

Human Trafficking: Reframing Expectations

Heather Marie Thompson
Mechanicsville, Virginia

B.A. Foreign Affairs University of Virginia, 2017
B.A. Economics University of Virginia, 2017

A Thesis presented to the Graduate Faculty
of the University of Virginia in Candidacy for the Degree of
Master of Arts

Department of Religious Studies
Religion, Politics, and Conflict

University of Virginia
May, 2018

ABSTRACT: Human trafficking is an issue of great seriousness and unfortunately increasing frequency both domestically and abroad. While significant progress has been made in relation to the issue in recent decades, greater conceptual shifts will have to be made for this progress to continue in a climate of increasing polarization surrounding issues related to sex and women’s rights. This paper endeavors to a) identify the current trends of characterization of human trafficking victims b) make an argument as to why this current conceptualization is problematic, and c) present an alternate framework focused on a public health approach, using efforts in Atlanta to crystallize potential future pragmatic efforts in policy and legislation.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction	3
II. Background to Human Trafficking	4
A. Why Study Trafficking?	4
B. Definitions	6
C. Complications in Prostitution	8
D. Human Trafficking Statistics	9
E. Atlanta Statistics Specifically	10
F. Current Legislation	11
G. Groups Fighting Human Trafficking	13
III. The Current Framework: Real and Imagined Human Trafficking Victims	15
A. Resurgence of Trafficking as an Issue in the Public Sphere	15
B. The Iconic Victim and Misconceptions	16
C. Influence of Popular Media	17
D. The Victim in Reality	19
E. Christian Moral Imperative	22
F. Imagined Victimizer	25
IV. Current Insufficiencies: The Necessity of Changing Frameworks	26
A. Employing a Voluntourism Lense	26
B. Increasing Polarization	30
C. Intersectionality and Relevance of Factors Contributing to Trafficking Susceptibility	31
V. A New Public Health Oriented Approach	32
A. Defining a Public Health Approach	32
B. Why Public Health?	34
C. Problems with Alternative Approaches	37
D. Trauma-Based Public Health Approach	38
E. Cultural Competence	39
F. Importance of Inclusivity	41
G. Protocol Recommendations	43

VI. Applying a trauma-based Approach: Atlanta	45
VII. Contributing Issues: Privacy, The Internet and Biopower	47
A. Privacy	47
B. The Internet and Sexuality Redefined	48
C. Biopower	49
VIII. Conclusion	50
IX. Bibliography	54
Appendix A: Trafficking and Smuggling	64
Appendix B: Debates Regarding Prostitution	64
Appendix C: The Image of the Prostitute	66
Appendix D: Voluntourism, Definitions and History	67

“The swelling epidemic of human trafficking makes a mockery of the law and its protections”

- Missouri Attorney General Josh Hawley (Hawley 2017, 1)

I. INTRODUCTION

The trafficking of persons is an egregious affront to the general principles of rule of law, dignity, and basic human rights which is only growing in an increasingly globalized world, exposing new vulnerabilities and challenges which the state and public must rise to meet. Human trafficking has become a mainstream issue in the United States—similar to the war on drugs or the war on terror—due to a combination of a conservative cultural renaissance and greater conversation on sexual liberty. Although often viewed by the public as a problem exclusive to foreign countries, human trafficking is flourishing in the United States, and current efforts to stymie the cycle of trafficking frequently misdiagnose the issue. In order to best address this epidemic and truly understand the underlying vulnerabilities, a public health-based approach must be adopted. Important in this will be a shift and changing of narrative as policies work towards the national incorporation of the concept of trauma-informed health management and cultural competence programs. Better communication between law enforcement, FBOs, and the criminal justice system will also be required in order for this paradigm shift to be maximally effective.

Human trafficking lies at the nexus of a number of illicit trades and violent conflict. The goal of my capstone is to better understand and map out the necessary framework shift for success given the varying circumstances that lead to a high trafficking vulnerability. While

human trafficking has been addressed within the realm of current scholarship on a wider scale, I hope to add nuance to the current literature by focusing more intently on shifting expectations and the narratives of victimization to create a more inclusive protocol for addressing the problem of domestic sex trafficking and commercial sex exploitation.

II. BACKGROUND TO HUMAN TRAFFICKING

In order to appropriately scope this deep and troubling issue within the purview of a Master's level capstone project, I will begin the project by providing some background context to the issue. This includes the definitions which the project will be using going forward, as well as a statistical snapshot of the thrust of human trafficking in Atlanta, the United States, and internationally. Also briefed are anti-trafficking efforts and the various forms of current legislation attempting to address this issue.

A. WHY STUDY TRAFFICKING?

Human trafficking is a salient and unfortunately prevalent issue. It is estimated by the International Labour Organization that there are 20.9 million victims of human trafficking world-wide, amounting to estimates of 5.4 victims of modern slavery per thousand people in the world as of 2016 (ILO & WFF 2017, 6). In a video on May 9th of 2014, Boko Haram leader Abubakar Shekau spoke about potentially selling the 276 girls the group kidnapped from Chibok, saying that "There is a market for selling humans. Allah says I should sell. He commands me to sell. I will sell women" (Callimachi 2015, 1). Often times when mentioning human trafficking in the United States, this is the first type of trafficking that people will conceptualize. It is true that human trafficking lies at the nexus of violent conflict, drug trafficking, the sex trade, the refugee

crisis, and terrorism. It is, however, problematic that the idea of modern slavery is something that people frequently think of as happening exclusively in far away places. The reality of the situation is that it is also prevalent in our own backyard within the United States. The goal of my capstone is to make clear the threat of trafficking within the United States, elucidate the problems with current American conceptualizations of the trafficking issue, and present the case for a nationwide shift to a public health-oriented approach.

The international implications for this are wide-ranging. In recent decades, the United States has been looked to as a bellwether on the international stage, determining areas of focus and important policy initiative priorities. This has been demonstrated already in field of human trafficking by the recent increased attention the US government has given the issue on the international stage. For example, the Bush Administration post-2001 provided more than \$295 million in aid towards international anti-trafficking programs, and Trump has continued similar program expansions (White House 2004, 1 & White House, 2016). Although the focus of this capstone is domestic sex trafficking, how the United States chooses to approach human trafficking and the narrative set by the conversation occurring domestically has the potential, with the appropriate dialogue and engagement, to translate into broader reforms on the international level.

America's history of human trafficking is multifaceted. The country's complicated past with slavery as a state-supported institution and the continued racism following the Civil War into Reconstruction and perpetuated in the Jim Crow era are foundational in the development of key tenets of the current anti-trafficking 'abolitionist' movement as it functions today (Soderlund, 2005). However, in a deep irony, modern 'abolitionist' strategies often carry with

them biases which incidentally exclude racial and sexual minorities. The intersectionality of these issues and the need for inclusion of minority groups is a key priority which necessitates both greater attention to the human trafficking problem, as well as the framework shift towards public health which this capstone advocates.

B. DEFINITIONS

In order to elucidate this issue with any accuracy, it will first be necessary to set the parameters for the discussion via definitions. Historically, part of the problem with combating human trafficking is derived from the difficulty in determining what constitutes the various presentations of human trafficking. Since the analysis of this issue within the terms of this paper will be exclusive to the United States, primary references in determining these definitions will be the landmark legislation which has been passed centering around the issue, as is considered standard among modern scholarship on human trafficking (Clawson et. al 2009). The Trafficking Victims Protection Act passed by Congress in 2000 is largely considered to be a revolutionary piece of legislation in response to findings that the sex trafficking industry had been increasing in the United States for several decades (Helton 2016, 441). At the forefront of both domestic and international legislative efforts, the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 (TVPA) defines severe forms of trafficking in persons as:

- a. *Sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age; or*
- b. *The recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of*

subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery (8 U.S.C. § 1101).

Although this capstone centers on the United States, human trafficking—both sexual and labor—is obviously not limited in any sense to this domestic context. In many instances, trafficking rings will cross both state and national borders, further complicating jurisdictional issues in the apprehension of victimizers. Internationally speaking, the 2000 United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, defines trafficking in persons in Article 3 paragraph (a) as:

The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs (UNODC 2018).

For further clarification, the United Nations Trafficking in Persons Protocol also includes a list of purposes in defining exploitation as being “*at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.*” (Article 3, paragraph (a)).

There are also a number of less orthodox forms of trafficking which receive less attention than both sexual and labor trafficking, including “*victims compelled to act as beggars, forced into*

sham marriages, benefit fraud, pornography production, organ removal, among others"

(UNODC 2016). While important to consider, most prevalent in the United States are forced labor and sexual trafficking. Although these other forms of trafficking also deserve in-depth study, the focus of this paper will be exclusively sex trafficking given its ascension to public attention in the United States as elaborated upon in sections II.D & III.A. Additional distinctions regarding distinction between human trafficking and forms of smuggling can be found in Appendix A.

C. COMPLICATIONS IN PROSTITUTION

Another incredibly important distinction is that between human trafficking and prostitution. Prostitution has been described as the "oldest form of exploitation", where often the victim's status as a victim is minimized in a system sustained by the demand from users of such sexual services (Gutierrez 2014, 96). This distinction between trafficking and prostitution is one which has engendered a number of debates and has been approached different way by various interest groups throughout the course of history. Prostitution is often conflated with sexual exploitation, and the two are problematically not always considered as distinct acts within colloquial discourse. There is a longstanding debate on whether the act of prostitution is inherently a type of exploitation which must be eradicated regardless the desire of the sex worker or a profession which embodies female bodily empowerment and might consequently need greater formal regulation (Gutierrez 2014, 97). The issue of consent is a topic of discussion in all forms of trafficking and can be an important component of determining whether or not an event was an instance of trafficking or something else and thus how it should be prosecuted. Important to note is that for minors, the issue of consent within a human trafficking case is not

relevant for conviction under international standards (UNODC 2016, 15). Further discussion of the issue of prostitution and its conflation with human trafficking can be found in Appendix B.

D. HUMAN TRAFFICKING STATISTICS

It is notable that the majority of trafficking internationally is believed to be labour trafficking as opposed to sex trafficking. An ILO (International Labour Organization) report from 2014 found that human traffickers earn profits of roughly \$150 billion a year, making sexual exploitation a problematically profitable industry (ILO 2014). A 2017 report estimates 24.9 million victims globally trapped in some form of modern-day slavery (ILO & WFF 2017, 9). The estimated breakdown of such trafficking victims is that 68% are trapped in forced labor, with 26% of the total being children and 55% being women and girls according to the Polaris Project (ILO & WFF 2017, 4). In fact, labor trafficking is also estimated to make up the majority of human trafficking which occurs within the United States (Siller, 2017). However, despite this prevalence, focus has been unfairly shifted away from labor trafficking and more exclusively to the focus of sexual trafficking. This is due to both the difficulty of recognizing labor trafficking victims in an everyday context and the more overt christian values implicated in sexual trafficking.

This is not to say that sexual trafficking is not a significant and largely overlooked problem within the United States; it certainly is, and this omission within both policy and the broader public consciousness is why I believe a shifting of frameworks to an approach focused on public health factors and cultural competency is necessary. In the United States, the National Human Trafficking Hotline has received 178,971 signals, resulting in 40,200 cases since 2007. Of these, 26,557 cases were from 2017 alone, with 8,524 cases of trafficking reported (NHTH

2017, 1). The trafficking reported to such hotlines is primarily sex trafficking, with 71.34% of 2017 cases reported to the hotline dealing with sex trafficking, contrasted with 14.65% related to labor trafficking (NHTH 2017, 1).

While these are widely regarded within the anti-human trafficking community as acceptably accurate statistics, the nature of human trafficking is such that getting accurate estimations of victims is difficult and has resulted in a wide range of estimates from different groups (Richmond 2015). Some of the dearth of data is purely attributable to the fact that sex trafficking is illegal and thus making use of underground channels obscuring data for collection more generally speaking (Johnson et al. 2016, 3).

E. ATLANTA STATISTICS SPECIFICALLY

Atlanta has consistently ranked in the top major cities for the sex trade within the United States, with some reports naming it the city with the largest sex trade in the US between 2003 and 2007 (Belt 2014, 1). Atlanta is also notorious for its sex trade's profitability, with estimates that pimps can make an average of \$33,000 a week from street prostitution operations alone (Fuchs 2014, 1). The National Human Trafficking Hotline has identified 3,352 high-risk victims and 2,415 moderate-risk victims from calls in Georgia since 2017, with 276 human trafficking cases reported in 2017 (NHTH GA 2018, 1). Sex trafficking accounts for approximately 70% of these cases (NHTH GA 2018, 1).

Part of the appeal of Atlanta is the combination of the International Airport, the many well-known dense urban areas such as Fulton Industrial Boulevard, and the intersection of major highways including I-75, I-85, and I-285 (Fuchs 2014, 1). Atlanta is also a popular site for hosting conventions and events, bringing people into town with free time and high disposable

income (Deb 2014, 1). Atlanta also ranks highly among a number of factors generally understood to act as social predictors of an individual's likelihood of being trafficked; for example, Atlanta ranks highest in the United States among cities for percentage of children living in extreme poverty, as well as being a high-crime area with higher than national average rates of homelessness, housing instability, and educational inequalities (Johnson et al. 2016, 4). Atlanta is an ideal case study and testing ground for new programs to be implemented elsewhere given the challenges which the city presents.

F. CURRENT LEGISLATION

I will not comprehensively address all current legislation, but there are some particularly notable efforts which I would be remiss not to mention. Arguably the most significant and well known of recent legislation related to human trafficking in the United States would be the 2000 Trafficking Victims Protection Act, subsequently reauthorized four times in bipartisan efforts. There has also been significant legislation improving upon the initial framework for legal action as established by the TVPA. For example, the Uniform Act on Prevention of and Remedies for Human Trafficking drafted by the National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws expands the TVPA's use of the term "coercion" to better encapsulate mental, psychological, and emotional manipulation which the TVPA's narrow definition excludes (Helton 2016, 444). In addition to the TVPA, a wide variety of legislation has been considered and enacted approaching the issue from multiple sides (Srikantiah 2007, 159). Of particular note, currently in force is the mandatory restitution law 18 U.S.C. § 1593 which requires recovery of *"the full amount of the victim's losses"*, although it can be seen statistically that while the law has potential to bring significant benefit to victims, it remains underutilized (Levy et al. 2014, 2).

Recently, the Trump administration created the Interagency Task Force to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, as well as signed law S. 1536 the Combating Human Trafficking in Commercial Vehicles act and S. 1532 No Human Trafficking on Our Roads Act (Trump 2017, 1).

Looking specifically at Georgia, in 2011, House Bill 20: Georgia's Human Trafficking Law was passed, increasing penalties for trafficking, increasing training requirements for law enforcement, and taking steps towards shifting the view of exploited women as perpetrators rather than victims (Hansen 2015, 1). House Bill 141 in Georgia, enacted in 2013, requires certain types of businesses (e.g. hotels, motels, entertainment establishments, transit centers) to display information concerning the National Human Trafficking Resource Center Hotline and information for victims in both English and Spanish; however, enforcement of this law has been underwhelming at best (Boettinger 2016, 1). Safe Harbor laws are also another common form of legislation at the state level which have variably been adopted across the country which are generally designed to create funds dedicated to providing aid for victims (Boettinger 2016, 1).

In Atlanta specifically, there are a number of additional legislative efforts being undertaken to address both human trafficking generally speaking as well as factors specific to the high volume of trafficking in Atlanta. For example, the Hartsfield-Jackson Atlanta International Airport has implemented new protocols as of 2017 teaching airline employees in victim identification, as well as increasing awareness campaigns among fliers (Stokes 2017, 1). In addition, there are a number of current initiatives related to public health policy changes, which will be more thoroughly discussed in section V.F of this paper.

G. GROUPS FIGHTING HUMAN TRAFFICKING

The current effort to prevent and apprehend perpetrators of human trafficking in the United States is led by a combination of government organizations, law enforcement, private groups, NGOs, and FBOs which work on the issue from many perspectives with varying degrees of cooperation. In the United States particularly, many faith-based organizations and NGOs have taken up an increasing portion of the burden of anti-human trafficking relief and prevention efforts (Daniel-Hughes 2018, 1).

At the federal level, the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons within the Department of State leads the United States' global efforts to combat trafficking (Foot, 2016). The 2004 charter for the Human Smuggling and Trafficking Center works to bring together representatives from a number of fields to combat trafficking in its variety of forms, marking a significant step forward in the promotion of such interdisciplinary coordination (White House 2004, 1). There is a recognized need within current literature that better coordination between fields, disciplines, and organizations will be necessary in the coming year in order to increase standards of care (Foot, 2016). However, there is not a general consensus on exactly what the structure of this collaboration should look like, the degree of coordination, or the ideal policy implementation in order to reach these more abstract goals.

The city of Atlanta specifically is divided into distinct neighborhoods called neighborhood planning units (NPU) which each have leadership representing those units at city council meetings, with a number of groups targeting specific neighborhoods units with high risk factors in their analysis. Brookhaven in 2014 became the first city in Georgia in response to such reports to join the "Not Buying It" pledge sponsored by the Georgia's Task Force on the

Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children, committing to engaging in efforts to train city officials and community members on issues of recognition and advocacy (Johnson et al. 2016, 9). Tim Echols, a Republican who has served as a Public Service Commissioner since January of 2011, has been at the forefront of anti-trafficking efforts in Georgia, creating the "Unholy Tour" in an effort to bring the issue of sex trafficking to the attention of lawmakers in a more salient and personal way (Echols 2018, 1).

There are certainly a number of organizations more prominently recognized as leaders of anti-trafficking in Atlanta and which professionals in various fields will refer victims to based on the specific needs of the victim and the specialization of the different organizations. These include (but are certainly not limited to) georgiacares, which focuses on Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking (DMST), Haven Atlanta, which focuses on Commercial Sexual Exploitation (CSE), Out of Darkness, which focuses on adult domestic CSE victims, Wellspring Living, which focuses on residential programs for minor and adult CSE victims, and Tapestri, which focuses on assistance for international victims (Georgia Courts 2015, 1). Lobby Day is an annual event that brings together anti-trafficking groups in the Atlanta area to stand with community members, legislators, and advocates to support legislative efforts which are designed to protect victims of DMST and work towards finding solutions (georgiacares 2018, 1). Lobby day brings together many of the above organizations, with georgiacares, Out of Darkness, Street Grace, Wellspring Living, House of Cherith, United Way of Greater Atlanta, and The Freedom Coalition all playing a prominent role (georgiacares 2018). This event epitomizes the more general trend towards cooperation among the NGOs and FBOs of Atlanta based upon the resources and specific focus of each organization.

III. THE CURRENT FRAMEWORK: REAL AND IMAGINED HUMAN TRAFFICKING VICTIMS

I argue that the current framework being used by many organizations that play an important role in anti-trafficking efforts creates a typified image of the human trafficking victim which is ultimately exclusionary, whereas a public health approach would be more expansive. Although the positive work of many organizations utilizing such an approach should not be minimized, in order for more comprehensive solutions to take hold on a national scale, this will need to be changed. First, I will review the evidence of how human trafficking has suddenly become an issue of greater public awareness and the evidence that the resultant efforts to eradicate it have taken on these problematic tropes and images.

A. RESURGENCE OF TRAFFICKING AS AN ISSUE IN THE PUBLIC SPHERE

The issue of human trafficking has had a resurgence in the American public imagination and has been marketed as an issue which people on all sides of the political spectrum can rally around. Particularly, trafficking as something happening everyday that Christians must actively be vigilant regarding and participating in the fight against is a popular framing of the issue. Evangelical women and feminists are able to come together over the sale of sex as it threatens woman's very humanity (Daniel-Hughes 2018, 1).

The George W. Bush administration (2001-2009) made a significant impact on the increased salience of human trafficking with its establishment of the Office of Faith-Based Initiatives which increased the access of Christian organizations to federal funds (Daniel-Hughes 2018, 1). The surge in pertinent legislative efforts in the past two decades (see section II.F) is further evidence of a domestic resurgence of interest in the issue. Even recently, President Trump

proclaimed in January 2018 as National Slavery and Human Trafficking Prevention Month (Trump, 2017). In his proclamation, he cited an estimated 25 million global victims, proclaiming trafficking "a sickening crime at odds with our very humanity" (Trump 2017, 1).

The increased publicity surrounding the issue of human trafficking is not limited to the United States context: the number of countries that have criminalized most forms of trafficking as set out in the UN Trafficking in Persons Protocol has increased from only 33 in 2003 to 158 as of 2016 (UNODC 2016, 1). Additionally, in the most recent Sustainable Development Goals developed via the collaboration of more than 150 countries worldwide, included was the call for an "*end of abuse, exploitation, trafficking and all forms of violence against and torture of children*" (SDG Target 16.2).

Perhaps surprisingly, the top caller type making use of the National Human Trafficking Hotline is a community member, followed by victims of trafficking and family of the trafficking victims (NHTH 2017, 1). Commensurate with increasing public interest seems to be increasing public action. This well-intentioned aid is no doubt important; however, it also comes with dangers which will be further elaborated upon in Section IV.A.

B. THE ICONIC VICTIM AND MISCONCEPTIONS

Despite the United States being a primary destination for human trafficking, many people remain unaware that United States citizens make up a majority of trafficking victims in the United States (Ernewein & Nieves 2015, 797). There is within popular media a particular image of the iconic victim which has effused into anti-trafficking efforts and policies in an incredibly problematic way. There is a general stereotype that sex trafficking victims are young, poor, often uneducated, white, heterosexual females, who have followed a specific path of physical abuse

which led them into the commercial sex industry (Richmond 2015, 32). Among some of the other common stereotypes surrounding child sex trafficking specifically are beliefs that children in the commercial sex industry enjoy lots of sex, the youth themselves make large profits in the sex industry, that victims choose to enter the sex trade of their own volition, that the life of someone in the commercial sex industry can be glamorous and exciting, and that children in the industry effortfully take advantage of unsuspecting and innocent men (McKeen 2015, 9).

In the stereotyping of trafficking victims, the image is often conflated with that of a prostitute or consenting commercial sex worker. Both stereotypes are harmful in a number of ways, as well as the conflation of the two (see Appendices B and C for further details on legal and policy conflation and the image of the prostitute).

C. INFLUENCE OF POPULAR MEDIA

Theoretical frames are themselves important journalistic strategies that garner audience interest and encourage certain interpretations of facts that will encourage continued investment in the issue (Bennet 2016, 209). The problem comes when the media uses these theoretical frames which gloss over important aspects of an issue, and these glosses consequently make their way into the broader public discourse and eventual public policy. The issue of human trafficking has been taken up by the media alongside public imagination. The media's sensationalization of the problem of human trafficking can be traced back to the early 1900's and the moral panic surrounding "white slavery" (Bennet 2016, 208). This abolitionist narrative never entirely disappeared, and has coloured the press's understanding of the current anti-trafficking movement's impetus.

Even recently, we can see a case example in an article by Goldie Taylor writing for the *Daily Beast* which profiles a young human trafficking victim who was taken at 13 and speaks to the reporter as a young mother of 17. Such reporting details the plight of a city trying to implement new efforts to help such individuals (Taylor 2016, 1). The popular image of sex trafficking often details such individual plights, latching on to a compelling singular narrative. The *Washington Times* published an article in 2011 which detailed the "personal stories" of young women who "got caught" and how they escaped (Neubauer 2011, 1). The storylines here also detail unfortunate circumstances of young girls, taken advantage of either by strangers or even family, often arrested by a system which spits them back out onto the street and into the hands of a pimp who isolates them from any of their former support systems.

A study analyzing magazine articles on human trafficking from 2000 to 2010 found that "Articles imply that the problem of trafficking is one of individual vulnerability, which can be remedied by charitable efforts, and ignore the larger cultural, political, economic, and educational systems of sex discrimination" (Barnett 2016, 205). In a qualitative analysis of 110 articles from 49 different magazines, it was found that trafficking was framed as a dangerous evil that damages women and threatens social stability more generally, with articles published in the United States and the United Kingdom frequently employing first-person narration techniques to give personal perspective to broader human rights stories (Bennet 2016, 210-211). These storylines *are* tragic. They are also completely legitimate. I in no way intend to take down these important narratives as part of the conversation that will be central to eventually eliminating the practice of human trafficking to the fullest extent possible. However, there is a danger in co-opting certain parts of these narratives and ignoring others. When certain voices and

storylines are held above the rest, they have the potential to resonate in a way that is harmful to the broader movement as a whole.

Other social risk factors include the sexualization of young girls and women in the media, as well as the glorification and commodification of pimp and prostitution culture on a broader scale in popular music and media (McKeen 2015, 23). The media has a tremendous responsibility in reporting issues such as human trafficking and in shaping the perception of victims, perpetrators, aid providers, and government actors within the public eye (UN.GIFT 2008, 2). Important steps need to be taken by the media in order to cover responsibly stories of sex trafficking, substituting colloquialisms such as "pimp" and "buyer/john" for "exploiter/child abuser" (McKeen 2015,10). Though not the focus of this paper, there is a recognizable need for the adoption of better practices for responsible journalistic coverage of the human trafficking and sexual exploitation epidemics.

D. THE VICTIM IN REALITY

There is no single paradigmatic path which results in an individual being sexually exploited and trafficked. The demographics of trafficking victims are fluid and ever-changing. A key finding of recent scientific study is that "there is no specific profile of a human trafficking victim; indeed, victims may be of any race/ethnicity, nationality, gender, socioeconomic class, or religion" (Greenbaum 2016, 242). In the last ten years, children and men have begun to make up larger shares of trafficking victims, with the share of men among detected victims increasing from 13% in 2004 to 21% in 2014 (UNODC 2016, 6). At least some of this shift is attributable to external factors such as changing diagnostic strategies, commensurate proportional increases in labor trafficking, and larger global populations of migrants and refugees from current conflicts.

Be that as it may, this still provides justification for a need to shift from frameworks which focus on the iconic female victim without fully addressing such external issues. Many of the current stereotypes and assumption are based off of little to no data or data which was built off of biased data sets.

Although there is wide variety in who becomes a trafficking victim, there are broad generalizations in which we can be confident. Internationally, women make up an even greater portion of victims of forced sexual exploitation, with estimations reaching as high as 99.4% in 2016 (ILO & WWF, 2017:23). However, there remains an argument that a non-trivial factor in such a high percentage is the lack of institutional recourse for male victims of forced sexual labor. One 2014 study found that of a sample of female sexual trafficking survivors, 84.3% used drugs or alcohol during the time of their captivity, with 27.9% of the sample saying that this was forced upon them rather than by choice (Lederer & Wetzel 2014, 76). It has been found repeatedly in many studies that women who were sexually exploited as adults were abused as children in a range of 33-84% of instances, with figures for sexually exploited minors mapping similarly (Clawson et al. 2009).

Due to their susceptibility, victims who have low self-esteem, minimal support systems, are runaways, homeless, or within the foster care system are often targeted by perpetrators of human trafficking (Ernewein & Nieves 2015, 798). Children within the foster care system are particularly targeted, manipulated into viewing their traffickers as their family within a system of commercial sexual exploitation (Johnson et al. 2016, 7). However, again, there are many avenues by which an individual may enter into the sex-trafficking cycle including seduction, coercion,

peer recruitment, contact on an internet site or chat room, being sold by a parent or relative, kidnapping, violence, debt bondage, and being lured by false advertisement (McKeen 2015, 24).

The important things to remember in making such broad characterizations is two-fold: (a) such statements should be based in sound, evidence-based research and studies; and (b) we don't let characterizations of the majority of victims limit our attendance to those with demographics in the minority. The majority of sexual trafficking victims in the United States are between the ages of 12 and 17 at the time their exploitation begins (Greenbaum 2016, 242).

It is also notable that although numbers are difficult to estimate, several studies have shown that the emergence of the growing online pornography industry and the movement of sex trafficking interactions onto an online platform has contributed to shifting victim demographics, allowing younger individuals greater ease of access to dangerous channels (Johnson et al. 2016, Srikantiahv 2007, Brage Luis et al. 2014, 92). The topic of the digital development of prostitution and sex trafficking will be discussed in greater detail in section VII.

Despite the perpetuation of the stereotypical victim as a young white female, it is generally agreed upon by researchers that African Americans comprise the majority of victims in most regions. In Atlanta, the majority of victims in 2004 were African American teenagers, with roughly 90% of cases referred to the Center to End Adolescent Sexual Exploitation being African American (Johnson et al. 2016, 4).

The advent of the TVPA was significant in changing the perception of trafficked individuals from criminals to victims (Clawson et. al, 2009). The TVPA (2000) was revolutionary in a number of ways, including its attempt at guaranteeing a more comprehensive package of services being available to human trafficking victims under purview of the HHS and

Office for Victims of Crime at the Department of Justice (Clawson et al. 2009). Despite new legal paradigms offering this increased victim assistance, few trafficking victims are actually able to obtain these promises of relief due to inadequacies at multiple points of intervention (Srikantiahv 2007, 158).

E. CHRISTIAN MORAL IMPERATIVE

An important aspect of the trend of focus on human trafficking is the focus of Faith-Based Organizations (FBOs)—specifically Christian—on the issue of sex trafficking as their role within anti-trafficking efforts increases. Part of the Christian attraction to the cause of human trafficking is a perceived underlying moral imperative to combat what is taken as an unseemly perversion of all values the Christian right in particular holds dear. Sex has historically been co-opted as a "sacred experience" with specific moral implications, the sanctity of which must be preserved and thus regulated (Griffith 2017, 53). As recently as April 8, 2018, Fox News published an opinion piece proclaiming human trafficking "the very antithesis of Jesus' teaching", and saying that "our Christian duty" is to combat this "sinister underground industry...[that] traps our most vulnerable citizens in a cycle of drugs, sex, and violence" (Head 2018, 1).

There is often implicated in fighting trafficking the promise of eventual divine reward. Timothy Head, the Executive Director of the Faith and Freedom Coalition, promises in his recent article that "those who answer this call will receive their heavenly reward when the King of Kings says unto you, 'as you did it to one of the least of these my brothers, you did it to me'," (Head 2018, 1). Matthew 25:34-40 is a popular citation in such redemptive rhetoric (Head, 2018).

Alexander wrote in his work *On the Social Construction of Moral Universals: The 'Holocaust' from War Crime to Trauma Drama* that "the very existence of the category 'evil' must be seen not as something that naturally exists but as an arbitrary construction, the product of cultural and sociological work." Alexander importantly notes the progressive narrative within American culture that evil in whatever form will ultimately be defeated (Alexander 2002, 17). The primary concern in efforts for amelioration following the Holocaust was not the unfortunate plight of the Jews themselves; this was in fact secondary to a broader cultural understanding of evil and its need to be defeated.

Alexander would likely apply this same logic to the Evangelical-Protestant co-optation of the cause of human trafficking. The broader evil in this construct is the moral degradation of women. Alexander writes of the "non-Jewish audience..determined to redeem" the Jewish victims of the Holocaust and Nazism as taking up the cause as a broader effort towards tolerance, despite a lack of identification specifically with the Jewish victims (Alexander 2002, 33). As Alexander noted regarding American anti-Semitism, this does not make the movement "inauthentic"; rather, it is important in understanding how it is being approached and framed by the groups leading the way. Similarly, the new Christian cause against sexual exploitation is less about these victims specifically as individuals and more about the redemption of sexual purity for the 'iconic victim' and women as a whole.

Anti-trafficking efforts rooted in Evangelical sexual morality and Protestant Christianity more broadly rely on a traditional script of sex and gender roles where "Girls are rehabilitated so that they can occupy their true positions as women, that is, as married women and mothers" (Daniel-Hughes 2018, 1). The fight against human trafficking has been co-opted as an

evangelical mission, with events often centered around prayer or bible-readings as part of the efforts in this new abolitionist movement (Daniel-Hughes 2018, 1 & Out of Darkness, 2018).

Potentially relevant to understanding this role of faith-based organizations is structural holes theory, which suggests that different groups are defined by the fact that nodes within those groups are densely networked with each other but not with nodes in other groups; the structural hole is a place between networks a person is occupying which offers opportunity for overlap between two dense networks such that those occupying these nodes in between are able to charge tolls on the information passing between them (Burt 2004, 351). The faith-based organizations combating human trafficking serve as the mediators of the structural holes between groups of conservative Christians and liberal activists who would ordinarily be at odds. In a differentiated society, there are more opportunities for people to leverage such structural holes (Erikson 2017, 283-4). Breiger's work in *The Duality of Persons and Groups* offers further ways to empirically look at the intersection of anti-trafficking efforts and religious group participation in a way that would be helpful and informative to government officials and lawmakers trying to leverage all possible resources efficiently (Breiger, 1974). By looking at the cohesion and overlap between interpersonal and intergroup networks, there is opportunity for a better understanding of where the structural holes exist and how the information passing through them can be leveraged to find more effective solutions. At the same time, social ties are a theoretical construct (Erikson 2017, 284). Understanding this is key to allowing that what are considered 'acceptable' sexual morals has remained fluid over time.

F. IMAGINED VICTIMIZER

Accompanying societal stereotypes and expectations of trafficking victims are assumptions surrounding the kind of person who would be a trafficker. The stereotypical trafficker within the context of sexual exploitation is often described as the "pimp" character from 90's movies. This is usually a male, often African American, older, rich, flamboyantly dressed, heterosexual, and violent (Richmond, 2015). Just as with victims, there is a wide range of variation in the type of person who trafficks women (Johnson et al. 2016, 7).

There is generally speaking a bias that the woman out having sex remains the perpetrator, and that the pimp (assumed to be male) is just collecting the money; this bias is reflected in the consistent and large discrepancy between women convicted of prostitution charges contrasted with men (and women) convicted of pimping (Hansen 2015, 1). Although it is true that statistically most traffickers are male, they are only slightly in the majority, running approximately 6 out of 10 offenders across all stages of the criminal justice process (UNDOC 2016, 33). In addition to barriers caused by misperceptions of law enforcement officials, due to loopholes in current legislation many purchasers of sex are at a low risk of criminal punishment (Johnson et al. 2016, 5). For better rates of identification and prosecution, attitudes and stereotypes surrounding both the victim and the victimizer will need to be addressed. A public health model would be the most effective way to successfully do this.

IV. CURRENT INSUFFICIENCIES; THE NECESSITY OF CHANGING FRAMEWORKS

This presentation of data and frameworks thus far begs several questions: is not increased focus on human trafficking in any form a good thing? If there are more organizations working towards stopping trafficking, is that not inherently better, regardless the particular religious (or other) biases in their approach? While these sentiments are undeniably important and likely beneficial in many ways, there are some iterations of this kind of wholesale support which I would put forth as problematic and with the potential to harm in many ways that might offset whatever good such groups may do. Similar to criticisms of “voluntourism” with often faith-based-groups working with those in need abroad, the issue of human trafficking in the United States is turning into somewhat of a spectator sport for those who need a boost of their own position while “helping the unfortunate.” (Wearing 2001, 93).

Due to increasing polarization of views in the United States and the nature of modern factors which contribute to susceptibility to trafficking, this shifting of frames which I am advocating for will ultimately prove necessary. As evidence for this approach, I look to broader literature on the phenomenon of “voluntourism”, and how this industry has begun to infiltrate the current efforts in combating human trafficking as predictive for the future difficulties anti-trafficking efforts will face without this paper’s presented framework shift.

A. EMPLOYING A VOLUNTOURISM LENSE

A paradigm that I am going to argue as being particularly useful in analyzing the problems with current approaches to human trafficking is that of “voluntourism”, and how it has changed aid within the medical community. Voluntourism is, as it sounds, the combination of

“volunteering” and “tourism”. Appendix D details a history of the term ‘voluntourism’ and its development as a framework.

The duality inherent within the definition of voluntourism creates a problematic degree of ambiguity which potentially compromises the overall quality of either half of the voluntourism experience (Liston-Heyes & Daley 2016, 283-4). There are a number of important aspects of voluntourism motivation which complicate this effectiveness of the aid which is intended to be given, culminating in a combination of altruistic selfless motivation and 'social egoism' which benefits the volunteer while not necessarily aiding the communities being addressed (Liston-Heyes & Daley 2017, 285). Although voluntourism itself is a relatively nascent subject within academic literature, case study examples and general trends of the current framing are still incredibly helpful in helping to elucidate the potential dangers of current approaches in human trafficking work.

Social exchange theory is one of the theoretical constructs which has been applied to voluntourism which is also applicable in the context of human trafficking. The social exchange theory hypothesis is that the personal benefit a volunteer receives from their service is a strong predictor of support for additional voluntourism, as well as perceived negative and positive impacts from voluntourism and general support for voluntourism within a community (McGehee & Andereck 2009, 42). A study focused on the volunteer tourism industry in Tijuana, Mexico found via survey data that found support for social exchange theory being operative in how volunteer tourism activities were perceived in that region (McGehee & Andereck 2009, 46-49). Such findings would be easily translatable to the volunteer work done in the human trafficking sector; volunteers are often looking for measurable change in removing victims from cycles of

trafficking. The personal benefit someone sees from their work in the anti-trafficking sector—whether based in a Christian story of redemption or otherwise moral crusade—can be imagined to correspond to correlate to their belief that more of similar efforts should be continued, perpetuating the same myths and stereotypes.

The possible negative impacts of voluntourism are wide-ranging, including "*a neglect of locals' desires*", a lack of "*local involvement; a hindering of work progress and the completion of unsatisfactory work caused by volunteers' lack of skills... a reinforcement of conceptualisations of the 'other' and rationalisations of poverty caused by the intercultural experience*" (Guttentag 2009, 537). More broadly speaking, volunteer efforts often stem from a combination of altruism and "*reciprocal altruism*", where there is an important component of expected benefit to the self which has the potential to impact the effectiveness of the efforts (Guttentag 2009, 11). These also serve as apt descriptors of the potential downfall of volunteer anti-trafficking efforts. A lack of victim's voices in continued efforts and a failure to acknowledge realities which current popular perceptions ignore can cause harm in the exclusions it fosters.

Another problematic aspect of voluntourism is the promotion of the idea that there is a "*deceptively singular geopolitical discourse*" of relations between entities giving and receiving aid (Liston-Heyes & Daley 2017, 285). Although voluntourism focuses on the general perpetuation of the North South divide and imperialist-ideology driven stereotypes, a similar model can be applied to Christian-based evangelizing groups looking to aid the morally compromised sex trafficking victim. In a tourism context, important aspects of "*sensemaking*" (a collaborative process of creating a shared awareness to understand a multiplicity of perspectives) are done without employing "*sensemaking mindfulness*", compromising the premise of

sensemaking itself (Liston-Heyes & Daley 2017, 287). The five primary sensemaking factors are generally accepted as “*1. the identity of the actors 2. opportunities to narrate and converse 3. opportunities for reflection and retrospection 4. preferences for plausibility versus accuracy 5. points of reference or familiar cue*”; together these five factors can be used to identify differences between success and failure in voluntourism as opposed to more traditional tourism tactics (Liston-Heyes and Daley 2017, 287-288).

Tim Echols "Unholy Tours" which were previously mentioned are another interesting example: these annual tours are professed to "*help educated policymakers about the evils of sex trafficking in metropolitan areas*", taking a bus of policymakers through the less savory streets of Atlanta and Savannah to show them where sex trafficking really happens (Echols 2018, 1). While this can be helpful in that it may convince lawmakers that policy changes are necessary, the mindset that it is possible to understand what these women go through or how the system works after a day spent primarily on a tour bus must be avoided. This is why cultural-competence will be an important component of the proposed public health framework, as is more thoroughly discussed in section V.

This paradigm of voluntourism is relevant to the development of anti-trafficking efforts both theoretically (as shown above) and literally. Many organizations encourage members of the community to volunteer; some more successfully than others. Looking specifically at Atlanta, there is a variety of opportunities allowing both short and long-term commitment on the part of participants. Out of Darkness is one organization which offers one-time volunteer opportunities in its “Princess Nights”, where participants are invited to attend a one-hour training session before combing the streets in vans looking for potential victims to pray with and hand out

flowers and lipstick with the National Trafficking Hotline Number printed on the side (Out of Darkness, 2018). Out of Darkness also has a number of longer-term volunteer programs which require a set commitment and more extensive training, such as their prayer response, prison outreach, job training, and housing placement aid (Out of Darkness 2018, 1). There are also a number of organizations which offer planned spring break trips for college groups of 3-5 day durations. While such forms of aid certainly have the potential for positive impact, the potential for negative outcomes as we see in voluntourism are very evident here as well.

B. INCREASING POLARIZATION

Issues related to sex and sexuality often cause particularly divisive and polarizing rhetoric. The human trafficking debate is no exception, and a public health oriented approach will provide a third way between current polarized strategies. Ranging from issues of birth control, abortion, censorship, suffrage, and LGBTQ rights, issues of a sexual nature have a tendency to produce both fervent and enduring debate. Marie Griffith points to this galvanization over sex-related issues as originating from three fears: fear of increased women's freedom, the fear of white protestants of encroaching religious/ethnic others, and the fear that the 'great nation' of America will be thrust into decline by a moral failure of its own citizens (Griffith 2017, xi). Beginning with debates over birth control in the 1920's, the narrative surrounding sex in America has become increasingly polarized between two camps of traditional vs. progressive attitudes mappable onto broader trends of opinions towards secularism and modernity (Griffith 2017, xii, 66). The currently polarized climate and disagreement over broader questions of acceptable sexual morals means that the current narrative centered on the moral/sexual compromise of a

victim will be inadequate. This is why a public health approach can better serve a more universal victim set.

C. INTERSECTIONALITY AND RELEVANCE OF FACTORS CONTRIBUTING TO TRAFFICKING SUSCEPTIBILITY

There are a number of identifiable characteristics that many trafficking victims have in common. These include factors such as young, lack of family support, limited education, history of mental health challenges, drug abuse, vulnerable location status, history of sexual abuse, unemployment, and poverty (Clawson et al. 2009). Part of the susceptibility to trafficking stems from these types of broader insecurities within the victims life, such as the need for food, housing, or childcare that a pimp is able to provide, albeit at a high cost—often higher than victims realize (Meekins 2016, 1). The economic situation of potential victims is also often a contributing factor when exploitation by organized crime groups occur. The use of trafficking by organized crime groups is more commonly associated with international trafficking, such as a better-known case in January 2000 when a Russian organized crime network trafficking Korean women was broken up in Seoul (Hughes et al. 2015, 364). Because of the wide-range of factors that contribute to a victim's susceptibility which are not encapsulated by the "iconic victim" of many aid approaches, a more inclusive approach is necessary. Public health offers a basis of non-discrimination and uniformity.

Importantly, the broader Christian narrative co-opted by many faith-based organizations does nothing to address important subsets of victims. A significant part of the difficulty of this issue is its intersectionality with so many other salient problems within the United States at present as well as embedded deeper within our history. Josh Hawley writes that "The time has

come for a new abolitionist movement to confront this oppression and turn it back" (Hawley 2017, 1). As mentioned briefly at the beginning of this paper, the United States' history of racist institutions was foundational in the beginnings of the anti-trafficking movement amid a broader changing dialogue surrounding sexual mores and religion. This abolitionist framework is still relevant though in looking at the groups which current laws and systems underserve or leave at an institutional disadvantage.

V. A NEW PUBLIC HEALTH ORIENTED APPROACH

This paper advocates for a public health focus based on the nature of evidence above indicating the reasons a framework change more generally is necessary; a public health-based approach will most effectively deal with these already identified problems. Specifically, a trauma-oriented approach focused on the cultural competency of providers offers the most convincing strategy to address victim needs throughout all components of the chain of trafficking events at the most opportunities for intervention.

A. DEFINING A PUBLIC HEALTH APPROACH

It would first make sense to define what I mean by 'public health approach'. Broadly, I am referencing an approach which gives primacy to evidence-based methodologies in order to address complex issues at the points where those affected intersect and interact with healthcare providers. A public health lens broadly speaking allows for the usage of already existing "methodologically rigorous and sound research" in order to better scientifically justify and design prevention and intervention policies while addressing a wider range of vulnerabilities

(CHA 2018, 1). Specifically, the Global Campaign for Violence Preventions' Violence Prevention Alliance advocates for a public health approach consisting of four primary steps:

- “1. To define the problem through the systematic collection of information about the magnitude, scope, characteristics and consequences of violence.
2. To establish why violence occurs using research to determine the causes and correlates of violence, the factors that increase or decrease the risk for violence, and the factors that could be modified through interventions.
3. To find out what works to prevent violence by designing, implementing and evaluating interventions.
4. To implement effective and promising interventions in a wide range of settings. The effects of these interventions on risk factors and the target outcome should be monitored, and their impact and cost-effectiveness should be evaluated.” (VPA 2018, 1)

This correlates to four main questions: “1. What is the problem? 2. What are the causes? 3. What works and for whom? 4. How do we scale up effective policy and programs?” (VPA 2018, 1). The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime breaks down the act of trafficking into three constituent elements: The Act (what is done), The Means (how it is done), and The Purpose (why it is done) (UNODC 2018). Each of these components offers an opportunity for intervention and analysis in better understanding the mechanics of this crime and its prevention.

Leaders in the field of human trafficking identify that although interest and general awareness has certainly increased, there is a distinct lack of "evidence-based best practices" to be put into effect, especially within the public health industry (Copan-Kelly, 1). The same lack of

data which was mentioned within the context of estimations of the problem exists in determining the efficacy of solutions.

B. WHY PUBLIC HEALTH?

Along the chain of human trafficking perpetuation, it is important to note the four main groups of people that trafficking victims are able to come in contact with: their traffickers, the "johns" who "hire" them, health care providers, and law enforcement personnel (Helton 2016, 434). There are obviously a number of points along this chain of intervention that would benefit from greater study. I am advocating for a focus on a need to identify victims for several reasons. Many of the currently existing non-profit and faith-based organizations focus their resources in the rehabilitation of survivors due to the difficulty of identification, presenting barriers to care and complicating addressing the immediate needs of victims (Johnson et al. 2016, 8).

Importantly, the structures to maintain the networks of human traffickers already exist and are operational; there are current victims who need to be addressed and removed, regardless if we are able to stop the flow of new victims. In addition, even if efforts are made to cut off the supply of victims by reducing demand, it has been shown that such efforts largely encourage such trafficking networks to move deeper underground (Saiz-Echezarreta et al. 2018). While this may present new challenges on the law enforcement and criminal justice side, the role of the public health community remains the same and highly important. Lastly, there is demonstrable evidence of frequent intersection of trafficking victim with health care providers, making identification via health care a prime opportunity to break the cyclical nature of trafficking networks (Betancourt et al. 2003).

Although estimates range significantly, one 2014 study found that 87.8% of victims from a sample of survivors reported having some kind of contact with healthcare during the time of their captivity (Lederer & Wetzel 2014, 77). Victims of human trafficking often have a wide range of needs, including help with food, housing, childcare, job skills training, education, health care, family assistance, immigration assistance, and crisis intervention (Greenbaum 2016, 246). The intersection with healthcare officials offers a prime opportunity to identify victims so that they can then be directed to the appropriate aid agency and resources. Additionally, a distrust of law enforcement, lack of personal identification or documentation, and a lack of understanding of social systems and institutions all may contribute to the decision of a trafficking victim to not seek or to reject aid (McKeen 2015, 28). Intervention from health care providers offers another avenue to victims who may not be comfortable with other forms of recourse.

It is well established within the scientific literature that victims of human trafficking are at significant risk of health complications due to a variety of factors related to their being trafficked (Betancourt et al. 2003 & Greenbaum, 2017). A recent study of both qualitative and quantitative data from a cohort of female sex trafficking survivors found that "survivors suffered tremendously, virtually without exception" (Lederer & Wetzel 2014, 68). In the same study, nearly 70% of victims reported some kind of physical injury, and 98.1% of the sample reported at least one psychological issue including 88.7% reporting depression and 54.7% suffering from PTSD (Lederer & Wetzel 2014, 69-71). Of 12 different forms of abuse offered as options on a questionnaire in the study first described in this section, survivors on average reported experiencing 6.25 of these forms (Lederer & Wetzel 2014, 73).

There are a number of reproductive issues common to trafficking victims, including pain during sex, STIs, urinary tract infections, miscarriages, and pregnancy complications (Helton 2016, 452). Physical effects and consequences of trafficking include injury, STI's, pregnancy and complications, substance abuse-related symptoms, untreated chronic medical conditions, dental complications, malnutrition, and infertility, while emotional effects include but are not limited to PTSD, major depression, anxiety, trauma bonds, somatization, ADHD, and aggression (Greenbaum 2016, Table 1). Despite the abusive and isolating nature of human trafficker and victim relationships, it is common for victims to be allowed to seek medical care during their period of captivity, most frequently in the form of contact with hospitals and emergency rooms or with reproductive health service providers (Helton 2016, 453).

In addition, the effects of trafficking range broader than just with the individual trafficking victim; their families, communities, and societies are also adversely impacted, and offer points of intersection with the public health community (Greenbaum 2016, 241). Because current studies show that victims are often identified and offered service on more than one occasion before they are able to accept such services, health care officials can still offer such services in a state environment and focus on harm reduction and care more generally even if longer-term services are refused (Greenbaum 2016, 246).

C. PROBLEMS WITH ALTERNATIVE APPROACHES

There is a general consensus within the anti-trafficking community that more research is necessary in determining what the best strategy for victims (both domestically and internationally) would be, although some components of successful programs which can generally be synthesized include incorporating safety planning, multi-agency collaboration,

fostering long-term relationships of trust, using culturally appropriate practices, using trauma-informed programming, and involving survivors (Clawson et al 2009).

A popular answer is to focus on the efforts of law enforcement. While focusing on law enforcement approaches to the issue of human trafficking certainly has potential and merits discussion, I chose not to focus on this approach for several reasons. One primary concern is that the "isolated nature of the human sex trafficking enterprise limits law enforcement's ability to come into contact with human trafficking victims", putting them at an immediate disadvantage as compared to healthcare providers (Helton 2016, 437). Additionally, there is great disagreement on what legal framework would be ideal in order to provide law enforcement officers the greatest agency to help potential victims, while affording appropriate punishment mechanisms for the perpetrators.

An offshoot issue of the law enforcement approach is the potentially problematic result of increased incarceration rates and the capacity for prison systems to develop into recruitment systems for further trafficking. A key problem with the system as it stands currently is its proclivity towards self-perpetuation and recidivism, and the carceral feminist approach doesn't necessarily address this given that under current legislative regimes, the victims are often arrested alongside their traffickers. Often times, victims are understandably not forthcoming in revealing whether or not they are victims of human trafficking (Meekins 2016, 1). With this information not being in their files, law enforcement are often unaware at later stages and thus might not provide certain resources, accommodations, and implementation of protocol that would be victim-centered (Meekins 2016, 1).

Women in jail already under the control of a pimp are often used as "liaisons" to work on further recruitment, as evidenced by letters from pimps to inmates describing potential recruits and procedures for convincing them to join the pimp's group. Strategies for beginning this relationship include the pimp putting small amounts of money at an extremely high interest rate into the woman's commissary account and then the victim discovering upon their release that the only way they can pay off these accrued debts is to work for the pimp (Binzer 2016, 1). This only serves to perpetuate the cycle of trafficking.

Lastly, the public health approach which I am advocating has less risk for harm (in contrast the law enforcement oriented approach). If anything, there should logically be an increase in identification of a number of related issues such as child abuse, neglect, and exploitation more generally. In contrast, harm from other forms have the potential to cause an increase in trafficking and other crimes if implemented incorrectly.

D. TRAUMA-BASED PUBLIC HEALTH APPROACH

An important characteristic of this public health approach is that it simultaneously be a trauma-informed approach. Such an approach "assumes that the patient has experienced considerable trauma and that their attitudes, beliefs, and behaviors may reflect traumatic stress" and dictates questions and strategies that are designed to get necessary information from the victim without re-triggering such traumatic experiences and increasing undue stress (Greenbaum 2016, 244). There are "four R's" that characterize a trauma-informed system: it *Realizes* the widespread impact of trauma, *Recognizes* the symptoms of trauma in clients and those around them, *Responds* with fully integrating knowledge about the trauma into policies and procedures, and *Resists Retraumatization* in their treatment of the patient (Huang et al. 2014, 13). An

important consideration in a trauma-informed approach is that reticence and non-compliance from the patient may be a combination of unwillingness to disclose previous trauma as well as an inability to recollect memories in a linear form or suppression of traumatic experiences; such factors must be taken into account in actively avoiding retraumatization (Baldwin 2017, 24).

Some institutions are already beginning to advocate for such trauma-informed changes. For example, a 2017 protocol guide created by the Hope for Justice and HEAL Trafficking efforts encourage the adoption of trauma-informed care which they define as "non-judgmental and patient-centered care that prioritizes physical, psychological and emotional safety for all involved, including staff" (Baldwin 2017, 9). These recent efforts are certainly steps in the right direction. However, more universal adoption of these practices is the only way to effect lasting change.

E. CULTURAL COMPETENCE

Cultural competence is an important aspect of modern medicine which is especially relevant in the issue of a public health approach to human trafficking. A significant barrier in identification of trafficking victims by healthcare providers is their unwillingness to self-identify (Greenbaum 2016, 243). In order for any beneficial disclosure to be catalyzed, a crucial part of the provider-patient interaction is developing a deep enough trust for the victim to confide in the healthcare provider (Lederer & Wetzel 2014, 83). This in and of itself presents a number of difficulties given that traffickers are often unwilling to leave their victims alone for a long enough period of time for doctors to develop this important trust, as well as reticence on the part of the victim for fear of repercussion from their trafficker. Such situations are why developing

cultural competence should be an important aspect of a successful public-health oriented paradigm.

A parallel to what would be required in this example would be the work done by Sean Convoy and Richard Westphal in arguing for the importance of developing a military cultural competence within nurse practitioner protocol in order to better facilitate diagnoses of mental disorders, particularly PTSD (Convoy & Westphal 2013, 591). Many challenges which accompany identifying PTSD and related mental disorders in veterans parallels the difficulties with identifying victims of human trafficking, such as the fact that there are no "easily defined focal symptom presentations", and victims are not likely to self-identify (Conway & Westphal 2013, 593). In a way similar to how the secular image of the American soldier has been harnessed in a religious manner to become a motif and representative of a certain flavor of patriotic resilience, the iconic human trafficking victim has developed as its own trope of vulnerability and assumed needs and presentations.

More generally speaking, the development of cultural competencies in nursing "affords better and earlier insights into specific population risk factors and needs" through the application of differing frames and lens specific to victims' backgrounds, demographics, and symptom presentations (Convoy & Westphal 2013, 592). Importantly, cultural competence is a process which develops over time, consisting of cultural awareness, cultural knowledge, cultural skill, cultural encounters, and cultural desire employed in an integrative fashion in order to cater to diverse needs in a responsive health care services environment (Campinha-Bacote 2002, 181)

Another key aspect of this kind of cultural competence in healthcare is the separation of personal beliefs of healthcare providers concerning the actions or ethos of the victim from the

recognition that those same actions or ethos may have significant diagnostic import. This particularly becomes relevant in considering the difficulty in diagnosing human trafficking within a broader context of consensual sex and consensual acts of prostitution, and how they should or should not be treated similarly within a medical environment. Some of the most obvious and common physical symptoms of a trafficking situation include signs of physical abuse, although these can easily be conflated with a more general concern of domestic abuse (Lederer & Wetzel 2014, 81)

An increasing aspect of emergency response literature is focused on stress management and stress first aid, focusing on the health of both the provider and the patient in order to enhance resilience and overall interaction. This course of thought labels four sources of stress reaction: 1. life threat or trauma 2. loss 3. inner conflict 4. fatigue / wear and tear (NFFF 2015, 2). Also within this literature are the seven "C's" of a trauma-based approach within recognition (Check, Coordinate) and Addressing Essential Needs (Cover, Calm, Connectedness, Competence, Confidence) (NFFF 2015, 2-3). For a fully functional protocol, these aspects will also have to be addressed in order to make sure that the program's success is sustainable.

F. IMPORTANCE OF INCLUSIVITY

Of the cases reported in 2017 to the National Human Trafficking Hotline, only 13.19% were male victims, and only .94% identifying as a gender minority (NHTH 2017, 1). There has also been found a disproportionate number of males involved in child sexual trafficking who identify as LGBTQ, putting them at additional risk (McKeen 2015, 26). It is important also that as of 2014, it is estimated that the share of victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation that are women is 96%, compared to only 37% in trafficking for forced labor (UNDOC 2016, 27). There

continues to be problems with children being prosecuted for prostitution as opposed to treated as trafficking victims, with a number of states lacking the Safe Harbor Laws that prevent children from being arrested for prostitution despite federal laws mandating that children can't give consent in prostitution cases. Male children experience criminal charges for prostitution at higher rates due to their proclivity to operate independent of a pimp or trafficking organization and the fact that they don't fit into the stereotypically understood profile of a trafficking victim (Johnson et al. 2016, 7). This tendency towards criminal prosecution for male trafficking victims is likely a contributor to the lower rates reported.

It is significant that in many international and summary reports related to human trafficking, results and findings are glossed into the binary categories of “male” and “female” without allowance for alternate options of gender expression (UNODC 2016 & ILO 2016). Although non-binary genders make up a drastic minority of cases, it is still important in an effort towards more inclusive policies that they be included as a class within policies and legal frameworks. There are important historical connections between the prosecution and suppression of prostitution and "erotic diversity" more generally (Zatz 1997, 277). Although they are often not represented in the literature and materials aimed at anti-trafficking efforts and awareness, LGBTQ youth are at higher rates of vulnerabilities to crime generally speaking than their heterosexual peers (Johnson et al. 2016, 7). Frequently, youth also intersect in susceptibility with high rates of homelessness and poverty resulting in a greater chance of discrimination (Johnson et al. 2008, 6). The public health setting as a safe space valuing privacy and cultural competency offers the most promising opportunity for intervention in these less common instances.

G. PROTOCOL RECOMMENDATIONS

It is important to note that in the current landscape of federal, state, and local laws on healthcare protocol, training requirements, and mandated reporting laws, any localized or specific facility framework will necessarily be adaptable and continually reevaluated if it is going to be successful (Baldwin 2017, 8). Currently, there are problems both in the lack of uniformity of educational, promotional, and legislative efforts, as well as a lack of evaluation on the effectiveness of what mechanisms are already in place (Powell et al. 2017, 1). Studies have been done showing that a protocol, though difficult to develop due to a lack of precedent and examples on a larger scale, is helpful for providers in identifying victims (Stoklosa et al. 2016, 189). A significant part of the challenge is that there remains a deficit of providers who have been trained in competencies related to the protocol (Stoklosa et al. 2016, 189). This suggests that developing uniform protocol for health providers will be more effective than individual group efforts to enact non-uniform standards. Studies have also shown that human sex trafficking victims can be aided by providing nurse practitioners with training regarding access to HIV prevention resources and industry access (Erenwein & Nieves 2015, 799).

One potential recourse in legislation on the public health front would be changes in the current mandatory reporting laws. Under current standards, if a provider is working with a suspected child trafficking victim, they should defer to and comply with state-level mandatory reporting laws, whereas if a victim is older than 18 the provider must obtain informed consent before making referrals to other aid groups or referring the case to authorities (Greenbaum 2016, 245). Mandatory reporters in all fifty states have been enacted with the objective of reducing child abuse and neglect, and 10 states as of 2016 have enacted legislation covering both sex

trafficking and labor trafficking within these mandatory trafficking laws (Todres 2016, 70). It should be noted that there is disagreement among professionals regarding the usefulness of mandatory reporting laws in actually changing identification efforts if not in combination with other efforts such as a mandate and funding for training of those who would act as mandatory reporters and a better allocation of resources to the child welfare and trafficking aid systems (Todres 2016, 71). However, I argue that such changes in mandatory reporting laws would be necessary as a component of a broader policy initiative.

Hope for Justice and HEAL Trafficking have created a toolkit designed to aid health care professionals in creating a protocol for dealing with potential victims of human trafficking seeking assistance from their facility (Baldwin 2017, 6). The guide lists several steps in order to create an effective protocol: “1. Identify community multidisciplinary responders 2. Engage non-medical community stakeholders 3. Engage medical stakeholders within your community 4. Understand human trafficking and health generally and locally 5. Create and convene an interdisciplinary protocol committee 6. Develop multidisciplinary treatment and referral plan” (Baldwin 2017, 12-23). It is important that the protocol cover the ideal course of action in the case that a suspected trafficking victim deny help; given the frequency that this occurs, the exclusion of this aspect of patient-provider interaction would simply make the protocol incomplete (Baldwin 2017, 34). Mandating the development of such programs in combination with federally developed staff training programs will be a necessary step in creating the uniformity to properly address this issue.

VI. APPLYING A TRAUMA-BASED APPROACH: ATLANTA

While I argue that there exists a broad basis for change within the United States as a whole, there are a number of groundbreaking institutions which are working to develop a more integrative approach. Specifically, health institutions in Atlanta are working to make progress in this area, with industry pioneers including the Stephanie V. Blank Center for Safe and Healthy Children at the Children's Healthcare of Atlanta which provides 24/7 clinical services for trafficking victims (Copan-Kelly 2018). The Children's Healthcare of Atlanta is a primary pediatric provider in Georgia serving roughly 200,000 patients per year and admitting approximately 25,000 patients into its hospitals yearly (Bryant 2017, 1). The Institute on Healthcare and Human Trafficking operates as part of the Stephanie V. Blank Center for Safe and Healthy Children at Children's Healthcare of Atlanta as a collaboration between the Center for Safe and Healthy Children, the Mark Chaffin Center for Healthy Development within the School of Public Health at Georgia State University, and the Emory University Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences (CHOA 2018, 1).

The Center's work aims to reframe the approach to trafficking so that providers also see it as not just a social and political problem, but a public health crisis which providers have a culpability in addressing. The Institute will be directed by Jordan Greenbaum, M.D., who has dedicated her life's work to advocating for new approaches in combating trafficking and the more general exploitation of children. The Institute's stated mission is "to improve the lives of children and families affected by human trafficking by increasing and enhancing behavioral health and medical care through research, training and education" (CHOA 2018, 1). Its goals include "1: Raise awareness among health professionals about labor and sex trafficking of children and

adults 2: Increase the ability of health professionals to recognize potential victims and respond appropriately, and 3: Contribute to the body of research on human trafficking," (CHOA 2018, 1). Additional related efforts include a 3 year fellowship in child abuse pediatrics, allowing fellow to spend 70% of their time on clinical activities and 30% time on research in collaboration with researchers at Emory School of Medicine, the CDCP, Georgia State University, and Rollins School of Public Health and Georgia Tech in order to advance research on child abuse and trafficking investigation and allegations (Bryant 2017, 1).

The Institute can be seen to meet the basic requirements of the four R's for trauma-informed care as listed in the previous section:

- *Realizes*: The focus of the institute in its policy on a public health orientation to trafficking and the acknowledgement of the institute of the wide variety in victimizations and vulnerabilities which may be presented demonstrate their acknowledgment and realizing the widespread impact of trauma. The Institute has also made an effort to include protocol specific to sexual minorities in their recognition that trauma is widespread and extends far beyond what we might consider to be its more traditional manifestations.
- *Recognizes*: Protocols developed and utilized by the Institute include an extensive list of symptoms and signs which providers should be on the look-out for. It also has created extensive training material for use by all levels of providers.
- *Responds*: The Institute has within its protocol specific courses of action to follow with based on the symptoms presented and key organizational partners.

- *Resists Retraumatization*: The Institute's stated goals are to ensure that victims are being treated appropriately and ensuring cultural competence on the part of providers to avoid potential retraumatization to the greatest extent possible.

VII. CONTRIBUTING ISSUES: PRIVACY, THE INTERNET AND BIOPOWER

There is a wide range and scope of issues related to human trafficking which are worthwhile of investing significant resources into investigation. Given the scope of this Master's capstone, I will only be able to briefly touch on some of these issues which merit broader discussion. My goal here is to begin a discussion that others will continue in a more rigorous academic fashion. Specifically, two of the theoretical issues which are incredibly important in considering this framework development are those of privacy, biopower, and their interaction in the modern domestic and international political scenes.

A. PRIVACY

An important benefit of a more uniform adoption of protocol for health care providers is the ability to then provide consistent anonymized data to law enforcement agencies for intelligence-driven approaches and efforts on the policy side of change (Baldwin 2017, 10). As has been discussed, there is presently a dearth of data which complicates efforts at improving care. There are also complications with confidentiality regarding difficulty that journalists have in getting access to victims and accurate narratives (Hansen 2015, 1). It remains that in an information age with increasing concerns of privacy (and especially considering the broader overlap of the trafficking industry with privacy concerns as addressed above), the importance of anonymity could only become more salient.

One issue in particular in relation to the nexus of privacy and public health is pornography, as both creating demand for the trafficking of women and as an explanation for the apparent Christian imperative to intervene. There is again a classic Protestant redemption narrative behind many of these evangelical Christian groups' retelling of their impetus to join the anti-trafficking movement (Graham 2017, 2). Additionally, many faith-based anti-trafficking groups have statements on pornography both as a general act of impropriety and as a danger to women via the threat of trafficking. In the wider community, pornography is increasingly recognized as having changed societal expectations as to what sex should look like, and has been declared a public health crisis in several states (LaPlante 2017, 1). This directly relates to the increased access to pornography and other channels of sexual exchange via the Internet.

B. THE INTERNET AND SEXUALITY REDEFINED

Sexuality generally speaking has been profoundly changed by the advent of easy internet access and new modes of interpersonal communication, and the business of prostitution has unsurprisingly adapted in order to take advantage of such new technologies (Brage Luis et al. 2014, 91). This phenomenon of "delocalized prostitution" has arguably inserted greater danger into a number of nodes along the sex trafficking chain, allowing perpetrators to hide behind a wall of anonymity and facade in their online profiles (Brage Luis et al. 2014, 92). Related to this, the bipartisan Allow States and Victims to Fight Online Sex Trafficking Act or FOSTA bill has passed through Congress and is now simply waiting for President Trump's signature to go into effect. More recently, Michael Lacey, the founder of of the Phoenix New Times and cofounder of the classified advertising site Backpage, was charged as part of a wide-scale human trafficking investigation which has sparked intense debate over the nature of defining and negotiating sexual

relations within the digital realm (USA TODAY 2018, 1). The problem with Backpage stems from the use of its Craigslist-style personal ads section which has been used for prostitution and child sexual trafficking, notably filling the gap left when Craigslist closed its erotic services section in 2010. Both of these events have catalyzed wide debate on issues of privacy and government overreach and the potential to push the commercial sex industry deeper underground.

The structure of trafficking is one which requires some degree of privacy, making the intricate hierarchical business structure of the covert criminal enterprise difficult to detect for law enforcement (Henton 2016, 442). For this reason also, negotiating privacy laws will be an important aspect of developing effective prevention and detection methods. These hierarchical power dynamics also implicate biopower as an important aspect of developing protocol and theoretical frameworks.

C. BIOPOWER

It would be remiss in this discussion to not include at least a not to the concept of biopower and how its understanding might further contribute to this necessary paradigm shift. Foucault's work is important here in articulating the ways that both legal and rhetorical entities address the issue of sex more broadly are in fact mechanisms of a kind of sociocultural production. The power over life evolved historically as a characteristic privilege of the sovereign power, implicating important political dynamics into the significance of trafficking (Foucault 1973, 140). Foucault's conception of biopower offers the potential for a significant body of work addressing sex trafficking. For Foucault, biopower "designate[s] what brought life and its mechanisms into the realm of explicit calculations and made knowledge-power an agent of

transformation of human life” (Foucault 1978, 143). Many of the myths surrounding human trafficking have to do with exactly how such biopower is exercised, and the materiality of claims against a victimizer, including the myth that human trafficking was exclusively synonymous to "chains, bars, and beatings" which for historically held the advancement of effective anti-trafficking legislation captive (Richmond 2015, 20).

A centrally important aspect of sexual trafficking is the physical force which is exerted upon the victim by the trafficker (and potentially by the “john”). Traffickers are known to employ a number of strategies in order to exert both physical and emotional control over their victims, including physical violence, emotional manipulation, financial control, drug usage and abuse, rape, gang rape, threats, and verbal abuse (Helton 2016, 442). Within the context of advocating for a public-health approach, it is significant that part of the proclivity for human trafficking victims to interact with health providers comes from the risk of violence from traffickers against the trafficked victims (Helton 2016, 450). Further study of the management of these various relations of bodily power would prove fruitful on both a theoretical and pragmatic level for anti-trafficking efforts.

VIII. CONCLUSION

As stated throughout this paper, the issue of human trafficking is difficult to elucidate due to a number of factors. In order to allow some level of critical analysis and theorization, the issue has been scoped within this particular capstone project to focus on sexual trafficking within the United States, with particular examples from Atlanta, Georgia, chosen for its central position in current prominent anti-trafficking efforts. As argued above, there are a number of ways that it is

believed that the evidence given is theoretically applicable and generalizable to broader lessons in both a national and international context.

It should be noted that overall, there is a consensus that human trafficking and even specifically sex trafficking are problems which need to be addressed in some capacity. Even if there is a level of unawareness of the high frequency of trafficking or the locality of its occurrence, convincing people that sex trafficking is bad is not the point of contention this paper is attempting to argue. Once people are made aware of the scope and severity of the issue, the sentiment that ‘something should be done’ is practically universal. However beyond that, the controversy begins regarding what the best way of tackling the issue is, what institutions should or should not be involved, the ramifications of other legislation and efforts not specifically addressing trafficking, what constitutes trafficking as opposed to prostitution; the list goes on. This is where my capstone becomes relevant.

Ultimately, sex trafficking in the United States is largely a hidden issue which the general public is not conscious of. When people are aware of the issue, there remains a problematic discursive proclivity to characterize victims of human trafficking in particular ways. Bringing these problematic conceptions and stereotypes of sex trafficking to solution attempts limits the effectiveness of altruistic efforts to aid trafficking victims and prevent further sex trafficking. In order to combat this, a framework shift is necessary; a public health approach should be adopted. This will both allow for the deconstruction of harmful stereotypes which undercut historic minorities within the pool of sex trafficking victims, while increasing the ability of providers to identify and appropriately aid victims at their point of intersection with the health care system.

The study of human trafficking in the frameworks that are currently being used to approach it is important on a number of levels. Most explicitly, there are victims of sexual trafficking currently in the United States who are not able to get access to the resources which can remove them from a cycle of abuse. First and foremost, these victims are my concern. As much as prevention is important, there is current suffering which needs to be ameliorated. The examples of public health approaches I used are primarily derived from Atlanta due to both its notoriety as a hub of sex trafficking as well as the significant advancements the city as a whole has made to combat that image.

Even broader than sex trafficking, we are in a current moment of what seems to be characterized female empowerment and a reckoning of historically patriarchal, misogynistic, homophobic, and racist forces. The advent of the #MeToo movement in Hollywood and similar movements in a variety of industries perhaps epitomizes this changing context. I don't mean to suggest that my work here is similarly revolutionary; rather that it joins an increasing and important wave of voices working to better articulate structural inadequacies in our current approach to a number of similar issues.

There are many related topics which this paper suggests as possible avenues for further inquiry and empirical study. As has been mentioned throughout this paper thus far, the nature of this MA capstone is such that there are many directions for further research to go in which I was unable to fully elucidate. Some of the most prominent which I believe will prove particularly fruitful in the coming years are those related to the digitization of commerce related to sexual satisfaction and the problems and difficulties associated with such interactions online as elaborated upon more extensively in section VII.A&B. However I want to take the opportunity

here to give a nod to several other key research areas I foresee being critical to the anti-trafficking field in the coming years.

One less-frequently addressed issue is that of school-related problems such as learning disabilities and trafficking vulnerability (Clawson et al. 2009). This may eventually be an avenue for public health related efforts towards both identification and prevention. Particularly as digital avenues for sex trafficking become increasingly available to young kids, the impact of educational institutions in prevention will be an interesting place to focus.

Despite an increasingly developed legislative framework offering criminal justice avenues for conviction and punishment of traffickers, there remains on average a large discrepancy between the number of detected victims and convicted offenders (UNODC 2016, 12). Another interesting offshoot to this area of investigation would be to look further into the distinctions between public and private prisons and how such institutions affect human trafficking networks.

The extension of many of these ideas internationally would also prove interesting and fruitful, particularly in comparing legislative frameworks and systems of organizing federal/state/local responsibilities in relation to the various components of a cycle of trafficking.

It is my hope that this paper provides the start of a broader collection of evidence that a change in approach to human trafficking is necessary within the context of an increasingly polarized approach to sexual mores in the United States. Refocusing the issue on a public health context as is being done by several institutions in Atlanta is setting precedent for maintaining policies that are inclusive of marginalized groups historically and systematically disregarded within human trafficking aid efforts.

IX. REFERENCES

- Alexander, Jeffrey, 2002. On the social construction of moral universals: The ‘Holocaust’ from War Crime to Trauma Drama, *European Journal of Social Theory*. 2002.
- Álvarez, Carmen Delgado, and Andrea Gutiérrez García. 2014. Social representation of prostitution in gender perspective. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 161 (2014/December/19): 82-9.
- Baldwin, Susie, and Barrows, Jeffrey, & Stoklosa, Hanni. 2017. *Protocol toolkit for developing a response to victims of human trafficking in health care settings*. Hope for Justice, HEAL Trafficking, .
- Barnett, Barbara. 2016. Dividing women: The framing of trafficking for sexual exploitation in magazines. *Feminist Media Studies* 16 (2) (2016/April/1): 205.
- Belt, Deb. March 13, 2014. Atlanta ranked no. 1 for sex trafficking; conventions to blame?. *Buckhead Patch* March 13, 2014, sec Police & Fire.
- Berman, Jacqueline. 2010. Biopolitical management, economic calculation and “Trafficked women”. *International Migration* 48 (4) (2010/August/1): 84-113.
- Betancourt, Joseph R., Alexander R. Green, J. Emilio Carrillo, and II Owusu Ananeh-Firempong. 2003. Defining cultural competence: A practical framework for addressing Racial/Ethnic disparities in health and health care. *Public Health Rep* 118 (4) (07/01; 2018/04): 293-302,
<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1093/phr/118.4.293>

- Boettinger, Carla. The current state of sex trafficking legislation in georgia. in International Human Trafficking Institute [database online]. May 5th 2016 Available from <http://theihti.org/the-current-state-of-sex-trafficking-legislation-in-georgia/>.
- Breiger, Ronald, 1974. The Duality of Persons and Groups Social forces 53.2: 181-190.
- Brickner, Michael & Diaz, Shakyra. Summer 2011. Prisons for profit: Incarceration for sale. *American Bar Association Human Rights Magazine* 38 (3).
- Callimachi, Rukmini. August 13, 2015. ISIS enshrines a theology of rape. *The New York Times* August 13, 2015.
- Carroll, Archie B. January 2008. A history of corporate social responsibility: concepts and practices. In *The oxford handbook of corporate social responsibility.*, 19-46. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Catherine Liston-Heyes, and Carol Daley. 2017. Voluntourism, sensemaking and the leisure-volunteer duality. *Tourist Studies* 17 (3) (09/01; 2018/04): 283-305, <http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1468797616665769>
- Clawson, Heather J., Nicole Dutch, and Solomon, Amy & Goldblatt Grace, Lisa. August 30, 2009. *Human trafficking into and within the united states: A review of the literature.* Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation, U.S. Department of Health & Human Services.
- Convoy, Sean & Westphal, Richard J. November 2013. The importance of developing military cultural competence. *Journal of Emergency Nursing* 39 (6): 592.

- Convoy, Sean, and Richard J. Westphal. 2013. Clinical: The importance of developing military cultural competence. *Journal of Emergency Nursing* 39 (6) (2013/November/1): 591-4.
- Contemporary western feminist perspectives on prostitution. 1997. *Asian Journal of Womens Studies* 3 (2) (1997/January/1): 8-29.
- Copan-Kelly, Cailin. 2017. Leading A public health approach to human trafficking. *Saporta Report 2017*, sec Thought Leaders.
- Corporation for National & Community Service, "Voluntourism" (Briefing, Volunteering in America, Hands On Network, , <https://www.nationalservice.gov/sites/default/files/resource/voluntourism.pdf>.
- Daniel-Hughes, Carly. January 3, 2018. Evangelical women are shaping public attitudes about sex work. *The Conversation*.
- Delocalized prostitution: Occultation of the new modalities of violence. 2014. *Procedia, Social and Behavioral Sciences* 161 (12-19): 90
- Doezema, Jo. 2010. *Sex slaves and discourse masters: The construction of trafficking*. London, New York: Zed Books.
- Earthwatch Institute. History of earthwatch. in Earthwatch Institute, Inc. [database online]. 2017 Available from <http://earthwatch.org/About/History-of-Earthwatch>.
- End Slavery Now. Volunteer. in End Slavery Now and the National Underground Railroad Freedom Center [database online]. 2018 Available from <http://www.endslaverynow.org/act/volunteer?country=1405&state=1411&city=1412#filter>.

- Erikson, Emily, 2017. *Networks and Network Theory: Possible Directions for Unification*. From *Social Theory Now*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Ernewein, Charrita, and Rose Nieves. 2015. *Human sex trafficking: Recognition, treatment, and referral of Pediatric Victims*. Vol. 11 (accessed 4/15/2018 5:18:40 PM).
- FitzGerald, Sharron A. 2010. Biopolitics and the regulation of vulnerability: The case of the female trafficked migrant. *International Journal of Law in Context* 6 (3): 277-94 (accessed 2018/03/15; 3/14/2018 11:09:04 PM).
- Foot, Kirsten A. *Collaborating Against Human Trafficking: Cross-Sector Challenges and Practices*. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield, 2016.
- Foucault, Michel, and Robert Hurley. 1978. *The history of sexuality*. 1st Vintage books ed ed. New York: Vintage Books.
- Fuchs, Erin. March 12, 2014. Atlanta's Underground sex trade is booming. *Business Insider* March 12, 2014.
- Georgia Courts. 2015. *Victim services resource list*.
Georgia Criminal Code Title 16. Crimes and Offenses, § 16-6-9,
<https://prostitution.procon.org/view.background-resource.php?resourceID=000731#2>.
- Gozdziak, Elzbieta M., and Elizabeth A. Collett. 2005. Research on human trafficking in north america: A review of literature. *International Migration* 43 (1/2) (2005/March/1): 99-128.
- Graham, Ruth, Mar 2015, How Sex Trafficking Became a Christian Cause Celebre. *Slate*, Religion, Spirituality, and Sacrilege.

- Greenbaum, Jordan. 2016. *Identifying victims of human trafficking in the emergency department*. Child abuse and neglect. Vol. 17.
- Gutiérrez, Enrique Javier Díez. 2014. Prostitution and gender-based violence. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 161 (2014/December/19): 96-101.
- Guttentag, Daniel A. 2009. The possible negative impacts of volunteer tourism. *International Journal of Tourism Research* 11 (6) (03/26; 2018/04): 537-51, <https://doi.org/10.1002/jtr.727>
- Hall, Andrew. 2014. The uniform act on prevention of and remedies for human trafficking. *Arizona Law Review* 56 (3) (2014/September/1): 853-96.
- Hansen, Jane O. July 18, 2015. Selling atlanta's children: What has and hasn't changed. *CNN* July 18, 2015, sec Special to CNN, Freedom Project.
- Hawley, Josh. April 3, 2017. Slavery still exists in the land of the free - we must confront it. *CNN* April 3, 2017, sec Opinion.
- Head, Timothy. April 8, 2018. Christians must fight human trafficking. *FOX News* April 8, 2018, sec Sex Crimes.
- Hughes, Donna M., Katherine Y. Chon, and Derek P. Ellerman. 2015. Modern-day comfort women: The U.S. military, transnational crime, and the trafficking of women. In *International sex trafficking of women & children: Understanding the global epidemic.*, ed. Leonard Territo. 2nd ed.
- ILO & WFF. 2017. *Global estimates of modern slavery: Forced labor and forced marriage*. Geneva: International Labour Organization and Walk Free Foundation, 978-92-2-130131-8.

IOM Philippines. October 21, 2014. *Victim-centered counter-trafficking project is launched in tacloban city*. IOM Philippines and the US state department rejoin forces to combat human trafficking.

Johnson, Leslie, Jasmine Ko, Alexandra Reitz, Rebecca Lebeaux, Nayantara Venkataraman, Amy Webb Girard, and Deborah McFarland. 2016. *Gateway to the south: Tackling sex trafficking in atlanta*. Emory University, : The Emory Global Health Institute Case Writing Team, 2016 Emory Global Health Case Competition, .

Josepha Campinha-Bacote. 2002. The process of cultural competence in the delivery of healthcare services: A model of care. *J Transcult Nurs* 13 (3) (07/01; 2018/04): 181-4, <https://doi.org/10.1177/10459602013003003>.

LaPlante, Matthew, Feb 2017, In Utah, the fight against porn is increasingly being framed as a public health crisis, The Washington Post, National.

Lederer, Laura J. & Wetzel, Christopher A. Winter, 2014,. *Annals of Health Law: The Health Policy and Law Review of Loyola University Chicago School of Law* 23 (1).

Levy, Alexandra, Martina Vandenberg, and Chen, Lyric & Miller, Michelle. 2014. *When "mandatory" does not mean mandatory: Failure to obtain criminal restitution in federal prosecution of human trafficking cases in the united states*. Washington, DC: The Human Trafficking Pro Bono Legal Center, .

Liston-Heyes, Catherine, and Carol Daley. 2017. Voluntourism, sensemaking and the leisure-volunteer duality. *Tourist Studies* 17 (3) (2017/September/1): 283-305.

MacGregor, Casimir. 2015. The right to life: Human life, bio-power and the performativity of law. *Journal of Sociology* 51 (1) (2015/March/1): 47-62.

- McGehee, Nancy Gard, and Kathleen Andereck. 2009. Volunteer tourism and the “voluntoured”: The case of tijuana, mexico. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism* 17 (1) (01/23): 39-51, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09669580802159693>.
- McKeen, Amber. 2015. Exploring the realities of child sex trafficking in georgia. Paper presented at National Youth-At-Risk Conference, Savannah, Georgia.
- McLaughlin, Lisa. 1991. Discourses of prostitution / discourses of sexuality. *Critical Studies in Mass Communication* 8 (3) (1991/September/1): 249-72.
- McLennan, Sharon. 2014. Medical voluntourism in honduras: ‘Helping’ the poor? *Progress in Development Studies* 14 (2): 163-79.
- Meekins, John. September 14, 2016. Using intelligence techniques to identify human trafficking networks in prison. *In Public Safety* September 14, 2016, sec Corrections.
- National Fallen Firefighters Foundation. March, 2015. *Stress first aid for fire and EMS personnel*. National Fallen Firefighters Foundation, .
- National Human Trafficking Hotline. Georgia. in Polaris [database online]. 2018 Available from <https://humantraffickinghotline.org/state/georgia>.
- . Hotline statistics. 2017 Available from <https://humantraffickinghotline.org/states>.
- Neubauer, Chuck. April 25, 2011. Sex-trafficking survivors. *The Washington Times* April 25, 2011, sec News / National.
- Nordström, Ruth. Article in praise of the swedish model for combating trafficking. in Scandinavian Human Rights Lawyers [database online]. August 24, 2015 Available from

<http://humanrightslawyers.eu/article-in-praise-of-the-swedish-model-for-combating-trafficking/>.

Perfect victims and real survivors: The iconic victim in domestic human trafficking law.

2007. *Boston University Law Review* 87 (1) (2007/February/1): 157-211.

Peters, Amanda. 2016. Reconsidering federal and state obstacles to human trafficking victim status and entitlements. *Utah Law Review* 2016 (3) (2016/May/1): 535-74.

Powell, Clydette, Kirsten Dickins, and Hanni Stoklosa. 2017. Training US health care professionals on human trafficking: Where do we go from here? *Medical Education Online* 22 (2017/January/1): 0-11.

Richmond, John Cotton. 2015. Human trafficking: Understanding the law and deconstructing myths. *St.Louis University Law Journal* 60 (1) (2015/October/1): 1-41.

Saiz-Echezarreta, Vanesa, María-Cruz Alvarado, and Paulina Gómez-Lorenzini. 2018. Advocacy of trafficking campaigns: A controversy story. *Comunicar* 26 (55) (2018/April/1): 29-38.

Siller, Nicole. 2017. Human trafficking in international law before the palermo protocol. *Netherlands International Law Review* (Springer Science & Business Media B.V.) 64 (3) (2017/October/1): 407-52.

Sobel, Meghan R. 2014. Chronicling a crisis: Media framing of human trafficking in india, thailand, and the USA. *Asian Journal of Communication* 24 (4) (2014/July/1): 315-32.

Soderlund, Gretchen. 2005. Running from the rescuers: New U.S. crusades against sex trafficking and the rhetoric of abolition. *NWSA Journal* 17 (3): 64-87,
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/4317158>.

Stokes, Stephannie. May 4, 2017. Atlanta airport boosts efforts to stop human trafficking.

NPR WABE Atlanta May 4, 2017, sec Local.

Stoklosa, Hanni, Elizabeth Showalter, Anna Melnick, and Emily F. Rothman. 2017. Health care providers' experience with a protocol for the identification, treatment, and referral of human-trafficking victims. *Journal of Human Trafficking* 3 (3) (07/03): 182-92,

<https://doi.org/10.1080/23322705.2016.1194668>.

Thrupkaew, Noy. 2012. A misguided moral crusade. *The New York Times* 2012, sec Opinion.

<http://www.nytimes.com/2012/09/23/opinion/sunday/ending-demand-wont-stop-prostitution.html>.

Todres, Jonathan. 2016. Can mandatory reporting laws help child survivors of human trafficking? *Wisconsin Law Review* 2016 (6) (2016/November/1): 69-78.

Trump, Donald J. December 29, 2017. *President donald J. trump proclaims january 2018 as national slavery and human trafficking prevention month*. The White House, Law & Justice, .

UN.GIFT. 2008. *012 workshop: The role of the media in building images*. United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking, 012.

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. 2004. *United nations convention against transnational organized crime and the protocols thereto*. New York: United Nations, .

UNODC. Human trafficking. in United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime [database online]. 2018 Available from

<https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/what-is-human-trafficking.html>.

- Vance, Carole S. 2011. States of contradiction: Twelve ways to do nothing about trafficking while pretending to. *Social Research* 78 (3) (2011/September/1): 933-48.
- Vandenberg, Martina E. 2015. Innovations in the fight against human trafficking: Listening to trafficking survivors, fighting for justice. *New York Law School Law Review* 60 (3/4) (2015/July/1): 631-47.
- Violence Prevention Alliance. The public health approach. in World Health Organization, Global Campaign for Violence Prevention, [database online]. 2018 Available from http://www.who.int/violenceprevention/approach/public_health/en/.
- Walker-Rodriguez, Amanda, and Rodney Hill. 2011. Human sex trafficking. *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin*.
- Weitzer, Ronald John. 2012. *Legalizing prostitution: From illicit vice to lawful business*. New York: New York University Press.
- White House. Human trafficking - A new form of slavery. in The White House President George W. Bush [database online]. 2004 Available from <https://georgewbush-whitehouse.archives.gov/infocus/traffic/>.
- Zatz, Noah D. Winter, 1997. Sex Work/Sex act: Law, labor, and desire in constructions of prostitution. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 22 (2): 277-306.

APPENDIX A: TRAFFICKING AND SMUGGLING

While still within the subject of definitions, there are also several important distinctions which need to be made. The Palermo Protocols passed by the UN Convention on Transnational Organized Crime distinguish between human trafficking and smuggling, which are generally defined based on the understanding of consent and agreement between the smuggler and customer in contrast to the involuntary nature of trafficking (UNDOC 2004, 53). Also frequently confused is the more specific migrant smuggling, defined as “*the procurement, in order to obtain, directly or indirectly, a financial or other material benefit, of the illegal entry of a person into a State Party of which the person is not a national or a permanent resident*” (Article 3, Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, 2000). Although there are overlaps between many of these definitions in practice, it is important to note also that there are distinctions between the broader “*victims of trafficking in persons*”, “*victims of forced labour*”, and “*victims of slavery*”, with each of these terms describing a particular (though not necessarily exclusive) subset of trafficking (UNODC 2016, 15). At times, the overlap in these definitions which presents difficulties in determining the best course of action or prosecution for law enforcement officials and aid providers. Whether or not the current legal framework in this regard is adequate merits further discussion, albeit not within this paper.

APPENDIX B: DEBATES REGARDING PROSTITUTION

Definitions of prostitution within the literature vary depending on the perspective; one article on the theoretical constructions of prostitution uses the definition of “*attending to the sexual desires of a particular individual (or individuals) with bodily acts in exchange for payment of money.*” This article notes, however, that this brings to light a number of questions

regarding who the actors are, the importance of money as opposed to power and sexual subordination, and variation in motivation (Zatz 1999, 279). The legal definition of prostitution varies from state to state, though it is illegal in all but eleven districts of Nevada. Looking within the state of Georgia since the case study utilized in this capstone focuses on the Atlanta region, someone commits prostitution when "*he or she performs or offers or consents to perform a sexual act, including but not limited to sexual intercourse or sodomy, for money or other items of value*" (G.C. § 16-6-9). The same Georgia statute also addresses the offenses of pimping, pandering, and solicitation, all of which along with prostitution constitute misdemeanors of a high and aggravated nature; although if a minor is involved in a solicitation charge, the accused will instead be charged with a felony and sentenced to a minimum 5 maximum 20 years in prison if convicted, as well as a minimum \$2,500 maximum \$10,000 fine (G.C. § 16-6-9-13).

In relation to the discussion of prostitution vs. trafficking, often brought up is the “Swedish approach” which focuses on curtailing demand as opposed to punishing those providing sexual services. Sweden became the first country to criminalize the purchase of sex while the selling of sex remained legal with its 1999 Swedish Sex Purchase Act. This was billed as an effort to refocus the issue of both prostitution and sex trafficking so that attention shift from supply side to the demand side (Nordström 2015, 1). The effectiveness of this approach has been widely contested. A number of studies indicate that while there might have been an initial decrease in trafficking cases, the overall effect has been negated by subsequent increases or estimation difficulties as more and more of the industry is pushed underground (Nordström 2015, 1). There is material enough here for another capstone entirely. Complicating this are issues of identification for providers in determining whether a patient is engaging in consensual

prostitution as opposed to being nonconsensually trafficked and how/if this should affect protocol development. This is an important part of protocol development, but not one which I will be able to give a final judgment on.

APPENDIX C: THE IMAGE OF THE PROSTITUTE

Brunschot et. al argue that the image of the prostitute has an interesting "extended temporal characteristic" wherein the single act of prostitution is not at issue, but rather the prolonged and continued existence of the institution of prostitution over time (Brunschot et al. 2007, 149). The importance of terminology such as the distinction between "victim" and "prostitute" is increasingly being recognized, particularly within the context of child sexual trafficking, where a key focus to avoid stigma is defining what has happened to the child victim rather than labeling their identity (McKeen 2015, 8).

There is significant debate within feminist literature on the effectiveness of various forms of feminism in combatting certain representations of women and their sexuality within the media (McLaughlin 1991, 249). In addition to stereotypes surrounding the human trafficking victim, there are also two primary stereotypes of the prostitute which also play into the picture: the 'whore with the heart of gold', which is contrasted with the 'depraved, dissolute, and deviant' counterpart (Brunschot et al. 2000, 48). These are at times conflated with and at times contrasted with the prototypical trafficking victim, often with agency or willpower being the primary distinction. The negative image of the prostitute is used as a template for all manner of negative presumptions about the urban woman and modernity, with deviant typifications and associations such as poverty and drug addiction often included (Brunschot et al. 2000, 49).

On both an international and domestic scale, there is a divergence of discourses surrounding prostitution and feminist theory, some "*that give priority to the women as subjects of right in equality, opposite to which they legitimize their exploitation for serving men*"; this discursive split can be described as being between "*those who claim the delegitimization of the patriarchy or feminists discourses*" and those "*who defend the perpetuation of the patriarchal order for the sake of other values,*" (Alvarez & Garcia 2014, 83).

APPENDIX D: VOLUNTOURISM, DEFINITION AND HISTORY

Volunteerism is a relatively recently coined term, developed as the commodification of tourism has increased within a context of problematic and arguably “imperialist” practices (Wearing 2001, 96). The term “voluntourism” is generally understood to originate with a 1998 "Voluntourism Award" created by the governor of Nevada in order to recognize Nevada residents "who volunteered to make their state a place to visit and enjoy" (CN&CS 2008, 1). Although the term was formally coined in the 1990s, the concept has its origins in the 1961 creation of the Peace Corp, service learning programs in the 1960's, and the increasing popularity of study-abroad and ecotourism programs throughout the 1970's and 1980's (CN&CS 2008, 1). The voluntourism movement can also be traced in the history of groups such as Earthwatch, founded in 1971 with a mission of "engaging people worldwide in scientific field research and education to promote the understanding and action necessary for a sustainable environment" (Earthwatch Institute 2017, 1). Earthwatch and programs like it expanded in popularity particularly in the 1990s, with Earthwatch Europe recruiting 27 corporations into its Corporate Environmental Responsibility Group in 1994, expanding its initiatives globally (Earthwatch Institute 2017, 1).

Similarly, within the spectrum of tourism experiences are a number of modalities which can be used to better elucidate the tourism experience; "the relational elements of ecotourism, volunteerism and serious leisure, as definitional components of a specific alternative tourism experience, exist as modalities of tourism experience along many divergent and convergent points of this spectrum" (Wearing 2001, 29). The development of Corporate Social Responsibility practices, particularly following the 1950s, can also be seen as a precursor to the broader voluntourism trend (Carroll 2008, 20). the-inkline.com exponential growth of CSR in practice in the 1960s helped to solidify the importance of voluntary aid to others via both philanthropy and action in the public sphere, with the 1970s publication of Morrell Heald's book *The Social Responsibilities of Business: Company and Community 1900-1960* helping to solidify the concept of CSR and spur further action (Carroll 2008, 27). The 1990s and the 2000s, CSR became a generalizable model for broader themes of civic engagement which focused on benefits and requirements of the individuals giving aid as well as the aid provided, with organizations like the 1992 nonprofit Business for Social Responsibility (BSR) formed in order to achieve "viable, sustainable growth that benefits stakeholders as well as stockholders" (Carroll 2008, 38). This mutuality in benefits from service has nearly an unspoken expectation of the modern volunteer's ethos.