³ In comparison, the WCTU has had fourteen acting presidents, all of whom are white.¹⁹⁴ The Australian WCTU, though small in comparison to the WCTU at 700 members, was deeply involved in the humanitarian defense of indigenous peoples in their home country and continues to be active in attempting to “eliminate color prejudice from the social life of the nation.”¹⁹⁵ Although the WCTU in the United States advocated against slavery and developed paths of involvement for African American members within the Union, this generally meant setting up separate chapters rather than racially integrating existing chapters. As a result, as the WWCTU has grown more diverse in its membership, the WCTU in the United States has remained predominantly white.

The Modern IOGT

The modern IOGT in the United States still faces many of the same struggles that it did initially after the repeal of Prohibition: dwindling numbers and meager political influence. Currently membership is about 300 nationwide, with groups in Seattle, Los Angeles, Minneapolis, Chicago, and Connecticut.¹⁹⁶ The national, basic HTML website states that the

¹⁹² “Current World Leaders,” *World Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed March 10, 2014, <http://www.wwctu.com/pages/leaders1.html>.

¹⁹³ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁴ “National Presidents,” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 2, 2014, <http://wctu.com/national.html>.

¹⁹⁵ Glenda Amos, e-mail message to author, February 5, 2014.

¹⁹⁵ A. Holland, “To Eliminate Colour Prejudice: The WCTU and Decolonisation in Australia,” *Journal of Religious History*, 32 (2008): 256–276.

¹⁹⁶ Vickie Bakken, e-mail message to author, February 19, 2014.

group retains twenty-one lodges in the United States.¹⁹⁷ The IOGT continues to publish the *National Good Templar Newsletter* eight times a year and provide scholarship to individuals who have been a member of the organization for two or more years. The IOGT in the US also continues to stress that it does not distinguish between race, color, creed, or sex.¹⁹⁸ This statement appears to be reflected in terms of leadership, with women as both the national president and vice-president; however, it is difficult to determine the racial makeup of the organization's current leadership, because leaders are listed only by first name and last initial. Further personal information about leadership of the IOGT in the United States is not made publicly available to inquirers. The organization's website also emphasizes that as others are beginning to recognize the "alcohol problem," it in no way renders the organization obsolete, a difficulty the group faced with the passage of Prohibition.¹⁹⁹ Despite the group's belief that the problem of alcohol use is beginning to garner more attention, the IOGT-USA continues to receive very little press coverage, even locally.

One of the largest differences between the modern IOGT-USA and the IOGT of 1852 is its lack of religious affiliation. Although the United States website highlights the need for familial and social responsibility, something its international counterpart does not do, it makes no mention of its Christian roots.²⁰⁰ In this sense, the group truly lives up to its promise of recognizing no difference based on creed; however, since the religious affiliation of the leadership is not publicized, it is difficult to assert whether equality within the group is actually practiced or if it is simply theoretical. Regardless, the group within the United States continues to suffer from declining membership and is even acknowledged by the Prohibition Party of

¹⁹⁷ "Map of the IOGT in the US," *IOGT.us*, accessed April 2, 2014, <http://www.iogt.us/iogt.php?p=0>.

¹⁹⁸ "Welcome to IOGT-USA," *IOGT.us*, accessed April 2, 2014, <http://www.iogt.us/index.php>.

¹⁹⁹ *Ibid.*

²⁰⁰ *Ibid.*

America as having “a very small presence today.”²⁰¹

The Modern IOGT International

The modern IOGT International retains many similarities with its United States affiliate and with the IOGT of the past. The group maintains the centrality of equality among its members, going farther than the US organization, saying that it strives to gather together “people of all ages regardless of gender, color, nationality, creed, social position or political persuasion” in pursuit of an alcohol and drug free lifestyle.²⁰² In 1992, the group had over three and a half million members worldwide, and currently boasts 116 member organizations in 58 countries.²⁰³ In October 2014, the group will hold its 68th world congress and present an updated membership inventory.

Since the end of WWII, the IOGT International has developed a program very similar to Frances Willard’s “Do-Everything Policy.” The group not only advocates for an alcohol and drug-free lifestyle, but works for peace on both an individual and political level worldwide.²⁰⁴ The group also assists in other humanitarian efforts including advocating for women and gay rights, providing support for “refugees, war victims, and street children, as well as spearheading sustainable development projects.”²⁰⁵ The group has shed both its religious affiliation and its early “fraternal trappings” to become a modern service organization with an informative international website and a large, far-reaching political and social presence. The group is especially successful and active in Scandinavia, something that is reflected in the

²⁰¹ “Organizations with Similar Interests,” *The Prohibition Party*, accessed March 10, 2014, http://www.prohibitionists.org/Related_Orgs/related_orgs.html.

²⁰² “IOGT International Constitution,” *IOGT.org*, accessed April 2, 2014, http://www.iogt.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/Constitution_Basel_logo.pdf.

²⁰³ David M. Fahey, *Temperance & Racism*, 15.

²⁰³ Maik Dunnbier, e-mail message to author, February 3, 2014.

²⁰⁴ *Ibid.*

²⁰⁵ Mark Lawrence Schrad, *The Political Power of Bad Ideas*, 59.

disproportionate amount of leadership from Scandinavian countries.

Modern WCTU and IOGT: Similarities, Differences, Triumphs, and Trials

Just as with their earlier incarnations, the contemporary WCTU and IOGT share striking similarities. They both remain committed to promoting the temperance cause worldwide and have expanded their purview to include the exclusion of drugs and other controlled substances from a healthy lifestyle. The groups have shared similar triumphs. The IOGT and the WCTU remain two of the most successful and longest lasting temperance organizations both in the United States and the world. Each group continues to strive for the cure of social ills and for the rights of women and children. Likewise, both organizations have experienced similar difficulties, especially within the United States. Racial makeup and relations of both groups is still problematic. Though each group dealt with the Civil War and ensuing racial tensions differently, the stateside organizations still struggle with waning membership and a lack of racial diversity. Both groups also continue to combat incredulous or even non-existent national news coverage of their organizations, and they continue to suffer from their association with failed national Prohibition. However, despite these many similarities, it is by examining the difference not only between the organizations themselves, but between the international and national contingents within each group, that the true difficulties and successes of each group can be observed.

First, the difference between the world organizations and their national, United States affiliates must be discussed. The international branches of both organizations are experiencing greater success than their national counterparts both in political clout and in membership numbers. Additionally, the international websites and the country websites for both the IOGT International and the WWCTU are much more aesthetically appealing and content rich than the United States websites. The WCTU Korea webpage even offers site information in both Korean

and English. Another difference between the international organizations and the national organizations is the emphasis on individuality versus the emphasis on social moral suasion. Both the IOGT International and the World WCTU highlight the importance of personal abstinence from alcohol, while the WCTU and IOGT-USA both stress the centrality of creating safe community and family life through encouragement of others to refrain from alcohol and drug use. The racial, political, and age makeup of both groups within the United States also appears to be much less diverse than on the international level. This lack of diversity within the national organization reflects the racial tensions that both groups still experience.

Second, the differences between the IOGT as a whole and the WCTU as a whole must be observed. The IOGT, since the repeal of Prohibition and the end of WWII, has enjoyed greater membership numbers, as well as higher social and political influence. The IOGT and the WCTU also differ greatly in that the WCTU has retained the centrality of Christianity within the organization while the IOGT no longer professes an affiliation with any organized religion. Whereas the WCTU, nearly from its inception, was involved in taking on a variety of social ills, it is only since the end of WWII that the IOGT has done the same. Lastly, the IOGT International experienced more equality of power with its American counterpart from the outset of the organization than the World WCTU experienced in relation to the WCTU in the United States.

Conclusion

Problems facing American Temperance Groups vs. International Organizations

Both the WCTU and the IOGT in the United States are struggling in terms of membership, as well as social and political influence in comparison with their international counterparts. Why this is occurring becomes clearer after examining what the international organizations are getting right: positive race relations, effective use of modern technology,

opportunities for women, and emphasis on individual commitment.

First, the IOGT International and the World WCTU do not struggle with some of the same racial tensions that the American organizations do. Although both groups dealt with the issue in very different ways, the lasting effect of the Civil War and the ensuing racial segregation in America has handicapped both groups' efforts to expand and diversify their membership base. In contrast, the international organizations, suffering much less from these associations are free to bring their messages worldwide and create racially integrated new lodges or chapters rather than simply establishing separate organizations for white members and members of other races. The Grand Lodge of England's advocacy for equality among races within the organization has also lent the IOGT International an air of openness and tolerance that its American counterpart lacks. In terms of the WCTU, the World WCTU has been very successful in following the pathways of Christian missionizing throughout the world. The WCTU in the United States has become increasingly uniform while the country has become increasingly ethnically heterogeneous and has failed to adequately address inequality issues within its membership. Lack of diversity and ability to attract new members from other ethnic groups has repeatedly stymied both groups' membership growth stateside.

Second, both the IOGT International and the World WCTU have done a much better job of integrating modern technologies into their campaigns effectively in order to make themselves accessible to younger generations. In contrast to the groups in the United States, the websites and resources offered by the international groups and by various other affiliated countries are easily navigable, inviting, and informative. This shortcoming is recognized by the IOGT-USA in their "Short-term Goals" section, where they state that the group hopes to improve their "utilization of the Internet for all Chapters to increase accessibility of information thereby increasing

communications within the Organization.”²⁰⁶ Despite this, in the past year no changes have been made either to the website or to the resources offered by the stateside group. The WCTU in the United States has not acknowledged any problem with the current formatting of their site, while continuing to bemoan the rising median age of their membership. Both the IOGT International and the WCTU in the United States have Twitter accounts. Several other affiliated countries for both groups also have Twitter accounts, while the IOGT-USA has no Twitter account. However, the WCTU has only thirteen followers and has made no tweets while the IOGT International account has 902 followers with 6,842 tweets.²⁰⁷ As with the IOGT-USA’s short-term goal to improve their online presence, the WCTU Twitter account is a nod toward the idea that the WCTU needs to improve its online fluency and reach; however, a lack of tweets and followers points to the idea that, like the IOGT-USA, the WCTU recognizes the potential importance of social media and the Internet, but has done little to improve their online presence. Overall, the WCTU and the IOGT in the United States are both trailing their international partners in technological fluency. This lack of technological fluency by the stateside groups has limited their ability to expand the reach and accessibility of their message, as well as limiting their opportunities to attract more technologically knowledgeable or interested individuals.

Third, the IOGT International and the World WCTU offer women leadership roles and political involvement that they would not otherwise enjoy. Women, especially in the United States, have opportunities for leadership and political involvement that they did not receive at the time of the organizations’ initial founding. American women comprised forty-seven percent of the work force as of the 2010 United States census, while the percentage of non-working,

²⁰⁶ “Council: Central States Regional,” *IOGT.us*, accessed April 2, 2014, <http://www.iogt.us/iogt.php?p=2>.

²⁰⁷ Annie Wittenmeyer, Twitter account, April 6, 2014. https://twitter.com/WCTU_Official.

²⁰⁷ IOGT International, Twitter account, April 6, 2014. <https://twitter.com/IOGTInt>.

middle-class women decreased.²⁰⁸ American women also hold high-level positions in the political arena unavailable to them in previous decades. The American WCTU and IOGT no longer serve as outlets for women unable to express themselves in the public sphere in any other way. The international branches of the WCTU and the IOGT, however, still serve this purpose in many countries. As such, they garner membership wishing to expand the roles of women in the public sphere in a socially acceptable manner, through temperance advocacy. This is especially true in India and South Korea, where membership numbers for both groups continue to rise annually.²⁰⁹

Last, the international branches of both organizations emphasize a personal commitment to temperance within the lives of individual members. In contrast, the WCTU and the IOGT-USA comment repeatedly on the importance of swaying the opinion of families, communities, and the country as a whole. Although the WWCTU does state that it strives to promote “Christian values for the home and the community,” the group makes no specific statements concerning what or whose Christian values should be enforced.²¹⁰ In contrast, both the national website and local, state websites of the WCTU mention specific prohibitions on divorce, pornography, and homosexuality. These statements and prohibitions align with a more conservative form of Christianity than those professed by the WWCTU. Likewise, the IOGT-USA seems to be much more community than individually oriented in terms of moral and social life. Both groups profess to make no distinction based on race, color, creed, or sex; however, IOGT International expands this list to include no exclusions based on sexual orientation. The

²⁰⁸ “Women’s Bureau,” *United States Department of Labor*, accessed April 20, 2014, <http://www.dol.gov/wb/factsheets/Qf-laborforce-10.html>.

²⁰⁹ “World Map,” World Woman’s Christian Temperance Union, accessed April 20, 2014, <http://wwctu.com/MAPIT/map.swf>.

²⁰⁹ “Asia,” IOGT.org, accessed April 20, 2014, <http://www.iogt.org/blog/region/asia/>.

²¹⁰ “About Us,” *World Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 6, 2014, <http://www.wwctu.com/>.

international branch of each organization is more focused on the personal renunciation of alcohol and drugs by individual members, while the branches in the United States both focus on persuading family and community members of a particular set of morals along with the pledge not to drink alcoholic beverages or use drugs.

Despite the successes of both international groups, including their positive race relations, effective use of modern technology, and their emphasis on individual commitment which has helped gain both organizations a broader membership than their stateside affiliates, the IOGT as whole continues to be more successful both in terms of membership and in terms of political and social influence. By contrasting the two groups, the successful practices of the IOGT are brought to light, while the aspects which limit the WCTU, especially stateside, are brought into focus.

Problems Facing the WCTU vs. the IOGT

Since the repeal of the Eighteenth Amendment, the WCTU, especially in the United States, has experienced a decline in membership that may eventually cause the “oldest voluntary, non-sectarian woman's organization in continuous existence” to disband.²¹¹ Despite outreach to youth, the median age of members has steadily increased while local unions have been forced to close when a leader dies. Reports from newspapers and state websites suggest that members of the WCTU perceive their decline in membership and outreach to be a result of a rise in drinking culture and a deterioration of public morals; however, in 1874, when the WCTU was founded the original members found themselves combatting an arguably stronger drinking culture and were often satirized or portrayed negatively in newspaper comics and reports.²¹² Likewise, the IOGT's

²¹¹ “Welcome to the WCTU,” *Woman's Christian Temperance Union*, accessed April 18, 2013. <http://www.wctu.org/index.html>.

²¹² Maria Sudekum Fisher, “Town of Liquor Foe Carry Nation Oks Sunday Sales.” *Associated Press Kansas City* (Kansas City, MO), December 2, 2011.

²¹² “Well You Can't Please Everyone,” *The Hotline*, June 13, 2012.

²¹² Peterson, Franklynn. “Here's Looking at You, WCTU.”

success internationally points to the idea that temperance work both in America and worldwide is not as contentious an issue as the members of the WCTU tout it as being. The WCTU's own understanding of their dwindling numbers as a result of changing social mores, which is often adopted by both scholars and the public, is an overly simplistic stance and is not in itself sufficient to explain their decline. Rather, it is more likely that a combination of factors have contributed to the WCTU's failure to gain new members and retain former members. By comparing the continued success of the IOGT International with the struggles of the WCTU to gain new membership or political influence, the more complex factors behind the WCTU's struggles are illuminated.

In the 1880's, when Frances Willard introduced the "do-everything policy" and autonomy of local unions, WCTU membership was growing steadily and the Union was slowly reaching out into "every phase of rural or urban life"²¹³ Today, the organization employs the same tactics, but with highly different results. Potential members of the WCTU who are drawn to the temperance message, along with groups like Mothers' Against Drunk Drivers, who might support the Union in other circumstances, may be driven away by the highlighting of other issues, such as homosexuality, by local and state chapters. The WCTU has never been an entirely single-issue organization. At its inception and throughout its early years, the main focus was always on temperance education and reform, but a brief scan of any of the state level websites point to a different agenda. Advocates of temperance reform may be off put by the seeming centrality of issues such as abortion, homosexuality, divorce, and pornography to the program of WCTU state unions. It would be erroneous to state that the WCTU has become less and less aligned with mainstream social and political views, recalling that the group has always been

²¹²Thomas R. Pegram, *Battling Demon Rum*, Chapter 3.

²¹³Helen Tyler, *Where Prayer and Purpose Meet*, 55.

lampooned for its strict adherence to temperance and its early support of women's suffrage. Rather, while the IOGT has retained its inclusive policies and has continued to attract members from a variety of social and political spheres, the WCTU has become increasingly aligned with the social and political right. Other conservative Christian groups, however, such as the Moral Majority, were successful in recruiting members while espousing the same views, so the focus by local chapters on other politically charged issues beyond temperance is not enough, in itself, to explain the WCTU's loss of popularity.

The makeup of the membership of the WCTU has, throughout its history, been very homogeneous. Most members have been Protestant, white, middle-class, middle-aged women. Education and outreach has largely been directed at children, young adults, and the lower "drinking" classes. There has been little outreach to non-white Christians on an equal plane with white Christians. The lack of racial integration of unions following emancipation, along with the clear emphasis on the supremacy of the American WCTU after the establishment of WWCTU, has hindered the group's later outreach to other ethnic groups. This lack of outreach to potentially interested individuals is an oversight by the group. Ethnic minorities are predicted to become the majority of the population of the United States by 2050.²¹⁴ The WWCTU had success in attracting membership worldwide, partially due to the pathways opened to them by earlier Christian missionaries in those areas, but the group has continued difficulties with a largely racially homogeneous membership and continued racial tensions, especially within the United States. In contrast, the early schism within the IOGT and the reinforcement of equality within the group, allows the IOGT, particularly their international branch, to attract not just women but also an ethnically diverse membership. Likewise, the early independence of the

²¹⁴ Paul Taylor and D'Vera Cohn, "A Milestone En Route to a Majority Minority Nation," *Pew Social and Demographic Trends*, Pew Research Center, 7 Nov. 2012. Web. 02 Dec. 2012.

IOGT International from its parent organization IOGT-USA allowed for a more diverse foundation of support that caused the group to be more enduring and resilient to local or national disputes. Overall, the IOGT remains “lighter on their feet” than the WCTU in diversity of membership, within local groups and in terms of international hierarchy.²¹⁵ Lack of lightness on the part of the WCTU hinders their ability to recruit and retain membership both nationally and internationally.

As the WCTU has become more conservative politically, it has also become more conservative religiously. Despite the pan-denominational makeup of the early group, the WCTU has become more and more religiously homogeneous. Most members are drawn from conservative or fundamentalist Protestant denominations and churches. The shift by the national group toward advocating for stricter divorce, an anti-homosexuality stance, and outlawing abortion beginning in the latter half of the twentieth century reflects this growing conservatism. It would be a mistake, however, to assume that the very Christian nature of the group is an instrument of its decline. Rather it is the increasingly limited construction by the group of what it means to be Christian, particularly a very conservative social and political Christianity, that limits their outreach and membership. The WCTU does not approach Christians of other denominations, such as Latter Day Saints, who might be open to the temperance cause because they do not fall within the group’s construction of Christianity. This lack of outreach to potentially interested individuals is, once again, an oversight by the group. As of 2008, Latter Day Saints or Mormons made up 2% of the U.S. adult population who self-identify as religious.²¹⁶ Strict adherence to Mormon teaching prohibits the use of alcohol, tobacco and

²¹⁵ Mark Lawrence Schrad, *The Political Power of Bad Ideas*, 59.

²¹⁶ Luis Lugo, et al. *U.S. Religious Landscape Survey*, Pew Research Center, Washington, DC: 2008.

illegal drugs.²¹⁷ Much of the teachings of the LDS Church are in line with the issues central to the WCTU. By overlooking these groups, and instead focusing solely on youth education and outreach, the WCTU misses out on a great deal of potential support and membership. In comparison the non-partisan, non-sectarian nature of the IOGT allows for outreach to a variety of Christian groups worldwide.

A final problem for the modern WCTU is the continuing insistence by national leadership concerning the success of Prohibition. Contemporary newspaper reports range in their perception of Prohibition, but are overwhelmingly negative.²¹⁸ Presidents of the WCTU have repeatedly reported to interviewers that the years of Prohibition were some of the best in American history.²¹⁹ This inability to address the crime and enforcement issues which arose during this era makes it difficult for non-members to understand how the WCTU can be effective in modern America. In contrast, the IOGT has attempted to distance itself from Prohibition, and has turned back to lobbying for legislation and education on a local and state level. By addressing the problems faced during nationwide Prohibition rather than unilaterally praising the Eighteenth Amendment, the WCTU might be better able to reach a wider audience.

The Future of Temperance Work in America and Internationally

The WCTU is a mixture of progressive attitudes toward female leadership and conservative social mores. The Union, though it took time to support issues such as women's suffrage or the Equal Rights Amendment, is led, funded, and organized by women. Likewise, the IOGT, though in practice true equality for all members took many years to establish, was the first

²¹⁷ "God's Commandments," *The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints*, accessed on April 18, 2013, <http://mormon.org/commandments>.

²¹⁸ Warner Todd Huston, "Assoc. Press Now Pushing Anti-Scott Walker Story About Beer?" *Publius Forum*, June 13, 2012.

²¹⁸ "Prohibition Lives on in New Jersey Town," *Agence France Presse*, 9 March, 2013.

²¹⁹ Franklynn Peterson, "Here's Looking at You, WCTU."

fraternal organization to allow female and African American members on equal footing with white males. The WCTU should be lauded for its strict maintenance of female centrality throughout its history, while the IOGT should be commended for its adherence to equality even during turbulent historical events. Nevertheless, the WCTU and the IOGT have both been in decline in the United States since the mid-twentieth century and have experienced difficulty in appealing to the wider population of the United States for the past several decades. Although the “do-everything policy” and local autonomy of WCTU groups assisted in the organization’s initial growth, it seems that these tactics are now contributing to the Union’s collapse. These methods, along with little outreach to minority populations, a narrow view of Christianity, and the inability to address the negative aspects of Prohibition may also lead to the WCTU’s disbanding due to lack of membership in the next few decades. In contrast, the IOGT International and the World WCTU have had fewer difficulties in rebuilding membership and political and social influence due to their more positive race relations, their effective use of modern technology, and their emphasis on individual temperance. Overall, the IOGT International’s emphasis on equality, expansion, and diversity allows for a greater longevity and enduring resilience that neither the WCTU nor the WWCTU enjoys. The WCTU’s legacy in the social and political arenas should not be forgotten. Unless outreach to racial minorities, as well as other Christian groups, and a re-emphasis on the centrality of temperance to the Union as a whole occurs, the WCTU will be forced to disband due to lack of membership within the next few decades.

Bibliography

- “100 Years Later, Temperance Union Fights On.” *Hutchinson Press* (Hutchinson, KS), September 10, 2012.
- “About NFIA.” *National Families in Action*. Accessed 18 April, 2013.
<http://www.nationalfamilies.org/about.html>.
- “About Us.” *World Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 2, 2014.
<http://www.wwctu.com/>.
- Adams, R.N. *The Origin and History of Good Templary, With an Exposition of its Principles and Objects*. Dunedin, NZ: H. Wise & Co., 1876.
- “Bill to Keep Liquor Off Air Is Argued.” *Washington Post*. Feb 1, 1952.
- Blocker Jr., Jack S. “Give to the Winds Thy Fears”: *The Women’s Temperance Crusade, 1873-1874*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1985.
- Bouchard, Kelley. “Back on the Wagon: A Saco Couple Steps Up to Rebuild the Woman’s Christian Temperance Union in Maine.” *Portland Press Herald* (Portland, MN), October 10, 2011.
- “Children & Youth.” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 18, 2013.
<http://www.wctu.org/youth.html>.
- “Council: Central States Regional.” *IOGT.us*. Accessed April 2, 2014.
<http://www.iogt.us/iogt.php?p=2>.
- “Current World Leaders.” *World Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed March 10, 2014. <http://www.wwctu.com/pages/leaders1.html>.
- Dodson, Marcida. “The WCTU: Forgotten But Not Gone: With Song and Prayer, Century-Old Crusade Against Drink Lives Largely Forgotten but Far From Gone.” *Los Angeles Times*, April 23, 1978.
- Fahey, David M. *Temperance & Racism: John Bull, Johnny Reb, and the Good Templars*. Lexington, KY: University Press of Kentucky, 1996.
- Fisher, Maria Sudekum. “Town of Liquor Foe Carry Nation Oks Sunday Sales.” *Associated Press Kansas City* (Kansas City, MO), December 2, 2011.
- “Friends of WCTU.” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 18, 2013.
<http://www.wctu.org/friends.html>.

- “God’s Commandments.” *The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints*. Accessed on April 18, 2013. <http://mormon.org/commandments>.
- “Good Templars of World Will Convene Here.” *Chicago Daily Tribune*. June 10, 1951.
- “Good Templars' Order To Convene June 24.” *Washington Post*. June 20, 1948.
- Gusfield, Joseph R. “Social Structure and Moral Reform: A Study of the Woman’s Christian Temperance Union.” *American Journal of Sociology* 61, No. 3 (1955): 231.
- “History.” *World Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed March 12, 2014. <http://www.wwctu.com/pages/history2.html>.
- “History of IOGT,” *IOGT.us*, accessed March 12, 2014, <http://www.iogt.us/iogt.php?p=35>.
- Holland, A. “To Eliminate Colour Prejudice: The WCTU and Decolonisation in Australia.” *Journal of Religious History*, 32 (2008): 256–276.
- Huston, Warner Todd. “Assoc. Press Now Pushing Anti-Scott Walker Story About Beer?” *Publius Forum* (Chicago, IL), June 13, 2012.
- “IOGT History.” *IOGT.org*. Accessed March 11, 2014. <http://www.iogt.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/History.pdf>.
- “IOGT International Constitution.” *IOGT.org*. Accessed April 2, 2014. http://www.iogt.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/06/Constitution_Basel_logo.pdf.
- Japenga, Ann. “WCTU Still Active, Still Caring: Operates Rest Home in Eagle Rock for Elderly.” *Los Angeles Times*, July 31, 1980.
- “Loyal Temperance Legion Pledge.” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 2, 2014. <http://wctu.com/ltl.html>.
- Lugo, Luis, et al. *U.S. Religious Landscape Survey*. Pew Research Center, Washington, DC: 2008.
- “Map of the IOGT in the US.” *IOGT.us*. Accessed April 2, 2014. <http://www.iogt.us/iogt.php?p=0>.
- Meyer, Eugene L. “WCTU, In Decline, Fights On: Despite Declining Numbers, WCTU Carries On.” *Washington Post*, October 18, 1981.

- “Mission & Work.” *National Association of Evangelicals*. Accessed March 11, 2014.
<http://www.nae.net/about-us/mission-statement>.
- “National Presidents.” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 2, 2014.
<http://wctu.com/national.html>.
- “National WCTU Issues of Concern.” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 13, 2013. <http://www.wctu.org/issues.html>.
- “National WCTU President.” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 14, 2013.
<http://www.wctu.org/tooze.html>.
- “Organizations with Similar Interests.” *The Prohibition Party*. Accessed March 10, 2014.
http://www.prohibitionists.org/Related_Orgs/related_orgs.html.
- Payne, Gordon H. *International Order of Good Templars: Birthplace, Early History, Important Dates, Platform, Songs, a Great Leader, Its Principles and Work*. Medina, NY: G. H. Payne, 1942.
- Pegram, Thomas R. *Battling Demon Rum: The Struggle for a Dry America, 1800-1933*. Chicago, IL: Ivan R. Dee, 1998.
- Pennock, Pamela E. "The Number One Social Problem of Our Time: American Protestants and temperance politics in the 1950s." *Journal Of Church And State* 54, no. 3 (2012): 375-405.
- Peterson, Franklynn. “Here’s Looking at You, WCTU: The Ghost of Carrie Nation Is Alive in Evanston and Still Crusading to Get America Back on the Wagon Again.” *Chicago Tribune*, March 21, 1971.
- “Prohibition Lives on in New Jersey Town.” *Agence France Presse*. March 9, 2013.
- Schrad, Mark Lawrence. *The Political Power of Bad Ideas: Networks, Institutions, and the Global Prohibition Wave*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.
- Smith, Alvin W. “Bring Back Prohibition!” *Union Signal*, 98 no. 6 (1972): 12-13.
- Taylor, Paul, and D’Vera Cohn. "A Milestone En Route to a Majority Minority Nation." *Pew Social and Demographic Trends*. Pew Research Center, 7 Nov. 2012. Web. 02 Dec. 2012.

“The Y.” YMCA.net. Accessed April 18, 2013. <http://www.ymca.net/>.

“Today’s Daughter.” *Union Signal*, (December 25, 1937): 5-6.

Tyler, Helen. *Where Prayer and Purpose Meet: The WCTU Story 1874-1949*. Illinois: The Signal Press, 1949.

Tyrell, Ian R. *Woman’s World/Woman’s Empire: The Woman’s Christian Temperance Union in International Perspective, 1800-1930*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1991.

Warren, Jenifer. “WCTU Now Speaks to Youth: Old Soldiers of Temperance Don’t Fade Away.” *Los Angeles Times*, October 6, 1983.

“WCTU of Maryland Issues of Concern.” *Maryland Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 13, 2013. <http://www.wctumd.org/issues.html>.

“Welcome to Korea Women’s Christian Temperance Union.” *Korea Women’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 2, 2014. <http://www.kwctu.org/>.

“Welcome to IOGT-USA.” *IOGT.us*. Accessed April 2, 2014. <http://www.iogt.us/index.php>.

“Welcome to the WCTU.” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 18, 2013. <http://www.wctu.org/index.html>.

“Well You Can’t Please Everyone.” *The Hotline*, June 13, 2012.

Woman’s Christian Temperance Union, Moncton Branch. *Hymns for Use in W.C.T.U Meetings*. Moncton, N.B., 1888.

“Woman’s Christian Temperance Union Pledge.” *Woman’s Christian Temperance Union*. Accessed April 18, 2013. <http://www.wctu.org/wctu.html>.

Van Breems, Arlene. “WCTU Takes Stand Against Legalization of Marijuana.” *Los Angeles Times*, September 9, 1970.